




Formulation of a Qualitative Model for the Development of Organizational Citizenship Behavior and Its Managerial Solutions and Validation

Sara. Rezaeian¹, Fattah. Nazem^{2*}, Mohammad Naghi. Imani³

¹ Ph.D. Student of Educational Management, Department of Education, Roudehen Branch, Islamic Azad University, Tehran, Iran

² Associate Professor, Department of Education, Roudehen Branch, Islamic Azad University, Tehran, Iran



³ Assistant Professor, Department of Education, Roudehen Branch, Islamic Azad University, Tehran, Iran

* Corresponding author email address: nazem@riau.ac.ir

Editor

Rezvan Hosseingholizadeh
Associate Professor, Department of
Educational Management and
Human Resource Development,
Ferdowsi University of Mashhad,
Mashhad, Iran
rhgholizadeh@um.ac.ir

Reviewers

Reviewer 1: Manijeh Haghighinasab
Assistant Professor, Department of Management, Alzahra University, Tehran, Iran
Email: haghighinasab@srbiau.ac.ir
Reviewer 2: Mehrdad Bayat
Assistant Professor, Department of Management, Payam Noor University, Tehran,
Iran.
Email: bayatmehrdad60@pnu.ac.ir

1. Round 1

1.1. Reviewer 1

Reviewer:

Introduction - Paragraph 1: "The philosophy of an organization's existence is reliant on human life." This statement would benefit from a citation to support the claim about the foundational role of human life in organizational existence.

Introduction - Paragraph 2: Clarify the definition of "extra-role behaviors." The term is introduced without a clear definition, which might confuse readers unfamiliar with the concept.

Introduction - Paragraph 4: "Organizational loyalty" is categorized but not thoroughly explained. Provide more detailed examples of behaviors that constitute organizational loyalty.

Methodology - Sampling Section: The choice of "19 interviewees based on the principle of saturation" is stated. Explain how saturation was determined and if there were any specific criteria or methods used to assess it.

Methodology - Data Collection: The use of both a "synthesis research checklist and semi-structured interviews" is mentioned. Provide more detail on the development and validation of the synthesis research checklist.

Validity Assessment - Table 10: The use of a "one-sample t-test" is mentioned. Explain why this test was chosen over other possible statistical methods and how it specifically supports the validity of the model.

Discussion - Paragraph 2: The statement "align with prior results" should be followed by a more detailed comparison with specific studies cited, highlighting similarities and differences in findings.

Ethical Considerations: The ethical considerations section mentions "obtaining informed consent." Detail the process for obtaining informed consent and any measures taken to ensure participants' confidentiality and data security.

References: The reference list includes studies like "Berimani & Rezaei Paji, 2020." Ensure all references are formatted consistently according to the journal's guidelines and provide DOIs where available.

Authors revised the manuscript and uploaded the new document.

1.2. Reviewer 2

Reviewer:

Introduction - Literature Review: There are multiple citations in the introduction without sufficient context (e.g., "Nikookar et al., 2021"). Provide a brief summary of the key findings of these studies to better integrate them into your argument.

Methods - Semi-Structured Interviews: The phrase "a single question" is used. This might be misleading as typically semi-structured interviews involve several questions. Clarify the structure and content of the interview guide used.

Results - Thematic Analysis: The use of "Maxqda software" is mentioned briefly. Expand on the role of this software in your analysis, including specific functionalities that supported your coding and theme identification process.

Table 3 - Extracted Codes: The term "self-efficacy" is listed under "Citizenship Skill." Define this term and explain how self-efficacy was assessed and its relevance to OCB.

Methodology - Data Analysis: In the section detailing the coding process, the transition from open to axial and selective coding is described briefly. Include more information on how themes were identified and how the reliability of coding was ensured.

Findings - Individual Factors: The discussion on "individual characteristics" lacks specificity. Elaborate on which specific personality traits were found to influence OCB and how these were measured.

Findings - Educational Factors: "Educational quality" is identified as an influencing factor. Discuss specific elements of educational quality that were found to be significant and how they were measured or assessed.

Managerial Solutions - Command: The term "development of participatory culture" is used. Provide a clear definition and examples of what constitutes a participatory culture in this context.

Conceptual Model - Figure 1: The model presented is complex. Consider providing a step-by-step explanation of how each component of the model interacts and contributes to the development of OCB.

Conclusion - Recommendations: Recommendations based on the "objective dimension" are broad. Provide more specific actions or strategies that organizations can implement to encourage voluntary participation and other recommended behaviors.

Authors revised the manuscript and uploaded the new document.

2. Revised

Editor's decision after revisions: Accepted.

Editor in Chief's decision: Accepted.