

Identifying Influential Factors in the Personal Development Program for National Bank Managers


Mahdi. Afshari¹, Nader. Soleimani^{2*}, Hamid. Shafizadeh²

¹ PhD student in educational management, Marand Branch, Islamic Azad University, Marand, Iran



² Associate Professor, Educational Management Department, Garmsar Branch, Islamic Azad University, Garmsar, Iran

* Corresponding author email address: drnasoleimani@yahoo.com

Editor

Aliakbar Aminbeidokhti¹
Educational Administration, Faculty
of Psychology and Educational
Sciences, Semnan University,
Semnan, Iran
kafashpor@um.ac.ir

Reviewers

Reviewer 1: Mehrdad Bayat¹
Assistant Professor, Department of Management, Payam Noor University, Tehran,
Iran.
Email: bayatmehrdad60@pnu.ac.ir
Reviewer 2: Alinaghi Amiri¹
Professor, Management Department, Tehran University, Tehran, Iran.
Email: anamiri@ut.ac.ir

1. Round 1

1.1. Reviewer 1

Reviewer:

The sentence "Visualizing the current status and depicting the desired state along with designing a roadmap between the present condition and the ideal state constitutes the essential elements of a PDP" should include citations for "visualizing the current status" and "depicting the desired state" to strengthen the theoretical framework and provide evidence from existing literature.

The assertion "Neglecting individual development has undesirable consequences" should be followed by empirical evidence or case studies demonstrating these consequences. This will enhance the argument and provide a more compelling rationale for the study.

The description of the semi-structured interview process should include specific examples of questions asked during the interviews. Additionally, explain how the interview questions align with the research objectives.

In the section discussing causal factors, explain how each identified factor (e.g., motivation, willingness to learn) influences the PDP. Use direct quotes from the interviews to support these explanations.

The statement "The study sought to address the necessity of research and fill the existing gap in scientific and experiential research concerning managers' personal development" should specify the identified gaps. Reference previous studies that have highlighted these gaps to contextualize the contribution of the current research.

The phrase "factors influencing managers' personal development are categorized into three main components" should be followed by a discussion of the relative importance of these components. Include a comparison with findings from similar studies to provide context.

The assertion "The research findings indicated that among organizational factors, human resource performance...affect personal development" should be supported with statistical data or qualitative excerpts that highlight the impact of these factors.

Authors revised the manuscript.

1.2. Reviewer 2

Reviewer:

The statement "This aligns with organizational objectives and employees in close collaboration with their supervisors" lacks clarity. Specify how the PDP aligns with organizational objectives and describe the mechanisms through which employees collaborate with supervisors, supported by examples or evidence.

In the phrase "Various methods exist for employee development; however, the PDP is considered one of the most beneficial and efficient methods," provide a comparative analysis of different employee development methods. Include references to studies that support the superiority of the PDP.

The statement "The validity of the research was confirmed using methods such as member checking, triangulation of data sources, peer review, and observer audits" should include detailed descriptions of how each method was implemented. Specify the number of member checks conducted, the data sources triangulated, and the criteria for peer review and observer audits.

The sentence "For data analysis, coding was used, a method of reducing and analyzing data" is vague. Elaborate on the coding process, including the software used, the coding scheme, and examples of how codes were derived from the data.

The table presenting the paradigmatic model should be accompanied by a detailed explanation of each category and subcategory. Provide examples from the data to illustrate how each dimension was identified and categorized.

The recommendation "organizations should employ human resource management strategies for enriching and developing management" should include specific strategies. Provide examples of successful implementations from other organizations to demonstrate the practicality and effectiveness of these strategies.

The statement "Developed managers in the banking services sector...significantly impact performance indicators and business outcomes" should be substantiated with data. Include case studies or statistical evidence that illustrate the correlation between manager development and organizational performance.

The conclusion should summarize the key findings and their implications for practice. Discuss how the findings can be applied in other organizational contexts beyond the National Bank of Iran.

Authors revised the manuscript.

2. Revised

Editor's decision after revisions: Accepted.

Editor in Chief's decision: Accepted.