



# A Comparison of the Effectiveness of Mentalization-Based Therapy (MBT) and Affect Phobia Therapy (APT) in Reducing Depressive Symptoms in Women with Borderline Personality Disorder

Tahereh. Hajmohamad hosini <sup>1</sup>

Hasan. Mirzahoseini <sup>2</sup>\*

Majid. ZarghamHajebi <sup>3</sup>

1. PhD student in Psychology, Qom Branch, Islamic Azad University, Qom, Iran.

2. Assistant Professor, Department of Psychology, Qom Branch, Islamic Azad University, Qom, Iran.

3. Associate Professor, Department of Psychology, Qom Branch, Islamic Azad University, Qom, Iran

Email: h.mirzahouseini@gmail.com | Received: 18.04.2021 | Acceptance: 24.10.2022

*Journal of Applied Family Therapy*

eISSN: 2717-2430  
http://Aftj.ir

Vol. 3, No. 1, Pp: 5-8  
Spring 2022

### Original research article

#### How to Cite This Article:

Hajmohamad hosini, T., Mirzahoseini, H., & ZarghamHajebi, M. (2022). A Comparison of the Effectiveness of Mentalization-Based Therapy (MBT) and Affect Phobia Therapy (APT) in Reducing Depressive Symptoms in Women with Borderline Personality Disorder, *aftj*, 3(1): 5-8



© 2022 by the authors. Licensee Iranian Association of Women's Studies, Tehran, Iran. This article is an open access article distributed under the terms and conditions of the Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial 4.0 International (CC BY-NC 4.0 license) (<http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>)

#### Abstract

**Aim:** The present study aimed to determine the effectiveness of Mentalization-based therapy (MBT) in comparison with Affect Phobia Therapy (APT) in reducing depressive symptoms in women with borderline personality disorders. **Methods:** The study had a quasi-experimental method with a pretest-posttest design and follow-up with a control group. The statistical population consisted of 120 women with borderline personality disorder symptoms who visited counseling centers in Qom from August and October 2020. After screening with the Goldberg Depression Questionnaire (1971) and interviews according to DSM-5 criteria, 60 women were selected by purposive sampling and were randomly assigned to two experimental groups and a control group (20 per group). The first experimental group received mentalization-based therapy by Batman and Funagi (2016), and the second experimental group received affect phobia therapy by McCullough in eight 90-minute sessions, one session per week, and the control group was placed on a waiting list. Data were analyzed using repeated-measures analysis of variance (ANOVA). **Results:** The results indicated the effects of mentalization-based therapy intervention (F=18.41, P=0.001) with an effect size of 0.36, and affect phobia therapy intervention (F=20.35, P=0.001) with an effect size of 0.38 on women's depression, and the stability of the effects at the follow-up stage. **Conclusion:** The affect phobia therapy along with medication can be used for patients with depression.

**Keywords:** Depression; Mentalization-based therapy (MBT); Affect Phobia Therapy (APT)

### References

- Aini, S. Nariman, M. Atta Dokht, A. Beshrpour, S. Sadeghi Movahed, F. (2017). Comparison of the effectiveness of treatment based on mentalization and cognitive-analytical therapy on improving thematic relationships of people with borderline personality disorder. *Journal of Health Sciences Research Institute, Jihad Sazandegi*. 17(3): 287-275.
- Baker, R. Thomas, S. Thomas, P. W. Gower, P. Santonastaso, M. Whittlesea, A. (2010). The Emotional Processing Scale: Scale refinement and abridgement (EPS-25). *Journal of Psychosomatic Research*, 68: 83-91
- Bateman A, Fonagy P. (2016). *Mentalization - based treatment for personality disorders: a practical guide*. Oxford, UK: 1 st Edition Oxford University Press: UK, 2016
- Bateman A, Fonagy, P. (2013). Impact of clinical severity on outcomes of mentalisation-based treatment for borderline personality disorder. *British Journal of Psychiatry*, 203:221 -227
- Bateman, A, Campbell, C, Luyten, P, Fonagy, P. (2018). A mentalization-based approach to common factors in the treatment of borderline personality disorder. *Curr Opin Psychol*. 21:44–9.
- Bateman, A. W., Gunderson, J., & Mulder, R. (2015). Treatment of personality disorder. *Lancet*, 385, 735–743.
- De Roten, Y. Ambresin, G. Herrera, F. Fassassi, S. Fournier, N. Preisig, M. & Despland, J. N. (2017). Efficacy of an adjunctive brief psychodynamic psychotherapy to usual inpatient treatment of depression: Results of a randomized controlled trial. *Journal of affective disorders*, 209: 105-113
- Dvorak, R. D. Sargent, E. M. Kilwein, T. M. Stevenson, B. L. Kuvaas, N. J. & Williams, T. J. (2014). Alcohol use and alcohol-related consequences: associations with emotion. *Am J Drug Alcohol Abuse*, 4(2): 125-130.
- Edel, MA, Raaff, V. Dimaggio, G, Buchheim, A, Brune, M. (2017). Exploring the effectiveness of combined mentalization-based group therapy and dialectical behaviour therapy for inpatients with borderline personality disorder - A pilot study. *The British Journal of Clinical Psychology*, 56:1-15
- Farajzadeh, Z. Karamatinia, F. Saadat Jo, AR (2017). The effect of group training to deal with depression in a cognitive-behavioral way on the depression of nurses in Birjand teaching hospitals. *Journal of nursing education*. 7(6): 46-39
- Ferankl, M. Wennberg, P. Berggraf, L. Philips, B. (2018). Affect Phobia Therapy for Mild to Moderate Alcohol Use Disorder: The Cases of “Carey,” “Michelle,” and “Mary”. *Pragmatic Case Studies in Psychotherapy*, (1):214-257.
- Frankl, M. (2017). *Psychotherapy for substance use disorders--the importance of affects*. Unpublished doctoral dissertation, Faculty of Arts and Sciences, Linköping University, Linköping, Sweden. Available at:<http://liu.diva-portal.org/smash/get/diva2:1159275/FULLTEXT01.pdf>.

- Frankl, M. Philips, B. Berggraf, L. Ulvenes, P. Johansson, R. & Wennberg, P. (2016). Psychometric properties of the Affect Phobia Test. *Scandinavian Journal of Psychology*, 57, 482–488.
- Gimeno, E, Chiclana, C. (2016). Borderline personality disorder in adolescence. Prevention and early intervention from a cognitive analytic approach. *European Psychiatry*, 33: S505
- Gimeno, E, Chiclana, C. (2017). Cognitive analytic therapy and mentalizing function. *European Psychiatry*, 41: S776
- Goldberg, DP. Hillier, VF. (1979). A scaled version of the General Health Questionnaire. *Psychol Med.* 9(1):139-45. PMID: 424481
- Hall, M. A. Riedford, K. M. (2017). Borderline Personality Disorder: Diagnosis and Common Comorbidities. *The Journal for Nurse Practitioners*, 13(9): 455-456.
- Hall, M. A. Riedford, K. M. (2017). Borderline Personality Disorder: Diagnosis and Common Comorbidities. *The Journal for Nurse Practitioners*, 13(9): 455-456.
- Hosseini, A. Pouyan, M. Valizadeh, AR. Moradi, A. Reza (2017). Dynamic modeling of the effectiveness of third wave cognitive behavioral therapies and antidepressants on major depressive disorder. *Quarterly journal of research in psychological health.* 4 (16): 12-27(Persian).
- Jonhansson, R. , Bjorklund ,M. Hornborg, CH. Karlsson, S. Hesser, H. Ljotsson, B. Rousseau, A. Frederick, R. Andersson, G. (2013). Affect-focused psychodynamic psychotherapy for depression and anxiety through the Internet: a randomized controlled trial. *Peer J*, 18: 1-22.
- Kalleklev, J, Karterud, S. (2018). A comparative study of a mentalization-based versus a psychodynamic group therapy session. *Group Analysis.* 2018;51(1):44-60
- Khorianian, M. Heydari, L. Tabibi, Zahra Agha Mohammadian Shearbaaf, H.R. (2011). The effectiveness of intensive short-term dynamic psychotherapy on reducing symptoms and emotional expression in patients with depression. *Thoughts and behavior.* 7 (26):37-46(Persian).
- Magnavita, N. (2007). Anxiety and depression at work. The A/D Goldberg Questionnaire, *G Ital Med Lav Ergon.* 29(3):670-1.
- Mahmoud Alivand, M. Hashemi, T. Birami, M. Bakshipour, A. Sharifi, MA. (2017). the role of childhood maltreatment and alexithymia in predicting borderline personality disorder: a study in a non-clinical population. *Psychological research.* 21(2): 73-96.
- Mahmoudi Ghasare, M. Agha Mohammadian Shearbaaf, H.R. Dehghani, M. Hassanabadi, H. (2013). Efficacy of psychoactive short-term sedative therapy with anxiety regulation method in the treatment of men suffering from social phobia. *Iranian Journal of Psychiatry and Clinical Psychology.* 20(2):111-120 (Persian).
- MC, Müllauer, PK, Gaugeler, R, Senft, B, Andreas, S. (2018). Improvements in mentalization predict improvements in interpersonal distress in patients with mental disorders. *J Clin Psychol*, 74: 2276-86
- McCullough, L. Kuhn, N. Kaplan, A. Wolf, J. Lanza Hurley, C. (2003). *Treating affect phobia.* Publish by the Guilford press. A division of Guilford publications, Inc. 72 Spring street, New York, London, NY 10012.
- Oliveira, C.D, Rahioui, H, Smadja, M, Gorsane, M.A, Louppe, F. (2017). Mentalization based treatment and borderline personality disorder. *L'Encéphale*, 43:340 -345

- Osborn, K. Ulvenes, P. Wampold, B. & McCullough, L. (2014). Creating change through focusing on affect: Affect Phobia Therapy. In N. Thoma & D. McKay (Eds.), *Working with emotions in cognitive behavioral therapy: Techniques for clinical practice* (pp. 146-174). New York: Guilford Press.
- Parekh, A. Smeeth, D, Milner, Y, Healthcare, ST. (2017) undefined. The role of lipid biomarkers in major depression. *Healthcare (Basel)*, 5(2):31-40
- Parker, G. Roy, K. L. (2001). Adolescent depression: A review Australian Newzeland *Journal of psychology*. 35(5), 572-580 .
- Petersen, R, Brakoulias, V, Langdon, R. (2016). An experimental investigation of mentalization ability in borderline personality disorder. *Comprehensive Psychiatry*, 16:12 -21
- Rossouw, T., & Fonagy, P. (2012). Mentalization-Based Treatment for Self-Harm in Adolescents: A Randomized Controlled Trial. *Mentalization J American Academy of Child & Adolescent Psychiatry*, 51(12): 1304-13.
- Saunders, R. Buckman, J. E. Cape, J. Fearon, P. Leibowitz, J. & Pilling, S. (2019). Trajectories of depression and anxiety symptom change during psychological therapy. *Journal of affective disorders*, 249: 327-335
- Singhal, G. (2017). *Neuroscience BB-F in cellular, undefined. Microglia: an interface between the loss of neuroplasticity and depression*. frontiersin.org [Internet]. [Cited 2020 Jul 29]; Available from: <https://www.frontiersin.org/articles/10.3389/fncel.2017.00270/full>
- Suri, P. Shekarzadeh, Sh. (2018). Investigating dimensions of personality pathology and cognitive abilities in people with borderline personality disorder. *Development of psychology*. 7(40):163-153(Persian).
- World Health Organization. (2018). Available from: <http://www.who.int/en/news-room/fact-sheets/detail/depression>.
- Yirmiya, R. Rimmerman, N. (2015). *Neurosciences RR-T in, 2015 undefined. Depression as a microglial disease*. Elsevier [Internet]. [Cited 2020 Jul 29]; Available from: <https://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S0166223615001769>