




# Identification of Dimensions of the Innovation Model in the National Steel Industry by Integrating Thematic Analysis and Delphi Method

Naser. Mahmoudi<sup>1</sup>, Dariush. Mohamadi<sup>2\*</sup>, Masoumeh. Danesh Shaikh<sup>3</sup>


<sup>1</sup> PhD student, Department of Industrial Management, Qazvin Branch, Islamic Azad University, Qazvin, Iran

<sup>2</sup> Associate Professor, Department of Management, Faculty of Administrative Sciences and Economics, Isfahan University, Isfahan, Iran



<sup>3</sup> Assistant Professor, Department of Management, Qazvin Branch, Islamic Azad University, Qazvin, Iran

\* Corresponding author email address: d.mohamadi@ase.ui.ac.ir

## Editor

Khadijeh Irandoust  
Associate Professor, Department of  
Sport Sciences, Imam Khomeini  
International University, Qazvin,  
Iran  
irandoust@ikiu.ac.ir

## Reviewers

**Reviewer 1:** Mehrdad Bayat  
Assistant Professor, Department of Management, Payam Noor University, Tehran,  
Iran.  
Email: bayatmehrdad60@pnu.ac.ir  
**Reviewer 2:** Ali Sargolzaie  
Assistant Professor, Department of Management, Zahedan Branch, Islamic Azad  
University, Zahedan, Iran.  
Email: a.sargolzaie@iauzah.ac.ir

## 1. Round 1

### 1.1. Reviewer 1

Reviewer:

The introduction mentions, "These factors force organizations to choose between two options: succumb to failure and extinction... or undergo fundamental changes to remain competitive." Please provide a clearer link between this statement and the study's objective of identifying innovation model dimensions in the steel industry.

The methods section mentions using internal and external evaluation methods to ensure reliability. Elaborate on the specific steps taken during the external evaluation, including how the external evaluators were selected and the criteria they used to assess the coding quality.

The article notes, "After conducting 8 interviews, theoretical saturation was achieved." Please provide more detail on how theoretical saturation was determined and describe any specific indicators that showed saturation was reached.

The findings indicate "Thematic analysis is a research approach for interpreting textual data that uses a systematic coding process." It would be beneficial to include an example of how a specific theme or pattern was identified and interpreted from the data.

Authors revised the manuscript.

### 1.2. Reviewer 2

Reviewer:

While discussing the necessity of innovation, the statement "Innovation is vital for individuals, groups, and units in any organization" could benefit from additional references to support the claim. Consider citing recent studies that highlight the importance of innovation across various organizational levels.

The article states, "The sampling method in the expert community was judgmental sampling and the desired sample size was determined to be 20 people." Please provide a rationale for choosing judgmental sampling over other sampling methods and justify why 20 participants were deemed sufficient.

In describing the Delphi method, the article states, "Kendall's coefficient of concordance remained relatively stable indicating consensus was achieved." Specify the actual values of Kendall's coefficient across the rounds and explain the criteria used to determine stability and consensus.

The explanation of Table 2 mentions that "an average below 5 was the basis for eliminating factors." Clarify why a threshold of 5 was chosen and discuss its implications for the robustness of the findings.

The discussion compares the study's model to the five-helix innovation model by Barcelos-Paula et al. (2021). Provide a more detailed comparison, highlighting specific differences and similarities in the dimensions and indicators used.

Authors revised the manuscript.

## 2. Revised

Editor's decision after revisions: Accepted.

Editor in Chief's decision: Accepted.