

Article history: Received 14 February 2024 Revised 03 March 2024 Accepted 15 March 2024 Published online 01 April 2024

Applied Family Therapy Journal

OPEN PEER-REVIEW REPORT



Comparison of the Effectiveness of Mindfulness-Based Stress Reduction Group Exercises with Emotion-Focused Group Therapy on Authentic Happiness in Critically III Inpatients and Recovered COVID-19 Patients

Samaneh. Hatami¹⁽ⁱ⁾, Masoud. Khakpour^{2*}⁽ⁱ⁾, Mohamadreza. Saffarian³⁽ⁱ⁾

¹ PhD student, Department of Educational Sciences, Mashhad Branch, Islamic Azad University, Mashhad, Iran
² Assistant Professor, Department of counselling and psychology, Quchan Branch, Islamic Azad University, Quchan, Iran
³ Assistant Professor, Department of Educational Science, Mashhad Branch, Islamic Azad University, Mashhad, Iran

* Corresponding author email address: M.khakpour54@gmail.com

Editor	R e v i e w e r s
Azizuddin Khan [®] Professor, Psychophysiology Laboratory, Department of Humanities and Social Sciences Indian Institute of Technology Bombay, Maharashtra, India aziz@hss.iitb.ac.in	Reviewer 1: Mohammad Reza Khodabakhsh [®] Department of Psychology, Neyshabour Branch, Islamic Azad University, Neyshabour, Iran. Email: hodabakhsh@ut.ac.ir Reviewer 2: Mohammad Masoud Dayarian [®] Assistant Professor, Department of Counseling, Khomeinishahr Branch, Islamic Azad University.Komeinishar/Isfehan,Iran. dayariyan@iaukhsh.ac.ir

1. Round 1

1.1. Reviewer 1

Reviewer:

Consider refining the abstract to include specific statistical results (e.g., mean differences, effect sizes) to provide a clearer snapshot of the study's findings at a glance.

The introduction could benefit from a more detailed exploration of previous findings comparing Mindfulness-Based Stress Reduction (MBSR) and Emotion-Focused Group Therapy (EFGT), particularly regarding their efficacy in clinical settings other than COVID-19.

Clarify why convenience sampling was chosen over other sampling methods, and discuss any limitations this choice imposes on the generalizability of the study findings.

Expand on the role and selection of the control group within the study. A more detailed justification for the absence of any intervention in the control group could help strengthen the experimental design section.

Provide a rationale for choosing mixed ANOVA and mention any other statistical tests considered or why they were deemed inappropriate for this analysis to enhance the methodological rigor of your paper.

Ensure that all figures and tables are clearly labeled and referenced in the text. Consider improving the graphical representation of data to enhance readability and impact, particularly for the longitudinal data collected at three time points.

Elaborate on the implications of not finding significant differences between the two therapeutic approaches. Discuss potential reasons and the clinical relevance of these findings in the broader context of therapeutic interventions for happiness.

Response: Revised and uploaded the manuscript.

1.2. Reviewer 2

Reviewer:

Add a brief discussion on the theoretical frameworks underlying both MBSR and EFGT to give readers a better understanding of why these particular therapies were chosen for comparison.

Provide more details about the validation process of the Authentic Happiness Inventory in the context of your study's demographic. This could include any adaptations made for cultural relevance or specific illness-related factors.

While ethical considerations were briefly mentioned, expanding on how participants' confidentiality was protected during and after the study could enhance the ethical transparency of your research.

Include a power analysis to justify the sample size. This would strengthen the argument that the study is adequately powered to detect a difference between treatment effects, if one exists.

Enhance the limitations section by discussing specific methodological constraints, such as the effects of the hospital setting on the intervention's outcomes and the potential for therapist variability.

Propose specific future research questions or methodologies that could address unanswered questions from your study, enhancing the relevance and applicative value of your research.

Sharpen the conclusions to reflect how these findings can be applied in practice or in further research. Include any recommendations for practitioners or policymakers on the use of MBSR and EFGT for similar patient populations.

Response: Revised and uploaded the manuscript.

2. Revised

Editor's decision after revisions: Accepted. Editor in Chief's decision: Accepted.

