

Comparing the Effectiveness of Music Therapy, Dance Movement, and Art Therapy on the Mistrust/Mistreatment Schema in Women with Symptoms of Depression Aged 20-30

Zohreh. Arabzadeh¹, Ali Naghi. Aghdasi^{2*}, Hossein. Rostami², Ahad. Ahangar^{3,4}

¹ PhD student, Department of Psychology and Counseling, Tabriz Branch, Islamic Azad University, Tabriz, Iran

² Assistant Professor, Department of Psychology and Counseling, Tabriz Branch, Islamic Azad University, Tabriz, Iran

³ Research Center for Cognitive & Behavioral Sciences in Police, Directorate of Health, Rescue & Treatment, Police Headquarter, Tehran, Iran



⁴ Assistant Professor, Department of Educational Sciences and Psychology, Faculty of Literature and Human Sciences, Shabestar Branch, Islamic Azad University, Shabestar, Iran

* Corresponding author email address: Aghdasi@iaut.ac.ir

Editor

Gholamreza Rajabi
Family Department, Governors
State University, University Park,
Illinois, USA
rajabireza@scu.ac.ir

Reviewers

Reviewer 1: Ali Khodaei
Department of Psychology, Faculty of Educational Sciences and Psychology, Payam
Noor University, Tehran, Iran. Email: alikhodaei@pnu.ac.ir
Reviewer 2: Hajar Torkan
Assistant Professor, Department of Psychology, Islamic Azad University, Isfahan
Branch (Khorasgan), Isfahan, Iran. h.torkan@khuisf.ac.ir

1. Round 1

1.1. Reviewer 1

Reviewer:

Expand the literature review to include more recent studies that have evaluated the effectiveness of art therapies on schemas similar to mistrust/mistreatment. This will provide a stronger theoretical framework and relevance to current research trends.

Clearly delineate the criteria for selecting participants from counseling centers. This detail is essential for replicability and understanding the context of the sample's representativeness.

Provide a stronger rationale for the use of a control group that received no intervention. Discuss potential ethical considerations and how they were addressed, considering the vulnerability of the depressed population.

The description of the statistical methods used is vague. Elaborate on why specific tests were chosen and include any assumptions checked prior to performing these tests to validate the analysis method.

Discuss the implications of finding no significant differences among the therapeutic approaches. Consider exploring whether a lack of power (due to sample size) could be a reason for non-significant results.

The discussion could be enriched by contrasting the clinical significance versus the statistical significance of the findings, offering insights into practical implications for therapeutic practice.

Response: Revised and uploaded the manuscript.

1.2. Reviewer 2

Reviewer:

Provide a power analysis to justify the sample size. This is critical to understand if the study was adequately powered to detect a difference between groups, if any exists.

Offer more detailed descriptions of the intervention protocols for music, dance, and art therapy. Include session durations, specific activities, and therapeutic goals for each session to enhance reproducibility.

While the Young Schema Questionnaire (YSQ) is mentioned, discussing the reliability and validity of this tool within the Iranian context would strengthen the methodological robustness.

More detailed discussion on ethical safeguards implemented during the study, especially considering the psychological vulnerability of the participants, would enhance the credibility of the research.

Explain the data handling procedures, including any missing data, outliers, or data imputation strategies used, which are essential for validating the research findings.

Expand on the inter-group statistical comparisons by including effect sizes, which would help in understanding the practical significance of the findings, not just the statistical significance.

Response: Revised and uploaded the manuscript.

2. Revised

Editor's decision after revisions: Accepted.

Editor in Chief's decision: Accepted.