

Providing a Regional Policy-Making Ecosystem Model for the Ministry of Health and Medical Education of Iran

Seyed Ashraf, Mohammadpoor Fallah Nyakoyi¹, Seyyed Hamed. Hashemi^{2*}, Poran. Sorati³


¹ Ph.D. student, Department of Management, Astara Branch, Islamic Azad University, Astara, Iran

² Assistant Professor, Public Administration, Payam Noor University, Tehran, Iran



³ Assistant Professor, Department of Management, Astara Branch, Islamic Azad University, Astara, Iran

* Corresponding author email address: hamed.hashemi@pnu.ac.ir

Editor

Leila Youzbashi¹
Department of sport science,
Faculty of Humanities, University
of Zanjan, Zanjan, Iran
l.youzbashi@znu.ac.ir

Reviewers

Reviewer 1: Masoud Mirmoezi¹
Department of Physical Education and Sport Sciences, Islamic Azad University,
Central Tehran Branch, Tehran, Iran. Email: massoudmirmoezi@live.com
Reviewer 2: Seyed Mohammad Hosseini¹
Assistant Professor, Department of Health and Rehabilitation in Sports, Shahid
Beheshti University, Tehran, Iran. Email: moh_hosseini@sbu.ac.ir

1. Round 1

1.1. Reviewer 1

Reviewer:

"Health is one of the most important aspects of human life and is a central pillar of social development making it a crucial component of social policy-making." - This sentence would benefit from citations supporting the claim that health is a central pillar of social development. Including specific references to foundational studies or reports by the World Health Organization or other authoritative bodies would strengthen the argument.

"The statistical population of this study consisted of experts in the Ministry of Health and Medical Education." - Please specify the criteria used to define an 'expert'. Were there specific qualifications or years of experience required? Clarifying this will help readers understand the expertise level of the participants.

"The (process value network) was identified as the most influential component of the regional policy-making ecosystem for the Ministry of Health and Medical Education of Iran." - The term 'process value network' should be defined more clearly. Providing a detailed description or example would help readers grasp its significance and application.

"These factors influencing the regional policy-making ecosystem for the Ministry of Health and Medical Education of Iran may lead to further development and success of this organization." - Consider discussing how these factors compare to those identified in other countries or contexts. This comparative analysis could provide deeper insights into the unique challenges and opportunities in Iran.

"Health system reform as a strategic issue worldwide involves making sustainable and targeted changes to increase efficiency equity and effectiveness in the health sector." - The phrase "strategic issue worldwide" would be more impactful with examples from specific countries or regions that have undergone significant health system reforms.

"In this study qualitative data is first collected based on the grounded theory research strategy followed by quantitative data collection using the survey research strategy." - It would be beneficial to provide more details on how the grounded theory was applied, including the specific steps taken to ensure the robustness of the qualitative data analysis.

The table presents various factors but lacks a clear explanation of how each factor was derived from the data. Including a brief description of the coding process and how these factors emerged from the data would enhance transparency and reproducibility.

"This stage involved distilling and summarizing the vast amount of information obtained from interviews and documents into concepts and categories that are similar in these questions." - Consider providing an example of how raw data from interviews was transformed into concepts and categories. This would help readers understand the analytical process better.

"Due to the lack of regional planning many health and medical resources have not been identified or utilized." - This statement would benefit from specific examples or case studies that illustrate the consequences of inadequate regional planning. Such examples could make the argument more compelling.

The figure is crucial for understanding the study's findings, but it would be more effective if accompanied by a detailed explanation of each component's role and its interconnections with other components.

Authors revised the manuscript and uploaded the new document.

1.2. Reviewer 2

Reviewer:

"After coding these factors interviews with experts will be conducted to identify the factors mentioned..." - The term 'coding' needs to be clarified. Describe the coding framework used and how inter-coder reliability was ensured, if applicable.

"Finally it was observed that 3 participants (15%) were between 30 to 40 years old 8 participants (40%) were between 40 to 50 years old and 9 participants (45%) were over 50 years old." - Consider discussing the potential impact of the age distribution of participants on the study's findings. Does the age of the experts influence their perspectives on policy-making?

"Therefore attention to health and efforts to maintain and improve it have always been a priority." - This broad statement would be strengthened by historical or contemporary examples of significant health initiatives in Iran or other relevant contexts.

"Unfortunately many developing and middle-income countries do not move in a coordinated and balanced manner toward the growth and development of health facilities..." - This critique should be supported by specific references to studies or reports that document these trends, adding credibility to the argument.

"This research aims to provide a model for a regional policy-making ecosystem for the Ministry of Health of Iran..." - It would be helpful to summarize the key components of this model briefly in the conclusion, highlighting how they interrelate and their anticipated impact.

"Health is a broad concept and according to the World Health Organization's latest definition health is complete physical mental and social well-being not merely the absence of disease and infirmity." - While this definition is well-known, providing the specific WHO source and year of this definition would be useful for readers.

"Following the interviews coding was conducted." - Detail the software or manual methods used for coding and how consistency was maintained across different coders or coding sessions.

"The Ministry of Health and Medical Education on behalf of the government is responsible for health sector governance which is reflected in policy-making..." - This would be a good place to discuss how governance structures in Iran's health sector compare with those in other countries. Such a comparison could provide context for the unique challenges faced.

Authors revised the manuscript and uploaded the new document.

2. Revised

Editor's decision after revisions: Accepted.

Editor in Chief's decision: Accepted.