

Article history: Received 30 September 2023 Accepted 24 November 2023 Published online 01 December 2023

International Journal of Innovation Management and Organizational Behavior

Open Peer-Review Report



Identification of Flexible Human Resource Management Components and Examination of Its Impact on Operational Performance with the Moderating Role of Organizational Ambidexterity

Mundher Abbas. ShaalanTaraf¹^(b), Ghasem. Eslami^{1*}^(b), Fariborz. Rahimnia¹^(b), Mohammad Mehdi. Farahi¹^(b)

¹ Department of Management, Economics and Administrative Sciences, Ferdowsi University of Mashhad, Mashhad, Iran

* Corresponding author email address: gh.eslami@um.ac.ir

Editor	R e v i e w e r s
Abbas Monavarian	Reviewer 1: Manijeh Haghighinasab
Professor, Management	Assistant Professor, Department of Management, Alzahra University, Tehran, Iran
Department, Tehran University,	Email: haghighinasab@srbiau.ac.ir
Tehran, Iran.	Reviewer 2: Mehrdad Bayat
Email: amonavar@ut.ac.ir	Assistant Professor, Department of Management, Payam Noor University, Tehran,
	Iran. Email: bayatmehrdad60@pnu.ac.ir

1. Round 1

1.1. Reviewer 1

Reviewer:

"Human resources are a central element in any organization..." - This opening paragraph could benefit from including specific data or statistics that highlight the importance of human resources in organizations. For example, a statistic about the percentage of companies that prioritize human resource management in their strategic planning would strengthen the argument.

"Competition in global and local markets no longer depends solely on cost, quality, and services but has shifted towards flexibility." - This statement should be supported by more recent and specific examples from the industry to illustrate the shift towards flexibility in global and local markets.

"The present research, in terms of its orientation, is categorized as developmental research and its governing paradigm is pragmatism..." - Clarify the rationale for choosing a developmental research approach and the pragmatism paradigm. What specific aspects of these approaches make them suitable for this study?

"The qualitative analysis strategy in this study involves using a systematic review and the Delphi panel method..." - It would be beneficial to elaborate on how the Delphi panel method was conducted, including the criteria for selecting experts, the number of rounds, and how consensus was reached.

"The sample size, based on the judgmental method and the principle of theoretical saturation, was determined to be 20 individuals." - Provide more details about the judgmental method used to determine the sample size and why 20 individuals were considered sufficient for achieving theoretical saturation.

"The first requirement for conducting a systematic review was selecting relevant keywords..." - Include a brief description of the databases or sources from which the literature was reviewed, and how these sources were selected to ensure comprehensiveness and relevance.

"Survey Data Validity Check Results" - Include a discussion on the reliability and validity measures used, such as Cronbach's alpha, and explain why these measures are appropriate for the study.

"Survey Data Validity Check Results" - The figure should be accompanied by a more detailed explanation of the model fit indices (e.g., CFI, RMSEA) and what these indices indicate about the model's validity.

"The results of the qualitative section of the research identified and confirmed six components..." - Compare the findings with similar studies in different contexts to highlight the unique contributions of this study and discuss any similarities or differences.

"Regarding the obtained results, there is little possibility for comparison with Persian studies..." - Expand on this comparison by discussing any relevant international studies that might provide a broader context for the findings.

"Theoretically, these results align with the resource-based theory..." - Provide a more in-depth discussion on how the findings support the resource-based theory, including specific examples from the study that illustrate this alignment.

"Based on the qualitative results of the research, it is suggested that relevant managers consider all types of flexibility..." -Offer more specific, actionable steps that managers can take to implement the recommendations provided, along with any potential challenges and solutions.

Authors revised the manuscripts.

1.2. Reviewer 2

IJIMOB

Reviewer:

"Organizational ambidexterity, by effectively identifying intellectual assets, enables organizations to increase profitability and ensure survival." - This paragraph would benefit from a brief definition of organizational ambidexterity for clarity, especially for readers who may not be familiar with the term.

"In Iraq, particularly in the manufacturing sector..." - The introduction of the Iraqi manufacturing sector context should include more detailed background information about the current state of the sector, such as its size, economic impact, and specific challenges it faces.

"Results of Systematic Literature Review" - The table should include a brief explanation of how the frequency of each indicator was determined and what criteria were used to include or exclude studies from the final sample.

"To finalize and confirm the localized components of flexible human resource management in Iraq's manufacturing sector..." - Provide a more detailed explanation of how the final components were categorized into six groups and the rationale behind the naming of each component.

"Kendall's Coordination Coefficient in the Second Stage of Delphi" - Explain the significance of Kendall's W and why it was chosen as the statistical test for confirming the indicators. Also, discuss the implications of the coordination coefficient value obtained.

"Field data collection from 238 respondents revealed that the majority of respondents were male..." - Discuss the potential impact of the demographic characteristics of the respondents on the study's findings and whether the sample is representative of the larger population.



"One of the most significant limitations is the research context or case study..." - Discuss how future research could address these limitations, such as by expanding the study to include other types of organizations or using more objective measures of operational performance.

"In order to correct and improve the academic writing of our paper we have used the language model ChatGPT." - Consider adding a brief explanation of how ChatGPT was used in the revision process and any specific areas it helped to improve, ensuring transparency in the use of AI tools in academic writing.

Authors revised the manuscripts.

2. Revised

Editor's decision: Accepted. Editor in Chief's decision: Accepted.

