




# AI Usage in Academic Writing: Perspectives of Stakeholders

Mohammad. Aliakbari<sup>1</sup>, Pooria. Barzan<sup>1\*</sup>, Seyyed Pedram. Allahveysi<sup>2</sup>

<sup>1</sup> Department of English Language and Literature, Ilam University, Ilam, Iran

<sup>2</sup> Department of Language and Linguistics, University of Essex, Colchester, UK

\* Corresponding author email address: p.barzan@ilam.ac.ir

E d i t o r	R e v i e w e r s
Mehdi Purmohammad  Department of Cognitive Sciences, University of Alberta, Edmonton, Canada purmoham@ualberta.ca	Reviewer 1: Hooman Namvar  Assistant Professor, Department of Psychology, Saveh Branch, Islamic Azad University, Saveh, Iran. Email: hnamvar@iau-saveh.ac.ir Reviewer 2: Seyed Mohammad Hosseini  Assistant Professor, Department of Health and Rehabilitation in Sports, Shahid Beheshti University, Tehran, Iran. Email: moh_hosseini@sbu.ac.ir

## 1. Round 1

### 1.1 Reviewer 1

Reviewer:

The first paragraph of the Introduction contains a dense cluster of references (e.g., “(1, 2)...(3, 4)...(5, 6)”). Consider integrating these citations more fluidly into the text by linking them to specific claims or synthesizing their contributions to avoid overwhelming the reader.

In 2.1, you state: “This concern is amplified by the documented limitations of AI plagiarism detection and authorship attribution tools” without critically discussing why these limitations occur. Add a brief explanation (e.g., algorithmic training data or linguistic mimicry issues).

The shift from 2.3 (Student Perspectives) to “Algorithmic Bias, Surveillance, and Threats to Agency” is abrupt. Insert a clear transition sentence that links students’ ethical concerns to broader systemic ethical issues.

The sub-themes 2.4 and 2.5 could be merged or explicitly numbered. Currently, the subheading “Algorithmic Bias, Surveillance, and Threats to Agency” lacks a section number, which disrupts structural consistency.

In 2.7 you conclude, “The consensus points to a critical need for proactive, collaborative, and ethically grounded approaches...” without showing how the cited studies support this as a consensus. Qualify this as “several studies argue” or “an emerging consensus.”

In 5.3, the limitations paragraph is brief and general (“this study has limitations...focus on Iranian universities”). Expand to address potential researcher bias, language effects in interviews, and transferability limitations due to cultural context.

Author revised the manuscript and uploaded the updated document.

## 1.2 Reviewer 2

Reviewer:

The sentence “These factors create a unique context where AI adoption is both aspirational and fraught...” lacks concrete examples of these “factors.” Expand with a brief explanation (e.g., specific digital infrastructure issues or regulatory barriers in Iran).

The description of the conceptual model (“A simplified conceptual model guiding this study can be visualized as follows...”) is abstract and not visually supported. Include a figure of the model or a table outlining its components to improve clarity.

Some subsections (e.g., 2.1 and 2.2) are significantly longer than others (e.g., 2.3 and 2.4). Ensure more balanced treatment by expanding the shorter subsections or condensing the longer ones for consistent depth.

In 3.3, you mention “an interview guide was developed” but do not provide example questions. Including 2–3 sample questions will enhance transparency and replicability.

The results mostly highlight dominant perspectives. Discuss whether there were any deviant or negative cases (e.g., students completely rejecting AI or faculty fully embracing it) to enrich thematic depth.

In 5.1.2, you interpret critical thinking erosion but do not tie this back to educational theories (e.g., constructivism or self-regulated learning). Linking to such theories would strengthen conceptual depth.

Author revised the manuscript and uploaded the updated document.

## 2. Revised

Editor’s decision after revisions: Accepted.

Editor in Chief’s decision: Accepted.