

Transformational Leadership and Its Effects on Employee Creativity and Innovation: A Qualitative Analysis in Commercial Organizations

Fatemeh. Rahmani^{1*}, Mohtaram. Jafarian², Azam. Sedighi³, Mehdi. Hasanzadeh Hozsorkhi⁴, Seyed Sohbat Ollah. Alavi⁵

¹ Department of Sociology, Khomeinishahr Branch, Islamic Azad University, Khomeinishahr /Isfahan, Iran

² Department of Executive Management, Babol Branch, Islamic Azad University, Mazandaran, Iran

³ Department of Public Administration, Allameh Tabataba'i University, Tehran, Tehran

⁴ Department of Mechanical Engineering, Torbat-e-Jam Branch, Islamic Azad University, Torbat-e-Jam, Iran

⁵ Department of Public Administration, Bonab Branch, Islamic Azad University, East Azerbaijan, Iran

* Corresponding author email address: fatemehrahmani.135942@gmail.com

Editor

Aliakbar Aminbeidokhti^{id}
Educational Administration, Faculty
of Psychology and Educational
Sciences, Semnan University,
Semnan, Iran
kafashpor@um.ac.ir

Reviewers

Reviewer 1: Ali Sargolzaie^{id}
Assistant Professor, Department of Management, Zahedan Branch, Islamic Azad University, Zahedan, Iran.
Email: a.sargolzaie@iauzah.ac.ir
Reviewer 2: Hamid Rezaiefar^{id}
Assistant Professor, Department of Management, Birjand Branch, Islamic Azad University, Birjand, Iran.
Email: h.rezaiefar@iaubir.ac.ir

1. Round 1

1.1. Reviewer 1

Reviewer:

The discussion of “green transformational leadership” is well-placed but somewhat tangential. You might explicitly connect how this subfield relates to the current study’s focus on commercial organizations in Tehran.

The sentence “The study utilizes a purposive sampling strategy, selecting 24 participants...” should include more justification for the number 24 beyond theoretical saturation. Were there practical constraints (e.g., access, organizational size)?

The demographics are well-described, but the educational distribution could be contextualized. For example, how typical is it for commercial organizations in Tehran to employ 12 participants with doctoral degrees?

The sentence “This study supports these insights by demonstrating that individualized consideration...” could be enriched by linking explicitly to cultural expectations of mentorship in Iran, which may differ from Western contexts.

Authors revised the manuscript and uploaded the new document.

1.2. Reviewer 2

Reviewer:

The statement “This study seeks to explore the effects... by conducting a qualitative analysis of employees’ experiences in Tehran” is clear, but it would be strengthened by explicitly stating the unique contribution compared to prior Iranian or regional studies.

The table is rich in subcategories, but some overlap exists. For example, “Trust in Leadership” under Inspirational Motivation overlaps conceptually with “Building Trust” under Idealized Influence. Consider clarifying distinctions or consolidating categories.

The participant quote “When our leader talks about the company’s vision...” is illustrative. However, please provide identifiers (e.g., P3, male, 35) for transparency and to allow readers to track demographic variety in quotations.

You mention “Participants shared that leaders who encouraged critical thinking...” but the discussion relies heavily on confirming prior studies. Please highlight any contradictory or unexpected findings.

Authors revised the manuscript and uploaded the new document.

2. Revised

Editor’s decision after revisions: Accepted.

Editor in Chief’s decision: Accepted.