

Article history: Received 12 March 2024 Revised 29 April 2024 Accepted 15 May 2024 Published online 01 July 2024

Applied Family Therapy Journal

OPEN PEER-REVIEW REPORT



E-ISSN: 3041-8798

Comparing the Effectiveness of Cognitive-Behavioral Play Therapy and Resilience-Based Play Therapy on Anxiety, Executive Functioning Behaviors, and Emotional Expression in 6 to 8-Year-Old Children Undergoing Dental Treatment

Seyed Hasan. Hosseini Dastjerdi¹, Amir. Panah Ali², Masoumeh. Azmoudeh³, Elaheh. Molavi⁴

PhD student in Counseling, Department of Counseling, Tabriz Branch, Islamic Azad University, Tabriz, Iran
Assistant Professor, Department of Psychology and Counseling, Tabriz Branch, Islamic Azad University, Tabriz, Iran
Assistant Professor, Department of Psychology, Tabriz Branch, Islamic Azad University, Tabriz, Iran
Assistant Professor, Department of Children and Adolescent Dentistry, Tabriz University of Medical Sciences, Tabriz, Iran

* Corresponding author email address: panahali@iaut.ac.ir

| Editor | Reviewers |
|-------------------------------------|---|
| Shahram Vahedi | Reviewer 1: Taher Tizdast [®] |
| Professor, Department of | Assistant Professor, Department of Psychology, Tonekabon Branch, Islamic Azad |
| Educational Psychology, Faculty of | University, Tonekabon, Iran. Email: taher.tizdast@toniau.ac.ir |
| Educational Sciences and | Reviewer 2: Fahime Bahonar |
| Psychology, Tabriz University, | Department of counseling, Universty of Isfahan, Isfahan, Iran. |
| Tabriz, Iran vahedi117@yahoo.com | Email: Fahime.bahonar@edu.ui.ac.ir |

1. Round 1

1.1. Reviewer 1

Reviewer:

Expand on the literature review to establish a stronger rationale for the study. More recent studies (post-2020) should be included to underscore the timeliness and relevance of the research.

The research questions could be stated more concisely in the introduction to guide the reader through what the study intends to address explicitly.

Clarify the rationale for choosing purposive sampling and its suitability for this study's goals. Discuss any biases this method might introduce.

Elaborate on the selection and handling of the control group. Discuss how equivalence was ensured at baseline between the control and intervention groups.



Strengthen the conclusion to reflect on the study's implications more decisively and suggest clear next steps or practical applications based on the findings.

Response: Revised and uploaded the manuscript.

1.2. Reviewer 2

Reviewer:

Both interventions are well-detailed, but ensure that each session's specific activities align clearly with the stated therapeutic goals. This will help in replicability.

For each psychological measure used, ensure there is a justification for its selection, particularly how each measure's validity and reliability are established in the context of your sample demographic.

The use of mixed ANOVA is appropriate; however, discuss any assumptions checked, any violations, and how they were addressed in the analysis.

Ensure that results are presented clearly with appropriate statistical details. Tables should be concise and focus on the most relevant data.

The discussion should more robustly connect your findings to existing literature, discussing both consistencies and discrepancies. This strengthens the study's positioning within the field.

Highlight how your findings advance theoretical knowledge about play therapy's effects on anxiety and executive functioning.

Update and check all citations and references for accuracy and adherence to the journal's style. Ensure all references are current and relevant.

Conduct a thorough proofreading to correct any grammatical errors and improve sentence structure for better readability.

Response: Revised and uploaded the manuscript.

2. Revised

Editor's decision after revisions: Accepted.

Editor in Chief's decision: Accepted.