




Comparison of Effect of Pilates Exercise and Vitex Agnus Intake on Premenstrual Syndrome in Sedentary Girls

Zeinab Samadi^{1*} 

¹ Assistant professor, Department of Physical Education, Farhangian University, Tehran, Iran

* Corresponding author email address: z.samadi@cfu.ac.ir

E d i t o r	R e v i e w e r s
Seyyed Mohsen Asgharinekah  Associate Professor, Department of Counseling and Educational Psychology, Faculty of Education and Psychology, Ferdowsi University of Mashhad, Mashhad, Iran asghari-n@um.ac.ir	Reviewer 1: Zahra Yousefi  Assistant Professor, Department of Psychology, Khorasgan Branch, Islamic Azad University, Isfahan, Iran. Email: yousefi1393@khuif.ac.ir Reviewer 2: Mehdi Rostami  Department of Psychology and Counseling, KMAN Research Institute, Richmond Hill, Ontario, Canada. Email: dr.mrostami@kmanresce.ca

1. Round 1

1.1 Reviewer 1

Reviewer:

The final paragraph of the Introduction states the aim but does not explain why sedentary girls were selected. Clarifying the rationale—biological, psychological, or methodological—would strengthen the methodological justification.

In Materials and Methods, the line “60 cases were simple randomly divided in three groups” is insufficient. The authors should describe how randomization occurred (e.g., random number generator, sealed envelopes) to ensure methodological transparency.

The statistical methods section does not specify whether normality, sphericity, or homogeneity of variances was examined. These checks are essential for the validity of repeated-measures ANOVA and must be reported.

Only p-values are reported throughout the Results section. For scientific interpretation, effect sizes (e.g., partial eta-squared, Cohen’s d) should be included, especially in a study comparing multiple interventions.

The Results sentence describing “overall 38%, 24% percent of PMS...” lacks clarity on how percentages were computed. The authors should provide the formula or specify whether these are relative percentage changes, absolute changes, or mean differences divided by baseline.

The paragraph beginning “In this study, the positive impact of 2 months of Pilates exercise...” summarizes other studies but does not explain how the current findings integrate with theoretical models (e.g., hormonal modulation, mind-body mechanisms). A stronger analytical connection is needed.

Authors revised the manuscript and uploaded the updated document.

1.2 Reviewer 2

Reviewer:

In the paragraph describing causes, the manuscript states “vitamin and mineral deficiencies... have been mentioned as risk factors” without differentiating between hypothesized and empirically established mechanisms. Precise language is needed to avoid overstating causality.

The manuscript contains unprocessed placeholders such as “ADDIN EN.CITE [7-9]”. These must be replaced with properly integrated citations, and all reference formatting should be standardized before publication.

The long sentence beginning “Individuals entering the selection criteria were aged between 18-25 years old...” is difficult to follow due to embedded parentheses and several conditions combined into one line. This should be broken into shorter, clearer criteria.

The manuscript states “Number of sets started from 10 and reached to 90–80 in the final sessions.” This is ambiguous—does it refer to repetitions, sets, or minutes? The progression must be described precisely to allow replication.

There is no description of how training session attendance or Vitex intake compliance was monitored. The paragraph describing the 8-week protocol should specify compliance thresholds, missed-session policies, and whether attrition occurred.

The sentence “Vitex agnus group were used a pill after food for 2 months.” does not indicate pill strength, formulation, or brand. Without dosage information, the intervention cannot be reproduced scientifically.

Authors revised the manuscript and uploaded the updated document.

2. Revised

Editor’s decision after revisions: Accepted.

Editor in Chief’s decision: Accepted.