International Journal of Sport Studies for Health

Journal Homepage



Comparison of the Effects of Rapid, Moderate, and Slow Weight Loss Combined with a Low-Calorie Diet and Physical Activity on Inflammatory Factors in Obese Women

Fatemeh. Doroodian 6, Nicola. Luigi Bragazzi 6

* Corresponding author email address: robertobragazzi@gmail.com

Editor	Reviewers
Hadi Nobari Professor, Transilvania University of Braşov, Brasov, Romania. petrojonck@hotmail.com	Reviewer 1: Seyed Mohammad Hosseini Assistant Professor, Department of Health and Rehabilitation in Sports, Shahid Beheshti University, Tehran, Iran. Email: moh_hosseini@sbu.ac.ir Reviewer 2: Zahra Yousefi Assistant Professor, Department of Psychology, Khorasgan Branch, Islamic Azad University, Isfahan, Iran. Email: yousefi1393@khuisf.ac.ir

1. Round 1

1.1 Reviewer 1

Reviewer:

The sentence "Individuals with obesity often experience weight stigma..." introduces an important psychosocial angle but is not addressed later in the paper. Either elaborate on this dimension in the discussion or remove to maintain focus.

The prevalence data cited from Global Obesity Atlas 2022 (e.g., "1 in 5 women...") is impactful. However, include the reference number to improve transparency and traceability.

The rapid vs. moderate group comparison shows a 29.77% reduction, which seems clinically relevant. Consider discussing whether the lack of statistical significance might be due to sample size or variability.

The first paragraph repeats much of the results section verbatim. Instead, use the discussion to interpret the results in the context of existing literature.

The repetition of similar references (e.g., McLaughlin et al., Selvin et al.) weakens the impact. Consider synthesizing these findings to avoid redundancy and emphasize novel contributions of your study.

¹ Department of Sport Science, Imam Khomeini International University, Qazvin, Iran

² Department of Health Sciences, Postgraduate School of Public Health, University of Genoa, Genoa, Italy



Author revised the manuscript and uploaded the updated document.

1.2 Reviewer 2

Reviewer:

The long sentence beginning with "It is estimated that certain diseases..." is dense and mixes too many conditions. Consider splitting it for clarity and aligning it more closely with the study's specific focus on inflammatory responses.

The phrase "strenuous exercises...may have harmful physiological effects" needs clarification. What specific risks are associated with rapid weight loss? Include citations to substantiate this claim.

In Table 1, the † symbol is used but not clearly defined. Ensure all table symbols are explained in the footnotes for reader comprehension.

The comparison focuses on differences in type of training but does not fully explain why combined training (aerobic + resistance) would outperform circuit resistance training. Include more discussion on mechanistic pathways.

In the discussion of conflicting findings with Justice (2011), the phrase "potentially due to differences in intervention intensity, duration, or baseline fitness levels" is vague. Specify what was different about this study's protocol to clarify the contrast.

Author revised the manuscript and uploaded the updated document.

2. Revised

Editor's decision after revisions: Accepted. Editor in Chief's decision: Accepted.

