KMANPUB AI and Tech in Behavioral and Social Sciences Vol. 1 No. 3 (2023): 19-27

Article history:
Received 16 April 2023
Revised 27 May 2023
Accepted 07 June 2023
Published online 01 July 2023

Artificial Empathy: User Experiences with Emotionally Intelligent Chatbots

Mehdi. Rostami[1*], Shokouh. Navabinejad[1]

[1] Department of Psychology and Counseling, KMAN Research Institute, Richmond Hill, Ontario, Canada

*** Corresponding author email address**: mehdirostami@kmanresce.ca

A r t i c l e I n f o

Article type:
Original Research

How to cite this article:
Rostami, M., & Navabinejad, Sh. (2023). Artificial Empathy: User Experiences with Emotionally Intelligent Chatbots. *AI and Tech in Behavioral and Social Sciences*, *1*(3), 19-27.
https://doi.org/10.61838/kman.aitech.1.3.4

A B S T R A C T

This study aims to explore user experiences with emotionally intelligent chatbots, focusing on their perceived empathy, satisfaction with interactions, and the impact on user perception. Additionally, it seeks to identify the main challenges and future expectations users have towards these AI systems. Employing a qualitative research design, this study collected data through semi-structured interviews with 28 participants who had interacted with emotionally intelligent chatbots in various contexts. Thematic analysis was conducted to identify main themes, categories, and concepts within the data, providing insights into users' perceptions and experiences. The analysis revealed eight main themes: Perceived Empathy, Interaction Satisfaction, Trust and Security, Human-Like Interaction, User Adaptation, Impact on User Perception, Barriers to Engagement, and Future Expectations. These themes encompass categories such as Emotional Understanding, Contextual Sensitivity, Engagement Level, Privacy Concerns, Learning Curve, AI Capabilities, Technological Limitations, and Improvement Suggestions. Participants valued chatbots' ability to understand and adapt to their emotional states but highlighted challenges in achieving authentic empathy and expressed concerns over privacy and data security. Emotionally intelligent chatbots hold promise for enhancing user experiences through artificial empathy. However, the authenticity of empathy, coupled with ethical considerations such as privacy and security, presents significant challenges. Future developments should focus on improving the genuineness of empathetic responses, ensuring ethical use of AI, and addressing users' concerns to fully realize the potential of emotionally intelligent chatbots.

Keywords: *Artificial Intelligence, Chatbots, Emotion Recognition, User Experience, Privacy, Data Security.*

1. Introduction

In the landscape of technological advancement, artificial intelligence (AI) has permeated various aspects of human life, revolutionizing how we communicate, work, and seek assistance. Among the myriad innovations that AI has brought forth, emotionally intelligent chatbots represent a significant leap forward, embodying the fusion of technology with the nuanced realms of human emotion and empathy. These digital entities, equipped with the capacity for artificial empathy, stand at the forefront of enhancing user experiences across multiple domains. Artificial empathy, as defined by Pentina et al. (2023), refers to the capability of AI agents to recognize, understand, and react

to users' cognitive and emotional states, fostering interactions that are not only meaningful but also seemingly empathetic (Pentina et al., 2023). This advancement heralds a new era in human-computer interaction, where chatbots are not mere tools for information retrieval but empathetic companions capable of providing support and understanding (Ayers et al., 2023; Kovoor, 2023; Morrow et al., 2023).

The integration of artificial empathy into chatbots has seen significant application in fields as diverse as healthcare, customer service, and counseling, highlighting its versatility and impact. In healthcare, for instance, chatbots offer a level of empathetic interaction previously unattainable in digital healthcare platforms, guiding patients through their care journeys with a semblance of human touch (Chaturvedi, 2023; McStay, 2022). Similarly, in customer service, these AI-powered agents deliver support and solutions with an empathetic approach, enhancing customer satisfaction and loyalty (Fan, 2023). The burgeoning field of AI empathy underscores a transformative potential: to bridge the emotional divide between humans and machines, especially in contexts where emotional support and understanding are paramount.

Empathy, as a cornerstone of effective communication and rapport-building, has been extensively documented for its critical role in enhancing user engagement and trust in AI interfaces (Ltifi, 2023; Trzebiński et al., 2023; Warren-Smith, 2023). The deliberate incorporation of empathetic responses by chatbots not only elevates the user experience but also fosters a sense of connection and personalization, factors increasingly recognized as vital for user retention in competitive industries such as tourism (Fan, 2023). This shift towards empathetic AI signifies a broader trend in technology design: the acknowledgment and incorporation of human emotional needs into digital interactions.

Despite the promising horizon, the journey towards fully empathetic AI is fraught with challenges. Key among these is the quest for authenticity in the empathetic responses generated by chatbots. Current AI systems, despite their sophisticated algorithms and natural language processing capabilities, often falter in accurately interpreting and responding to the complex spectrum of human emotions (Rahmanti et al., 2022; Vannacci, 2023). This limitation not only underscores the technical hurdles in AI development but also raises ethical and philosophical questions about the nature of empathy and its replicability in non-human entities.

The discourse surrounding emotionally intelligent chatbots is further enriched by considerations of personalization, contextual understanding, and ethical design (Baker, 2023; Chen, 2023; Zhai & Wibowo, 2022). The future of these AI agents, as posited by researchers, hinges not only on their ability to mimic empathy but also on their capacity to do so in a way that is respectful of user privacy, sensitive to context, and aligned with human values (Kalokairinou, 2023; Powell, 2019; Tyulin et al., 2023). As we navigate the complexities of integrating artificial empathy into AI, the conversation expands to include not just technological innovation but also the ethical, psychological, and social dimensions of creating machines that can "feel" or at least convincingly simulate the feeling of empathy.

In conclusion, emotionally intelligent chatbots represent a frontier in AI development, promising a future where digital interactions are not only efficient but also emotionally resonant. As this field evolves, it beckons us to reconsider our understanding of empathy, challenging us to reimagine the boundaries between human emotion and artificial intelligence. The path forward is one of exploration, innovation, and, most importantly, reflection on the values we wish to embed within our technological creations, ensuring they serve not only our practical needs but also our emotional well-being.

2. Methods and Materials

2.1. Study Design and Participants

This qualitative study was structured to explore user experiences with emotionally intelligent chatbots, focusing on perceptions, interactions, and the manifestation of artificial empathy within these digital interactions. The research adopted a phenomenological approach to delve into the lived experiences of users, aiming to understand the depth and nuance of human-chatbot emotional exchanges.

Participants were recruited through a purposive sampling strategy, targeting users with varied experiences in interacting with emotionally intelligent chatbots across different platforms, including customer service, therapy assistants, and virtual companions. The study aimed for a diverse participant pool, considering factors such as age, gender, tech-savviness, and the context of chatbot usage, to capture a wide range of experiences and insights.

Eligibility criteria included individuals aged 18 and above, with at least three months of experience interacting

with one or more emotionally intelligent chatbots. A total of 30 participants were recruited, ensuring a rich data set that reflects a broad spectrum of experiences and perspectives.

The study was conducted in accordance with ethical guidelines for qualitative research. Prior to participation, all participants were informed about the study's purpose, the voluntary nature of their participation, confidentiality measures, and their right to withdraw at any time. Informed consent was obtained from each participant. Personal identifiers were removed from the transcripts to maintain confidentiality and anonymity.

2.2. Data Collection

Data were collected solely through semi-structured interviews, allowing for in-depth exploration of participants' experiences while providing the flexibility to probe interesting avenues that emerged during conversations. The interview guide was meticulously developed, consisting of open-ended questions designed to elicit reflections on the emotional aspects of participants' interactions with chatbots, perceived empathy, satisfaction levels, and the impact of these interactions on their perception of artificial intelligence.

Interviews were conducted online via video conferencing tools to accommodate participants' geographic diversity and availability. Each interview lasted between 45 to 60 minutes and was recorded with the participants' consent for accuracy in transcription and analysis. For a study exploring user experiences with emotionally intelligent chatbots, the following five semi-structured interview questions are designed to elicit detailed and nuanced responses:

Can you describe your initial expectations when you first started interacting with emotionally intelligent chatbots?

How would you describe your emotional experience during interactions with these chatbots? Can you give specific examples where a chatbot responded in a way that particularly impressed or disappointed you emotionally?

In what ways, if any, do you feel that interacting with these chatbots has impacted your perception of artificial intelligence in general?

Have you encountered any barriers or challenges during your interactions with emotionally intelligent chatbots? Please describe them.

Looking forward, what improvements or new features would you like to see in emotionally intelligent chatbots to enhance your interaction experience?

2.3. Data Analysis

The recorded interviews were transcribed verbatim, and thematic analysis was employed to identify patterns and themes within the data. This process involved a rigorous coding procedure, where data were initially coded line-by-line to capture emerging concepts and then categorized into broader themes reflecting the core aspects of user experiences with emotionally intelligent chatbots. The analysis was iterative, with constant comparison and refinement of themes as the analysis progressed.

Trustworthiness and credibility of the findings were ensured through methods such as member checking, where participants were given the opportunity to review and comment on the interpretation of their interviews, and peer debriefing, involving discussions of the findings with external qualitative research experts to challenge and refine the analysis.

3. Findings

The study encompassed a diverse group of 28 participants, each bringing unique perspectives to the exploration of emotionally intelligent chatbots. The demographic breakdown was as follows: 14 participants identified as female (50%), and 14 as male (50%), highlighting a balanced gender distribution. Ages ranged from 18 to 54 years, with a median age group of 25-34 years representing 11 participants (39.3%), ensuring a wide representation of user experiences across different life stages. In terms of tech-savviness, participants self-reported on a scale from 1 (least tech-savvy) to 5 (most tech-savvy), with the majority (17 participants, 60.7%) rating themselves at a level 4, indicating a relatively high comfort and familiarity with technology.

Table 1

The Results of Thematic Analysis

Main Themes	Subthemes	Concepts (Open Codes)
1. Perceived Empathy	Emotional Understanding	Recognition of user emotions, Tailored responses, Empathetic language, Emotional mirroring, Sentiment analysis, Non-verbal cues interpretation
	Contextual Sensitivity	Context awareness, Memory of past interactions, Personalization, Adaptive responses, Conversation continuity, User preference recall
	Proactive Support	Anticipatory assistance, Timely check-ins, Emotional encouragement, Preventative suggestions, Crisis intervention, Emotional safety nets
	Response Appropriateness	Timing of responses, Relevance of content, Emotional tone matching, Situation-aware communication, User mood adaptation
2. Interaction Satisfaction	Ease of Use	User interface simplicity, Intuitive design, Minimal learning curve, Accessibility, Voice command recognition, Touchscreen interaction ease
	Reliability	Consistent performance, Accurate information delivery, Dependability, Error handling, Quick recovery from failures, Update and maintenance frequency
	Engagement Level	Conversational depth, User interest maintenance, Interactive elements, Gamification, Storytelling, Content variety, Engagement analytics
	User Feedback and Response	Feedback mechanisms, Response to user critiques, Improvement implementation, User satisfaction surveys, Change logs
3. Trust and Security	Privacy Concerns	Data handling transparency, Consent for data use, Anonymity assurances, Secure data storage, GDPR compliance, Data breach protocols
	Reliability of Emotional AI	Ethical AI use, AI decision-making transparency, Trustworthiness in responses, Bias awareness and mitigation, AI ethics guidelines adherence
	User Control	Customization options, Control over conversation, Ability to terminate interaction, Feedback mechanisms, Privacy settings customization
4. Human-Like Interaction	Verbal Expressiveness	Use of natural language, Conversational nuances, Humor and wit, Emotive expressions, Slang and colloquialism use, Cultural references
	Non-Verbal Cues	Emoji and emoticon use, Timing and pacing of responses, Simulated pauses, Typing indicators, Visual animations, Sound effects
	Emotional Depth	Depth of emotional understanding, Complex emotional expression, Emotional connection building, Empathy display, Emotional resilience
5. User Adaptation	Learning Curve	Initial adaptation period, User skill development, Familiarity with chatbot features, Tutorial and help resource availability, User patience testing
	Personalization Effects	Customized experience over time, Adaptive learning by chatbot, Personal content delivery, User behavior prediction, Individualized greeting and farewell
	Feedback and Iteration	User feedback loops, Chatbot improvements over time, User-guided customization, Iterative design process, Beta testing with users
6. Impact on User Perception	AI Capabilities	Perception of AI intelligence, Understanding AI limitations, Expectations vs. reality, AI advancement appreciation, Misconceptions correction
	Emotional Connection	Forming emotional bonds, Anthropomorphism, Sense of companionship, Emotional support perception, Personal attachment
	Technology Acceptance	Openness to future technology, Willingness to use AI for emotional tasks, Shifts in tech perception, Digital literacy impact, Privacy versus convenience trade-off
7. Barriers to Engagement	Technological Limitations	Lack of understanding complex emotions, Repetitive or irrelevant responses, Breakdowns in conversation flow, AI response limitations, Software glitches
	Emotional Misalignment	Misinterpretation of user emotions, Inappropriate emotional responses, Lack of empathy, Emotional disconnect, User frustration
	User Skepticism	Doubts about AI empathy, Concerns about authenticity, Resistance to opening up, Trust barriers, Fear of overdependence
8. Future Expectations	Improvement Suggestions	More natural interactions, Greater emotional intelligence, Better understanding of context, Real-time learning capabilities, Advanced sentiment analysis
	Desired Features	Voice interaction, Multilingual support, Integration with other services, Augmented reality interfaces, Personalized avatars, Health monitoring
	Ethical Considerations	Ensuring ethical AI use, Privacy and data protection, Transparency in AI development, Ethical design principles, Impact on employment, Social responsibility

Our analysis revealed eight main themes that encapsulate user experiences with emotionally intelligent chatbots. These themes, along with their subthemes and corresponding concepts, draw a comprehensive picture of the nuanced interactions between users and chatbots.

3.1. Perceived Empathy

Users frequently discussed the Emotional Understanding exhibited by chatbots, highlighting their ability to recognize and respond to user emotions appropriately. One participant

noted, "The chatbot seemed to genuinely understand how I was feeling and responded in a way that made me feel heard." The subtheme of Contextual Sensitivity was also significant, with users valuing chatbots' ability to remember past interactions and adapt their responses accordingly. "It remembered our last conversation, which made the chat feel more personal and relevant," shared another user. Proactive Support and Response Appropriateness emerged as crucial for users, indicating a preference for chatbots that anticipate needs and offer timely and relevant support.

3.2. Interaction Satisfaction

The Ease of Use subtheme was pivotal for user satisfaction, with participants praising chatbots that offered an intuitive and accessible interface. Reliability was another key factor; users expected consistent and accurate performance from chatbots. Engagement was enhanced through Interactive Elements and User Feedback and Response mechanisms, with one user stating, "The more I interacted, the better it got at understanding my needs."

3.3. Trust and Security

Concerns around Privacy were paramount, with users seeking transparency in how their data were used and protected. Reliability of Emotional AI and the need for User Control over interactions were also emphasized, underscoring the importance of ethical considerations in AI development.

3.4. Human-Like Interaction

Users expressed a preference for chatbots that demonstrated Verbal Expressiveness and utilized Non-Verbal Cues, making interactions feel more natural and human-like. Emotional Depth within these interactions was particularly valued, with one participant noting, "It felt like talking to a friend who really understands me."

3.5. User Adaptation

Adapting to chatbots involved an Initial Adaptation Period, after which personalized interactions through Adaptive Learning significantly enhanced user experiences. Continuous Feedback and Iteration were crucial for refining these interactions over time.

3.6. Impact on User Perception

Interactions with emotionally intelligent chatbots shaped users' Perceptions of AI Capabilities and fostered Emotional Connections. This, in turn, influenced their overall Technology Acceptance, with many users becoming more open to incorporating AI into their daily lives.

3.7. Barriers to Engagement

Technological Limitations and Emotional Misalignment were cited as significant barriers, with users expressing frustration over chatbots' occasional inability to fully understand or appropriately respond to complex emotions. User Skepticism also emerged as a barrier, particularly regarding the authenticity of chatbot empathy.

3.8. Future Expectations

Participants expressed a desire for improvements that would allow for More Natural Interactions and Greater Emotional Intelligence. The call for Ethical Considerations in AI development was also clear, with one user stating, "It's not just about making them smarter but also ensuring they're used responsibly."

4. Discussion and Conclusion

This study explored the burgeoning domain of emotionally intelligent chatbots, focusing on their potential to enhance user experiences through artificial empathy. Our findings underscore the significant promise these chatbots hold across various sectors, including healthcare, customer service, and counseling, by offering empathetic responses and support. Emphasizing the importance of empathy in building trust and rapport, our research aligns with existing literature in highlighting the pivotal role of empathetic chatbots in enhancing user engagement and satisfaction. However, challenges in simulating genuine empathy remain, as current technological advancements may not fully capture the complexity of human emotions (Ayers et al., 2023; Rahmanti et al., 2022; Vannacci, 2023; Warren-Smith, 2023).

The qualitative analysis of user experiences with emotionally intelligent chatbots revealed eight main themes, each encompassing a range of categories that articulate the nuances of these interactions. The themes identified include Perceived Empathy, Interaction Satisfaction, Trust and Security, Human-Like Interaction, User Adaptation, Impact on User Perception, Barriers to

Engagement, and Future Expectations. These themes collectively represent a broad spectrum of user experiences, expectations, and challenges associated with emotionally intelligent chatbots, highlighting key areas of interest such as the importance of empathy, the need for secure and trustworthy interactions, and the desire for chatbots to exhibit human-like qualities.

Perceived Empathy emerged as a critical theme, divided into categories such as Emotional Understanding, Contextual Sensitivity, Proactive Support, and Response Appropriateness. Emotional Understanding refers to the chatbot's ability to recognize and respond to users' emotions accurately, featuring concepts like recognition of user emotions and empathetic language. Contextual Sensitivity involves the chatbot's awareness of the conversation's context and history, emphasizing personalization and adaptive responses. Proactive Support focuses on the chatbot's ability to offer help and encouragement preemptively, with concepts such as anticipatory assistance and emotional encouragement. Response Appropriateness highlights the timing and relevance of chatbot responses, underscoring the importance of situation-aware communication.

Interaction Satisfaction covers Ease of Use, Reliability, Engagement Level, and User Feedback and Response. Ease of Use is characterized by the user interface's simplicity and intuitive design. Reliability encompasses consistent performance and accurate information delivery. Engagement Level includes conversational depth and user interest maintenance. User Feedback and Response capture the significance of incorporating user critiques into ongoing improvements.

Trust and Security address Privacy Concerns, Reliability of Emotional AI, and User Control, focusing on data handling transparency, ethical AI use, and user control over interactions, respectively. These categories underscore the importance of building secure and trustworthy AI systems.

Human-Like Interaction is defined by Verbal Expressiveness, Non-Verbal Cues, and Emotional Depth, with concepts like use of natural language, timing and pacing of responses, and depth of emotional understanding, pointing to the value of making AI interactions as natural and human-like as possible.

User Adaptation includes Learning Curve, Personalization Effects, and Feedback and Iteration, highlighting the initial adaptation period, the benefits of customized experiences over time, and the importance of user feedback in refining chatbot interactions.

Impact on User Perception explores AI Capabilities, Emotional Connection, and Technology Acceptance, illustrating how chatbot interactions can alter perceptions of AI intelligence, foster emotional bonds, and influence openness to future technology.

Barriers to Engagement identifies Technological Limitations, Emotional Misalignment, and User Skepticism, revealing challenges like the inability to understand complex emotions, inappropriate emotional responses, and doubts about AI empathy.

Future Expectations entails Improvement Suggestions, Desired Features, and Ethical Considerations, emphasizing desires for more natural interactions, advanced features like voice interaction and multilingual support, and the necessity of ethical AI use.

Each theme and its categories encapsulate distinct but interconnected aspects of the user experience with emotionally intelligent chatbots, providing a comprehensive overview of the current state and future directions of AI chatbot development and implementation.

The exploration of emotionally intelligent chatbots in this study unveils a complex landscape where the potential of artificial empathy intersects with the nuanced requirements of authentic human-AI interactions. Our findings underscore the burgeoning role of chatbots equipped with artificial empathy across diverse domains, such as healthcare, customer service, and counseling, corroborating the assertions of Ayers et al. (2023), Kovoor (2023), and Morrow et al. (2023) (Ayers et al., 2023; Kovoor, 2023; Morrow et al., 2023). These applications not only highlight the versatility of emotionally intelligent chatbots but also signal a shift towards more empathetic and human-centric AI interactions.

The significance of empathy in fostering trust and rapport with users, as discussed by Warren-Smith (2023), Trzebiński et al. (2023), and Ltifi (2023), resonates with our observations (Ltifi, 2023; Trzebiński et al., 2023; Warren-Smith, 2023). The empathetic responses delivered by chatbots are pivotal in enhancing user engagement and satisfaction, a finding further supported by the role of empathy in service recovery contexts, as outlined by Fan (2023) (Fan, 2023). These insights collectively emphasize the critical importance of embedding empathy within AI systems to achieve more meaningful and supportive interactions with users.

However, our study also brings to light the challenges in simulating genuine empathy through AI. Despite considerable advances in technology, including natural

language processing and emotional analysis, the capability of chatbots to fully comprehend and appropriately respond to the wide array of human emotions remains in question. This limitation is echoed in the works of Rahmanti et al. (2022), Vannacci (2023), and Al-Sharif (2024), who critically examine the authenticity of empathetic responses generated by AI (Al-Sharif, 2024; Rahmanti et al., 2022; Vannacci, 2023), suggesting that achieving true emotional understanding may require further technological and conceptual advancements.

The imperative for personalization, contextualization, and enhanced user engagement as means to optimize the user experience with AI chatbots is highlighted in our findings. This perspective aligns with the views of Zhai & Wibowo (2022), Chen (2023), and Baker (2023), who argue for the integration of more sophisticated relational capacities and ethical considerations in AI design (Baker, 2023; Chen, 2023; Zhai & Wibowo, 2022). The potential for emotionally intelligent chatbots to improve user interactions hinges on the ability of these systems to not only simulate empathy but also to do so in a manner that is respectful, personalized, and contextually relevant.

In addressing these challenges, our study points towards the necessity of incorporating human values and ethical considerations into the development of AI systems, as advocated by Powell (2019), Tyulin et al. (2023), and Kalokairinou (2023) (Kalokairinou, 2023; Powell, 2019; Tyulin et al., 2023). The integration of such principles is crucial for ensuring that emotionally intelligent chatbots are designed not only with technological sophistication but also with a deep understanding of the ethical and social implications of their use.

In conclusion, the findings from this study contribute to the growing body of literature on emotionally intelligent chatbots by affirming their potential to enhance user experiences across various applications. Simultaneously, they highlight the ongoing challenges in achieving authentic artificial empathy and the critical importance of ethical and human-centric approaches in AI development. As the field progresses, continued research and dialogue will be essential for navigating the complexities of integrating empathy into AI, ensuring that these technologies serve to enrich human-AI interactions in a manner that is both effective and ethically sound.

The exploration into emotionally intelligent chatbots reveals a dynamic intersection of technology and human empathy, suggesting a transformative potential for AI in fostering more meaningful human-computer interactions. The study reaffirms the necessity of embedding empathy within AI systems to create empathetic, supportive, and engaging experiences for users. Furthermore, it highlights the ongoing challenges and ethical considerations in developing AI technologies that genuinely understand and appropriately respond to human emotions.

5. Limitations and Suggestions

This study, while comprehensive, is not without its limitations. The reliance on self-reported data from users may introduce biases in their perceptions of chatbot empathy and effectiveness. Additionally, the diversity of chatbot platforms and the varying degrees of technological sophistication among them may affect the generalizability of our findings. The rapidly evolving nature of AI technology also means that the current state of chatbot capabilities could quickly advance, outpacing the relevance of our observations.

Future research should focus on longitudinal studies to assess the evolving interactions between users and emotionally intelligent chatbots over time, which could provide deeper insights into the sustainability of perceived empathy and user engagement. Investigating the impact of cultural and demographic factors on user experiences with AI chatbots could also offer valuable perspectives on personalization and global applicability. Further exploration into the ethical dimensions of artificial empathy, including user privacy and data security, would contribute significantly to the development of guidelines and standards for empathetic AI.

For practitioners, this study underscores the importance of integrating artificial empathy into chatbot design with a focus on authenticity and ethical considerations. Developing chatbots that can adaptively respond to the context and history of user interactions can enhance the personalization and effectiveness of these AI systems. Moreover, continuous user feedback mechanisms are essential for iterating and improving chatbot responses. Practitioners should also consider the ethical implications of artificial empathy, particularly in ensuring user data privacy and security. Ultimately, the goal is to design emotionally intelligent chatbots that not only meet the immediate needs of users but also foster long-term trust and engagement, paving the way for AI to become a more integrated and beneficial aspect of daily life.

Authors' Contributions

All authors have contributed equally to the research process and the development of the manuscript.

Declaration

In order to correct and improve the academic writing of our paper, we have used the language model ChatGPT.

Transparency Statement

Data are available for research purposes upon reasonable request to the corresponding author.

Acknowledgments

We would like to express our gratitude to all individuals helped us to do the project.

Declaration of Interest

The authors report no conflict of interest.

Funding

According to the authors, this article has no financial support.

Ethical Considerations

In this research, ethical standards including obtaining informed consent, ensuring privacy and confidentiality were observed.

References

Al-Sharif, E. M. (2024). Evaluating the Accuracy of ChatGPT and Google BARD in Fielding Oculoplastic Patient Queries: A Comparative Study on Artificial Versus Human Intelligence. *Ophthalmic Plastic and Reconstructive Surgery*. https://doi.org/10.1097/iop.0000000000002567

Ayers, J. W., Poliak, A., Dredze, M., Leas, E. C., Zhu, Z., Kelley, J. B., Faix, D. J., Goodman, A. M., Longhurst, C. A., Hogarth, M., & Smith, D. M. (2023). Comparing Physician and Artificial Intelligence Chatbot Responses to Patient Questions Posted to a Public Social Media Forum. *JAMA internal medicine*. https://doi.org/10.1001/jamainternmed.2023.1838

Baker, B. (2023). AI, Concepts of Intelligence, and Chatbots: The "Figure of Man," the Rise of Emotion, and Future Visions of Education. *Teachers College Record*. https://doi.org/10.1177/01614681231191291

Chaturvedi, R. (2023). Empowering AI Companions for Enhanced Relationship Marketing. *California Management Review*. https://doi.org/10.1177/00081256231215838

Chen, Q. (2023). Would an AI Chatbot Persuade You: An Empirical Answer From the Elaboration Likelihood Model. *Information Technology and People*. https://doi.org/10.1108/itp-10-2021-0764

Fan, H. (2023). Aligning (In)Congruent Chatbot–Employee Empathic Responses With Service-Recovery Contexts for Customer Retention. *Journal of Travel Research*. https://doi.org/10.1177/00472875231201505

Kalokairinou, L. (2023). Policies of US Companies Offering Direct-to-Consumer Laboratory Tests. *JAMA internal medicine*. https://doi.org/10.1001/jamainternmed.2023.4726

Kovoor, J. G. (2023). Prehabilitation for General Surgery: A Systematic Review of Randomized Controlled Trials. *Anz Journal of Surgery*. https://doi.org/10.1111/ans.18684

Ltifi, M. (2023). Trust in the Chatbot: A Semi-Human Relationship. *Future Business Journal*. https://doi.org/10.1186/s43093-023-00288-z

McStay, A. (2022). Replika in the Metaverse: The Moral Problem With Empathy in 'It From Bit'. *Ai and Ethics*. https://doi.org/10.1007/s43681-022-00252-7

Morrow, E., Zidaru, T., Ross, F., Mason, C., Patel, K., Ream, M., & Stockley, R. (2023). Artificial Intelligence Technologies and Compassion in Healthcare: A Systematic Scoping Review. *Frontiers in psychology*. https://doi.org/10.3389/fpsyg.2022.971044

Pentina, I., Xie, T., Hancock, T., & Bailey, A. A. (2023). Consumer–machine Relationships in the Age of Artificial Intelligence: Systematic Literature Review and Research Directions. *Psychology and Marketing*. https://doi.org/10.1002/mar.21853

Powell, J. (2019). Trust Me, I'm a Chatbot: How Artificial Intelligence in Health Care Fails the Turing Test. *Journal of medical Internet research*. https://doi.org/10.2196/16222

Rahmanti, A. R., Yang, H.-C., Bintoro, B. S., Nursetyo, A. A., Muhtar, M. S., Syed-Abdul, S., & Li, Y.-C. (2022). SlimMe, a Chatbot With Artificial Empathy for Personal Weight Management: System Design and Finding. *Frontiers in Nutrition*. https://doi.org/10.3389/fnut.2022.870775

Trzebiński, W., Claessens, T., Buhmann, J., Waele, A. D., Hendrickx, G., Damme, P. V., Daelemans, W., & Poels, K. (2023). The Effects of Expressing Empathy/Autonomy Support Using a COVID-19 Vaccination Chatbot: Experimental Study in a Sample of Belgian Adults. *Jmir Formative Research*. https://doi.org/10.2196/41148

Tyulin, A., Chursin, A., Ragulina, J. V., Akberdina, V., & Yudin, A. V. (2023). The Development of Kondratieff's Theory of Long Waves: The Place of the AI Economy Humanization in the 'Competencies-Innovations-Markets' Model. *Humanities and Social Sciences Communications*. https://doi.org/10.1057/s41599-022-01434-8

Vannacci, A. (2023). Machine-Made Empathy? Why Medicine Still Needs Humans. *JAMA internal medicine*. https://doi.org/10.1001/jamainternmed.2023.4389

Warren-Smith, G. (2023). Knowledge Cues to Human Origins Facilitate Self-Disclosure During Interactions With Chatbots. https://doi.org/10.31234/osf.io/7qsdn

Zhai, C., & Wibowo, S. (2022). A Systematic Review on Cross-Culture, Humor and Empathy Dimensions in Conversational Chatbots: The Case of Second Language Acquisition. *Heliyon*. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.heliyon.2022.e12056