

Article history: Received 27 March 2023 Accepted 08 June 2023 Published online 10 June 2023

# International Journal of Innovation Management and Organizational Behavior

**Open Peer-Review Report** 



E-ISSN: 3041-8992

# Identifying and Analyzing Individual Factors in Creating a Conducive Environment for Retaining Human Capital and Enhancing Organizational Productivity

Saam. Sepehri 10, Sanjar. Salajeghe 2\*0, Hamid Reza. Mollaie 30, Saeed. Sayadi 30, Zahra. Shokoh 30

- <sup>1</sup> PhD Student, Department of Management, Kerman Branch, Islamic Azad University, Kerman, Iran
- <sup>2</sup> Associate Professor, Department of Management, Kerman Branch, Islamic Azad University, Kerman, Iran

#### \* Corresponding author email address: s.salajeghe@iauk.ac.ir

Editor	I	Reviewers
Mohammed Abdul Imran Khan <sup>®</sup>		Reviewer 1: Lourdes Atiaja Atiaja
Department of Fi	nancial U	Universidad de las Fuerzas Armadas ESPE, Ecuador. Email: natiaja@espe.edu.ec
Management and Econ	nomics, 1	Reviewer 2: Alireza Rajabipoor Meybodi <sup>®</sup>
Dhofar University, Oman		Associate Professor, Department of Business Administration, Yazd University,
mimran@du.edu.om		Yazd, Iran Email: Rajabipoor@yazd.ac.ir

### 1. Round 1

#### 1.1. Reviewer 1

#### Reviewer:

Comment: The introduction section should be more concise in laying out the problem statement and research objectives. Consider condensing the sentences: "Human capital is widely recognized as a key driver of organizational success. Employees' skills, knowledge, and abilities are vital for achieving competitive advantage and sustaining organizational performance (Danneels & Sethi, 2011)" into a more streamlined form.

Suggestion: Simplify the initial statements to quickly engage the reader with the main research problem.

Comment: The methodology section mentions the use of NVivo software but lacks detail on how the software was specifically used.

Suggestion: Provide a brief explanation of the steps taken during data analysis using NVivo, such as coding and theme development processes.

Comment: The themes identified (equal job opportunities, creative environment, etc.) are listed but lack depth in explanation. Suggestion: For each theme, provide a more detailed explanation and examples from the data to illustrate each theme.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Assistant Professor, Department of Management, Kerman Branch, Islamic Azad University, Kerman, Iran



Comment: In Table 1, the subcategories and concepts are listed without much context.

Suggestion: Provide a brief explanation or example for each subcategory to enhance understanding.

Comment: There are very few direct quotes from participants in the findings section.

Suggestion: Include direct quotes from participants to illustrate key points and add depth to the findings.

Comment: The discussion section needs to more explicitly connect findings to practical implications for NGOs.

Suggestion: Clearly articulate how the findings can be applied in practice and suggest specific actions that NGOs can take.

Comment: The discussion could benefit from a stronger comparison with existing literature.

Suggestion: Compare and contrast your findings with those of other studies more thoroughly to highlight the contribution of your research.

Comment: The conclusion section reiterates the findings but could be more powerful.

Suggestion: Emphasize the significance of your findings and suggest areas for future research.

Authors revised the manuscript.

#### 1.2. Reviewer 2

#### Reviewer:

Comment: In the paragraph starting with "Equal job opportunities are fundamental..." (page 2), the integration of literature could be more seamless.

Suggestion: Rather than listing studies, synthesize the findings into a narrative that directly supports your argument about the importance of equal job opportunities.

Comment: The rationale for selecting the sample size and the specific participants (NIOC elites, consultants, and external advisors) needs more justification.

Suggestion: Explain why these specific groups were chosen and how they contribute uniquely to the research findings.

Comment: While participant demographics are briefly mentioned, a more detailed table or description would be helpful.

Suggestion: Include a table summarizing participant demographics (age, gender, role) for clarity.

Comment: The term "theoretical saturation" is mentioned but not explained.

Suggestion: Briefly define theoretical saturation and describe how it was determined that saturation was achieved.

Comment: The specific research questions are not clearly outlined in the introduction.

Suggestion: Explicitly state the research questions at the end of the introduction to guide the reader.

Comment: The data collection methods section mentions semi-structured interviews but lacks details on the interview guide.

Suggestion: Include an appendix with the interview guide or a brief overview of the key questions asked.

Authors revised the manuscript.

## 2. Revised

Editor's decision: Accepted.

Editor in Chief's decision: Accepted.

IJIMOB
Interestival learned of limensions Variagement and Populational Delastic

E-ISSN: 3041-8992