A Comparative Study of Ethnic Discrimination in Employment Law in Iraq and Iran

Dashti. Sedeeq Mohammad[1] , Hana. Farkish[2]* , Arkan. Sharifi[2]

[1] PhD Student in General Law, Department of Law, Science and Research Branch, Islamic Azad University, Tehran , Iran
[2] Assistant Professor, Department of Law, Sanandaj Branch, Islamic Azad University, Sanandaj, Iran

* Corresponding author email address: Hanehfarkish@gmail.com

Editor	Reviewers
Khaliquzzaman Khan	**Reviewer 1:** Asghar Jafari
Associate Professor, School of Business Administration, Al Dar University College, United Arab Emirates kaliquzzaman.khan@aue.ae	Associate Professor, Department of Psychology, Kashan University, Iran. Email: as_jafari@sbu.ac.ir
	Reviewer 2: Mojtaba Tamadoni
	Assistant Professor, Department of Psychology, South Tehran Branch, Islamic Azad University, Tehran, Iran. m_tamadoni@azad.ac.ir

1. Round 1

1.1. Reviewer 1

Reviewer:

In the introduction, the term "ethnic discrimination" is used frequently. It would be beneficial to include a clear definition of what constitutes ethnic discrimination in the context of employment law to ensure a common understanding among readers.

In the paragraph discussing Iraq's dual government system, there is a mention of "the Geneva Justice Center reports documented cases of direct or indirect human rights violations." This statement requires specific citations to the Geneva Justice Center's reports to substantiate the claim.

The section on Iran's "Executive Mechanisms for Enforcing the Prohibition of Ethnic Discrimination in Employment" is vague regarding the specific bodies or committees responsible for enforcement. Providing more details on these entities and their roles would strengthen this section.

The article references laws from 1960 and 1987 when discussing Iraqi employment rights. It would be beneficial to either update this with more recent legislation or clearly explain how these older laws are still relevant and enforced today.

The conclusion acknowledges the existence of ethnic discrimination in both countries but does not provide recommendations for addressing these issues. Including actionable recommendations would enhance the practical relevance of the study.

Authors revised the manuscript and uploaded the new document.

1.2. Reviewer 2

Reviewer:

The Concepts section introduces "individual, organizational, and systemic" levels of discrimination but lacks examples or detailed explanations. Including examples of how these manifest in the employment context in Iraq and Iran would enhance understanding.

The paragraph stating, "In judicial proceedings, efforts are made to prevent ethnic discrimination," is followed by examples of discrimination. This creates an inconsistency. Consider restructuring this section to first acknowledge the legal framework's intentions and then discuss the discrepancies in implementation.

The comparison between Iraqi and Iranian laws on ethnic discrimination could be more robust. The article could benefit from a more detailed comparison that includes specific cases or examples where these laws have been applied, highlighting both similarities and differences.

In the section discussing Iran's employment practices, you mention that "non-Muslims face discrimination." It would be helpful to include a specific case or example to illustrate how this discrimination manifests in the workplace.

The methodology section mentions the use of "secondary sources including reports from human rights organizations." Please specify which organizations were consulted and how their reports were used in the analysis. This will add credibility to the research process.

Authors revised the manuscript and uploaded the new document.

2. Revised

Editor's decision after revisions: Accepted.
Editor in Chief's decision: Accepted.