




## Comparison of the Effectiveness of Unified Transdiagnostic Treatment and Compassion-Based Approach on Suicidal Ideation and Spiritual Well-Being in Women Victims of Domestic Violence

Mahboobe. Hossein Alizadeh<sup>1</sup>, Mohammad. Ghamari<sup>2\*</sup>, Marzieh. GholamiTooranposhti<sup>3</sup>


<sup>1</sup> PhD Student, Counseling Department, Science and Research Branch, Islamic Azad University, Tehran, Iran

<sup>2</sup> Professor, Counseling Department, Science and Research Branch, Islamic Azad University, Tehran, Iran



<sup>3</sup> Assistant Professor, Department of Psychology, Shahr Babak Branch, Islamic Azad University, Shahr Babak, Iran

\* Corresponding author email address: counselor\_ghamari@yahoo.com

### Editor

Shahram Vahedi<sup>1</sup>  
Professor, Department of  
Educational Psychology, Faculty of  
Educational Sciences and  
Psychology, Tabriz University,  
Tabriz, Iran  
vahedi117@yahoo.com

### Reviewers

**Reviewer 1:** Mohammad Hassan Ghanifar<sup>1</sup>  
Assistant Professor, Department of Psychology, Birjand Branch, Islamic Azad  
University, Birjand, Iran. Email: ghanifar@iaubir.ac.ir  
**Reviewer 2:** Abotaleb Saadati Shamir<sup>1</sup>  
Assistant Professor, Department of Educational Sciences, University of Science and  
Research, Tehran, Iran. Email: psychology@iau.ac.ir

### 1. Round 1

#### 1.1. Reviewer 1

Reviewer:

The introductory paragraph could benefit from clearer articulation of the study's specific scope. While global and national statistics are essential, a more concise summary followed by an explicit transition to suicidal ideation and spiritual well-being would improve the narrative flow.

While percentages are valuable, it would strengthen the academic rigor to reference specific study titles or years directly next to such statistics for reader validation.

The psychometric properties are well-discussed. Please elaborate on how cultural and linguistic adaptation was conducted in the Persian version—was back-translation used?

Pre-test assessments should logically occur before any psychoeducation begins. Please confirm whether the assessment occurred prior to content delivery and rephrase for clarity.

This interpretation should be quantified (e.g., “less than 1-point change on average”) and statistically substantiated, rather than left as a subjective phrase.

ANCOVA assumes homogeneity of regression slopes. Please clarify whether this assumption was tested and satisfied before proceeding with ANCOVA.

Response: Revised and uploaded the manuscript.

## 1.2. Reviewer 2

Reviewer:

The novelty of the study is well-stated. However, to strengthen the rationale, please cite at least two Iranian studies that used only one of these therapies, to clearly demonstrate the lack of comparative research.

Consider adding a flow diagram of participant recruitment and attrition, in line with CONSORT guidelines, to enhance transparency.

There is an imbalance in the duration and number of sessions between the two therapies (8 sessions for CFT vs. 10 for UTT). Please explain how this was statistically or methodologically accounted for.

While the assumption of normality is addressed, please include a sentence about testing sphericity and how violations (if any) were managed (e.g., Greenhouse-Geisser correction).

You've reported "Eta Squared," but it appears to be partial eta squared ( $\eta^2_p$ ). Please confirm and label accordingly to align with APA guidelines.

The term "stronger effect" could be quantified. Include effect size metrics (e.g., Cohen's  $d$ ) for each between-group comparison.

Several sentences restate that the Unified Transdiagnostic Treatment helps "process emotions." Consider condensing overlapping explanations to sharpen the argument and reduce repetition.

Response: Revised and uploaded the manuscript.

## 2. Revised

Editor's decision after revisions: Accepted.

Editor in Chief's decision: Accepted.