




Identification of Criteria and Indicators of the "Paternal Home" Metaphor in Public Organizations

Ghasem. Yazdanpanah¹, Davood. Kiakojoori^{2*}, Mohammad Javad. Tghipourian³

¹ PhD Student, Department of Management, Chalous Branch, Islamic Azad University, Chalous, Iran

² Associate Professor, Department of Public Administration, Chalous Branch, Islamic Azad University, Chalous, Iran



³ Assistant Professor, Department of Management, Chalos Branch, Islamic Azad University, Chalos, Iran

* Corresponding author email address: Davoodkia@iauc.ac.ir

Editor

Rezvan Hosseingholizadeh
Associate Professor, Department of
Educational Management and
Human Resource Development,
Ferdowsi University of Mashhad,
Mashhad, Iran
rhgholizadeh@um.ac.ir

Reviewers

Reviewer 1: Lourdes Atiaja Atiaja
Universidad de las Fuerzas Armadas ESPE, Ecuador.
Email: natiaja@espe.edu.ec
Reviewer 2: Marco Yamba-Yugsi
Unidad Académica de Posgrado, Universidad Católica de Cuenca, Azuay 010101,
Ecuador
Email: marco.yamba@ucacue.edu.ec

1. Round 1

1.1. Reviewer 1

Reviewer:

The sentence "Examples of such disruptive behaviors include indiscipline frequent absenteeism delinquency misconduct anti-organizational behavior and sabotage" would benefit from the inclusion of more recent examples and references. Consider citing more recent studies to enhance relevance and credibility.

In "Data saturation was achieved after conducting nine semi-structured interviews," it would be beneficial to describe how saturation was determined. Was it based on the recurrence of themes or another method?

The description of Colaizzi's seven-step method is well done, but consider providing a brief example of how a specific piece of data was transformed through these steps. This will illustrate the process more concretely.

The criteria for "managerial modeling" and "managerial consideration" are well-defined, but the indicators could be more specific. For instance, under "managerial consideration," you could add "actively seeking employee input during decision-making processes."

Under "employee altruism," the indicators are a bit repetitive. Distinguish between willingness to help and actual instances of helping behavior to provide clearer differentiation.

Authors revised the manuscript and uploaded the new document.

1.2. Reviewer 2

Reviewer:

"Therefore scholars in management have so far proposed various metaphors to aid in understanding organizations" could be expanded to specify the key metaphors and their unique contributions to organizational studies. This will help frame the importance of the "Paternal Home" metaphor in context.

The sentence "The participants in this study were experts and specialists in managerial metaphors selected using purposive sampling" needs further clarification. Specify the criteria used for purposive sampling and justify why these criteria were chosen to strengthen the selection process.

The criterion "organizational integrity" includes "fair performance of tasks," which is somewhat vague. Clarify what constitutes "fair performance" with specific examples or benchmarks.

The discussion would benefit from a comparison with existing models and theories. For instance, how does the "Paternal Home" metaphor compare with the "Learning Organization" or Theory Z in practical applications?

The practical implications of the findings are not fully explored. Discuss how public organizations can implement these findings and the potential challenges they may face.

The conclusion could be strengthened by summarizing the key findings more succinctly and emphasizing the novel contributions of this study to the field of organizational behavior.

Authors revised the manuscript and uploaded the new document.

2. Revised

Editor's decision after revisions: Accepted.

Editor in Chief's decision: Accepted.