



Modeling Structural Relationships Between Dimensions of Personal, Social, and National Identity Among Students at Islamic Azad University, Hamedan

Pegah Ahmadi¹, Fariba Monazami Tabar^{2*}

¹ Master's Student, Department of Psychology, Hamedan Branch, Islamic Azad University, Hamedan, Iran

² Assistant Professor, Department of Psychology, Hamedan Branch, Islamic Azad University, Hamedan, Iran

* Corresponding author email address: f.monazami@iauh.ac.ir

E d i t o r	R e v i e w e r s
Gholamreza Zourmand  Department of Physical Education and Sport Science, Huanggang Normal University, Huanggang, China gh.zourmand@hgnu.edu.cn	Reviewer 1: Yaghub Badriazarin  Associate Professor of Sport Sciences, Tabriz University, Tabriz, Iran. Email: badriazarin@tbzmed.ac.ir Reviewer 2: Zahra Naghsh  Associate Professor, Department of Psychology, University of Tehran, Tehran, Iran. Email: z.naghsh@ut.ac.ir

1. Round 1

1.1 Reviewer 1

Date: 04 March 2025

Reviewer:

Please clarify which work by Giddens is referenced here. A full bibliographic citation is essential, especially for such a pivotal conceptual contribution to identity theory.

Consider providing concrete statistical or demographic data to support the assertion about ethnic diversity and disparities in Iran. This would strengthen the argument and contextualize the need for the study.

This concept requires a more thorough explanation. What are the main components of the "identity thesis"? How does it operationalize social cohesion through shared identity?

Please describe how randomization was implemented in practice (e.g., using a random number generator or software?). Detail on the procedural execution would improve reproducibility.

The corresponding entry in Table 1 shows 4.77 for achieved identity. Please correct this discrepancy between text and table.

The RMSEA of 0.072 is borderline acceptable. According to Hu & Bentler (1999), values above 0.06 can be considered less ideal. Please comment on this in the discussion.

Please specify what these ten components are. They are mentioned in summary but not listed or described in sufficient detail.

Clarify whether this total effect was statistically tested (e.g., using Sobel test or bootstrapping). Including this strengthens the mediation claim.

Although this is within acceptable limits, discuss whether any model modifications (e.g., correlated errors) were used to improve fit indices.

Authors revised the manuscript and uploaded the updated document.

1.2 Reviewer 2

Date: 06 March 2025

Reviewer:

While these references are useful, the review lacks critical engagement. What limitations or gaps do these prior studies present, and how does the current study address them?

Please provide a reference for the Morgan table or include it in an appendix. Additionally, clarify the assumed confidence level and margin of error used in calculating the sample size.

It would strengthen the paper to report the Cronbach's alpha values for the subscales based on the current dataset, rather than solely citing previous studies.

This is a very large number of items. Please explain how participant fatigue or response bias was mitigated during administration.

This item seems ideologically charged. Please justify its inclusion or revise to reflect a more neutral tone, especially for international readership.

This paragraph is too confirmatory. A stronger discussion would include alternative explanations or contradictory evidence from the literature.

Consider referencing more recent empirical studies that operationalize Erikson's theory within university populations to support this claim.

Authors revised the manuscript and uploaded the updated document.

2. Revised

Editor's decision after revisions: Accepted.

Editor in Chief's decision: Accepted.