

Article history: Received 26 March 2023 Accepted 27 May 2023 Published online 10 June 2023

# International Journal of Innovation Management and Organizational Behavior

Open Peer-Review Report

International Journal of Innovation Management and Organizational Echavior

Publisher Extends

International Journal of Innovation Management and Organizational Echavior

Publisher Extends

Publisher Extends

E-ISSN: 3041-8992

# The Effect of Brand Sensory Experience on Brand Equity with the Mediating Variable of Customer Satisfaction and Moderation of Employees' Empathy (in Bodybuilding Clubs in Tehran)

Mahdi. Abdollahpour 10, Farideh. Ashrafganjouei 1\*0, Zahra. Hajianzahaei 10

\* Corresponding author email address: Ganjuei@yahoo.com

| Editor                          | Reviewers   |
|---------------------------------|---|
| Azar Kafashpoor <sup>®</sup>    | Reviewer 1: Masoud Hoseinchari  |
| Professor, Department of        | Associate Professor, Department of Educational Sciences, Shiraz University, Shiraz, |
| Educational Management and      | Iran. Email: hchari@shirazu.ac.ir   |
| Human Resource Development,     | Reviewer 2: Ali Sargolzaie <sup>®</sup>   |
| Ferdowsi University of Mashhad, | Assistant Professor, Department of Management, Zahedan Branch, Islamic Azad         |
| Mashhad, Iran                   | University, Zahedan, Iran.  |
| kafashpor@um.ac.ir              | Email: a.sargolzaie@iauzah.ac.ir  |

## 1. Round 1

### 1.1. Reviewer 1

#### Reviewer:

The sentence "This challenge is particularly evident in the service sector due to the distinct nature of services and the numerous touchpoints between service brands and their customers" should include references to support the claim about the distinct nature of services.

There are multiple placeholder references (e.g., "; ; ; "). Please replace these with the appropriate citations to ensure the arguments are well-supported.

The explanation of software used for data analysis (SPSS, SamplePower, SmartPLS) should specify why each software was chosen and for which specific analyses.

The descriptive statistics provided (e.g., gender distribution, age range) are useful, but it would be beneficial to include more detailed demographic information, such as socio-economic status or geographic distribution, to understand the sample better.

The tables should have titles that clearly describe what is being shown. For example, "Table 1: Multicollinearity Estimation Using Tolerance Index and Variance Inflation Factor" should be clearly labeled in the table title.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Department of Sport Management, Central Tehran Branch, Islamic Azad University, Tehran, Iran



The composite reliability (CR) and average variance extracted (AVE) values are provided, but their interpretation is missing. Please add a brief discussion on how these values support the reliability and validity of the constructs.

The statement "Brand sensory experience has a positive and significant effect on brand equity" should include the specific statistical values (e.g., path coefficients, t-values) to support this conclusion.

When discussing the effect sizes, it would be helpful to reference Cohen's guidelines or other relevant benchmarks to provide context for what constitutes a small, medium, or large effect.

The comparison to other studies (e.g., "These findings align with the studies of Şahin et al. (2013)") should include a brief summary of the referenced studies' findings to provide a clearer comparison.

The recommendation that "bodybuilding clubs can improve customer satisfaction by selecting appropriate business policies" should be expanded with specific examples of such policies or strategies.

Authors revised the manuscript.

#### 1.2. Reviewer 2

#### Reviewer:

The sentence "However, some researchers suggest that the sensory dimension is particularly important in the context of services and even more so in the sports industry" should include specific examples or studies that highlight the importance of the sensory dimension in the sports industry.

The phrase "The sports industry is currently undergoing a profound revolution" would benefit from a more detailed explanation or specific examples of the changes occurring in the sports industry to provide context for this statement.

The description of the questionnaires used is vague. Please include the specific items or at least a sample item from each questionnaire to give readers a better understanding of the measurement tools.

The method of random selection should be detailed further. Explain the process of random selection and any measures taken to ensure it was random and representative.

The statement "Validity and factor analysis of the questionnaires were confirmed" should include the methods used to confirm validity and factor analysis results, including factor loadings and model fit indices.

The claim that "employee empathy has a positive and significant effect on customer satisfaction" should be discussed in more detail, possibly including practical examples of how empathy can be demonstrated in a sports club context.

The inverse moderating role of employee empathy should be explored further. It would be beneficial to discuss why this might be the case and any theoretical or practical implications.

Authors revised the manuscript.

#### 2. Revised

Editor's decision: Accepted.

Editor in Chief's decision: Accepted.