

Article history: Received 13 April 2024 Revised 20 May 2024 Accepted 03 June 2024 Published online 01 July 2024

Applied Family Therapy Journal

OPEN PEER-REVIEW REPORT



E-ISSN: 3041-8798

The Effectiveness of Positive Therapy on Fear of Intimacy and Suicidal Thoughts in Girls Experiencing Romantic Relationship Dissolution

Sepideh. Dehghan 6, Roghayegh. Shabani Minaroodi 6, Sajjad. Eslami *6

¹ B.Sc. in Psychology, Department of Psychology, Sari Branch, Islamic Azad University, Sari, Iran
² B.Sc. in Elementary Education, Department of Educational Sciences, Qaemshahr Branch, Islamic Azad University, Qaemshahr, Iran
³ M.A., Department of Psychology, Sari Branch, Islamic Azad University, Sari, Iran

* Corresponding author email address: sajjad_eslami3@yahoo.com

Editor	Reviewers
Shahram Vahedi	Reviewer 1: Shahrokh Makvand Hoseini ©
Professor, Department of	Associate Professor, Department of Psychology, Semnan University, Iran.
Educational Psychology, Faculty of	Email: shmakvand@semnan.ac.ir
Educational Sciences and	Reviewer 2: Davood Taghvaei 6
Psychology, Tabriz University,	Department of Psychology, Arak Branch, Islamic Azad University, Arak, Iran.
Tabriz, Iran	
vahedi117@yahoo.com	Email: d-taghvaeii@iau-arak.ac.ir

1. Round 1

1.1. Reviewer 1

Reviewer:

"The abstract needs more specific details on the statistical methods used. For instance, clarify how repeated measures ANOVA was employed and what assumptions were tested before applying this method."

"In the description of the impact of romantic relationship dissolution, the authors should consider including additional recent studies that explore the effects on physical health, as this is closely related to mental health."

"The explanation of 'fear of intimacy' would be enhanced by including a more detailed discussion of the theoretical framework or model used to conceptualize this fear, possibly expanding on Lloyd's (2011) foundational work."

"The descriptions of the therapy sessions are comprehensive, but adding specific examples of exercises or activities used in each session could provide more clarity and practical insight."

"Include a more detailed rationale for choosing repeated measures ANOVA over other potential statistical methods. Were any alternatives considered and why were they not chosen?"

"The presentation of mean and standard deviation values is clear, but it would be beneficial to include effect sizes to give readers a sense of the practical significance of the findings."



"In the description of the ANOVA results, explain why the Greenhouse-Geisser correction was necessary and how it affected the interpretation of the results."

"The Bonferroni post-hoc test results are significant, but the discussion should include a justification for using Bonferroni over other post-hoc tests and address the potential for Type I error."

Response: Revised and uploaded the manuscript.

1.2. Reviewer 2

Reviewer:

"The statement 'Romantic relationships are critical because research shows they impact a wide range of personality outcomes and mental health (Still 2021)' would benefit from more specific examples of the 'wide range of personality outcomes' and specific mental health metrics."

"The criteria for selecting the 30 girls out of the 401 individuals should be more clearly defined. Detail the inclusion and exclusion criteria beyond 'scores below the average on the Ross Questionnaire'."

"Provide a more detailed description of the ethical approval process and mention the specific ethics committee that approved the study."

"The reliability and validity statistics for the Fear of Intimacy Scale are crucial. Consider providing more recent validity studies or confirming if the instrument has been validated in similar populations."

"For the Suicide Ideation Questionnaire, include information on whether cultural adaptations were made, considering the study was conducted in Iran and the original tool was developed in a different cultural context."

"The discussion on how positive therapy reduces fear of intimacy could be enriched by comparing these findings with other therapeutic approaches used in similar contexts, such as cognitive-behavioral therapy or mindfulness-based interventions."

"Expand on the mechanisms by which positive psychotherapy might reduce suicidal thoughts, referencing more theoretical perspectives or empirical evidence on the interplay between positive emotions and suicidal ideation."

"The conclusion would be more robust if it included specific recommendations for future research, particularly studies that might explore long-term effects of positive therapy or its applicability in different demographic groups."

Response: Revised and uploaded the manuscript.

2. Revised

Editor's decision after revisions: Accepted. Editor in Chief's decision: Accepted.

