




# Identifying Components and Examining Causal Relationships of Optimal Budgeting in Iran's Education System

Reza. Basami <sup>1</sup>, Samad. Borzooian Shirvan <sup>2\*</sup>, Adel. Fatemi <sup>3</sup>

<sup>1</sup> Ph.D student of Systems Management, Department of Industrial Management, Sanandaj Branch, Islamic Azad University, Sanandaj, Iran

<sup>2</sup> Assistant Professor, Department of Management and Educational Planning, Allameh Tabatabai University, Tehran, Iran



<sup>3</sup> Associate Professor, Department of Statistics, Sanandaj Branch, Islamic Azad University, Sanandaj, Iran

\* Corresponding author email address: borzooian@atu.ac.ir

## Editor

Azar Kafashpoor   
Professor, Department of Educational Management and Human Resource Development, Ferdowsi University of Mashhad, Mashhad, Iran  
kafashpor@um.ac.ir

## Reviewers

**Reviewer 1:** Masoud Hoseinchari   
Associate Professor, Department of Educational Sciences, Shiraz University, Shiraz, Iran. Email: hchari@shirazu.ac.ir  
**Reviewer 2:** Alinaghi Amiri   
Professor, Management Department, Tehran University, Tehran, Iran.  
Email: anamiri@ut.ac.ir

## 1. Round 1

### 1.1. Reviewer 1

Reviewer:

In the paragraph starting with "Investment in education is a key factor in the development process...", the historical context could benefit from more recent data. Consider updating references or including more current statistics to reflect recent trends.

In Table 1, "Components and Sub-components of Optimal Budgeting in Iran's Education System", ensure that the definitions of the sub-components are clear and distinct. Some terms like "Performance Evaluation Ability" and "Human Resource Ability" might need further clarification.

The presentation of fuzzy means in the findings should include a brief explanation of what these means represent and how they were calculated. This would help readers unfamiliar with fuzzy logic.

The discussion would benefit from a comparison with other countries' educational budgeting systems. How does Iran's system compare with those in countries with similar economic and social contexts?

Authors revised the manuscript and uploaded the new document.

### 1.2. Reviewer 2

Reviewer:

The sentence "The resource allocation process organizes available resources with organizational mission processes." is somewhat vague. Clarify how the resource allocation process specifically aligns with organizational missions and processes.

The methodology section should include more detail about the sampling method. For instance, explain why 16 experts were chosen and how they were selected to ensure representativeness and reliability.

In the paragraph describing the Delphi fuzzy method, provide more context about why this method was chosen over other possible methods. What advantages does it offer for this particular study?

The description of the pairwise comparison questionnaire could be expanded. Include an example question or a description of how the questions were structured to evaluate the components and sub-components.

The discussion of the DEMATEL method could be enhanced by explaining the normalization process for the direct impact matrix. Provide a brief overview of how normalization affects the results.

In Table 4, "Influence and Importance of Components", consider adding a brief explanation of the terms "D", "R", "D-R", and "D+R" to ensure clarity for readers who may not be familiar with these metrics.

The statement "enhancing the Authority (AUT) component can influence the other components leading to improved budgeting" should be supported with specific examples or case studies that illustrate how enhancing AUT has led to positive outcomes in similar contexts.

Authors revised the manuscript and uploaded the new document.

## 2. Revised

Editor's decision after revisions: Accepted.

Editor in Chief's decision: Accepted.