




Comparison of the Effectiveness of Cognitive-Behavioral Therapy and Existential Therapy on Symptoms of Demoralization and Life Attitudes in Women Heads of Households in Welfare


Hamideh Sadat. Mohajeri¹, Mohammadmehdi. Jahangiri^{2*}, Zabih. Pirani²

¹ PhD. student, Department of Psychology, Arak Branch, Islamic Azad University, Arak, Iran



² Assistant Professor, Department of Psychology, Arak Branch, Islamic Azad University, Arak, Iran.

* Corresponding author email address: jahangiri.mehdi@yahoo.com

Editor

Manijeh Daneshpour
Department of Couple and Family
therapy, Alliant International
University, California, United
States of America
mdaneshpour@alliant.edu

Reviewers

Reviewer 1: Zahra Yousefi
Assistant Professor, Department of Psychology, Khorasgan Branch, Islamic Azad
University, Isfahan, Iran.
Email: yousefi1393@khuif.ac.ir
Reviewer 2: Mehdi Rostami
Department of Psychology and Counseling, KMAN Research Institute, Richmond
Hill, Ontario, Canada.
Email: dr.mrostami@kmanresce.ca

1. Round 1

1.1. Reviewer 1

Reviewer:

The introduction should briefly mention previous studies comparing CBT and existential therapy on similar populations. Adding 1-2 sentences about past research findings would enhance context.

The description of the subscales could be expanded to include example items or a brief explanation of what each subscale measures to aid in the reader's understanding.

The session descriptions would benefit from more detail. For example, describe the specific techniques used for cognitive restructuring in Session 3.

The demographic characteristics section lacks detail on socioeconomic status. Consider including information on participants' income levels or employment status to provide a fuller picture.

The standard deviations in Table 1 seem quite large, particularly for the demoralization symptoms. Please discuss potential reasons for this variability in the text.

The results mention Levene's test but do not provide the test statistics or p-values. Including these would enhance transparency about the assumptions of the analyses.

Response: Revised and uploaded the manuscript.

1.2. Reviewer 2

Reviewer:

The sentence "These statistics show that annually about 77,000 women take on the headship of households" would benefit from a citation for the annual statistic to ensure the credibility of the data presented.

Clarify the rationale for choosing a sample size of 60. Explain whether a power analysis was conducted to determine the sample size or if it was based on logistical constraints.

The inclusion criterion "scoring 30 or above on the Demoralization Scale" lacks justification. Please provide a rationale or reference supporting this cut-off score.

The reliability coefficients provided (0.87 and 0.96) should be clearly labeled as Cronbach's alpha to avoid any confusion about the type of reliability measure used.

In Session 6, it mentions "the realities of loneliness and death were acknowledged and accepted." Please elaborate on the specific methods or exercises used to facilitate this process.

The application of the Greenhouse-Geisser correction should be explained. Include a brief sentence on why it was necessary and how it impacts the results.

The discussion states that both therapies "equally impacted reducing demoralization symptoms." However, this conclusion should be supported by statistical evidence directly comparing the two interventions.

Consider adding a paragraph discussing the limitations related to the quasi-experimental design, such as potential selection biases and the lack of random assignment.

The conclusion would benefit from a stronger emphasis on practical implications. Suggest specific ways welfare organizations can implement these findings in their interventions.

Response: Revised and uploaded the manuscript.

2. Revised

Editor's decision after revisions: Accepted.

Editor in Chief's decision: Accepted.