

Article history: Received 21 February 2024 Revised 01 June 2024 Accepted 19 June 2024 Published online 01 August 2024

Applied Family Therapy Journal

OPEN PEER-REVIEW REPORT



Comparing the Effectiveness of Intensive Short-Term Dynamic Psychotherapy (ISTDP) and Acceptance and Commitment Therapy Enriched with Compassion on the Components of Dysfunctional Communication Beliefs in Women Seeking Divorce

Somayeh. Farahdel¹, Hossein. Mahdian^{2*}, Mehdi. Ghasemi Motlagh²

¹ PhD Student in Psychology, Bojnord Branch, Islamic Azad University, Bojnord, Iran ² Assistant Professor, Department of Psychology, Bojnord Branch, Islamic Azad University, Bojnord, Iran

* Corresponding author email address: hossein3284@gmail.com

Editor	R e v i e w e r s
Bahram Jowkar [®]	Reviewer 1: Mohsen Kachooei 💿
Professor of Psychology	Assistant Professor of Health Psychology, Department of Psychology, Humanities
Department, Shiraz University, Iran	Faculty, University of Science and Culture, Tehran, Iran. kachooei.m@usc.ac.ir
jowkar@shirazu.ac.ir	Reviewer 2: Farhad Namjoo 🧐
	Department of Psychology and Counseling, KMAN Research Institute, Richmond
	Hill, Ontario, Canada. Email: farhadnamjoo@kmanresce.ca

1. Round 1

1.1. Reviewer 1

Reviewer:

"Rational beliefs are those that are realistic consistent with reality can be supported by reasoning and are expressed as preferences or inclinations rather than as a necessity." – This sentence needs grammatical correction. Consider revising to: "Rational beliefs are realistic, consistent with reality, supported by reasoning, and expressed as preferences or inclinations rather than necessities."

The first session outlines four key life areas but does not elaborate on their significance. Include a brief explanation of how these areas are related to dysfunctional communication beliefs.

"The results show that there is no significant difference between the two groups of ISTDP and ACT enriched with compassion in dysfunctional communication beliefs according to group membership..." – This sentence would benefit from clarification. Specify what "group membership" refers to in this context.

The table lacks a descriptive title and footnotes explaining the abbreviations and statistical tests used. Adding these elements will improve readability and understanding.

The discussion mentions that findings are consistent with previous studies but does not explain the context of these studies. Provide a brief summary of how previous studies relate to the current findings.

"In explaining the research results it can be said that on the one hand both Intensive Short-Term Dynamic Psychotherapy and Acceptance and Commitment Therapy enriched with compassion can be effective in reducing the dysfunctional communication beliefs of women seeking divorce." – This sentence is too broad. Discuss specific mechanisms by which each therapy impacts dysfunctional communication beliefs.

Response: Revised and uploaded the manuscript.

1.2. Reviewer 2

Reviewer:

The description of the sample selection lacks detail about the randomization process. Include specifics on how participants were randomized into control and experimental groups to enhance transparency.

The reliability of the Persian version of the Relationship Beliefs Inventory (RBI) is mentioned, but details about its validity are omitted. Provide information on the validity of the translated version to support its use in this study.

"Following up questions and increasing pressure to feel emotions based on technical interventions" – This stage could benefit from examples of specific technical interventions used, providing clarity on the process.

The discussion of the therapeutic alliance in ISTDP is brief. Expand on how the therapeutic alliance is established and its importance in the therapy process.

"The reliance on self-report measures could introduce biases..." – Suggest specific alternative measures or additional data collection methods that could mitigate these biases in future research.

The conclusion states that both therapies are effective without significant differences between them. However, it does not address practical implications for therapists choosing between these treatments. Discuss considerations for therapists when selecting a treatment modality based on individual patient needs.

Response: Revised and uploaded the manuscript.

2. Revised

Editor's decision after revisions: Accepted. Editor in Chief's decision: Accepted.

