






# Macro Framework Design for Policies on Developing and Expanding Employment Opportunities for Higher Education Graduates in the Country

Malek. Shokri<sup>1</sup> , Jafar. Beikzad<sup>2\*</sup> , Alireza. Islambolchi<sup>3\*</sup> , Rostam. Gharehdaghi<sup>4</sup> , Kambiz. Hamidi<sup>5</sup> 

<sup>1</sup> PhD Student, Department of Management, Hamadan Branch, Islamic Azad University, Hamadan, Iran

<sup>2</sup> Associate Professor of Public Administration Department, Bonab Branch, Islamic Azad University, Bonab, Iran

<sup>3</sup> Associate Professor, Department of Management, Hamadan Branch, Islamic Azad University, Hamadan, Iran

<sup>4</sup> Assistant Professor, Department of Public Administration, Miyaneh Branch, Islamic Azad University, Miyaneh, Iran

<sup>5</sup> Assistant Professor, Department of Management, Hamadan Branch, Islamic Azad University, Hamadan, Iran

\* Corresponding author email address: beikzad\_jafar@yahoo.com

### Article Info

#### Article type:

Original Research

#### How to cite this article:

Shokri, M., Beikzad, J., Islambolchi, A., Gharehdaghi, R., & Hamidi, K. (2024). Macro Framework Design for Policies on Developing and Expanding Employment Opportunities for Higher Education Graduates in the Country. *International Journal of Innovation Management and Organizational Behavior*, 4(4), 212-222. <https://doi.org/10.61838/kman.ijimob.4.4.25>



© 2024 the authors. Published by KMAN Publication Inc. (KMANPUB), Ontario, Canada. This is an open access article under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial 4.0 International (CC BY-NC 4.0) License.

### ABSTRACT

**Objective:** The purpose of the present study is to design and propose a macro framework for policies aimed at developing and expanding employment opportunities for higher education graduates in the country.

**Methodology:** The research approach is qualitative, utilizing thematic analysis. Data were collected through semi-structured interviews with a group of experts. The expert group members were selected using purposeful sampling from three categories: university faculty members (7 individuals), managers related to national-level institutions involved in policymaking and law enforcement related to employment (3 individuals), and mid-level managers working at provincial levels in institutions related to employment (4 individuals). The information obtained from the interviews with 14 experts was used to form the theoretical modeling. During the completion phases of the research, the opinions of 4 additional experts (with educational backgrounds in administrative sciences) were also utilized to ensure theoretical saturation and achieve an acceptable level of validity and reliability of the findings. Data were processed and reviewed in multiple stages, and after ensuring acceptable validity and reliability for the qualitative model, they were summarized and presented in the form of a theoretical policy development and expansion model for employment opportunities for higher education graduates in the country.

**Findings:** The model includes 3 comprehensive macro frameworks (policies to strengthen the demand side in the employment equation, policies to strengthen the supply side in the employment equation, and dual employment creation policies), 13 organizing themes, and 56 basic themes.

**Conclusion:** Based on the findings and results, research proposals are presented to guide the selection of policies for developing and expanding employment opportunities for higher education graduates in the country.

**Keywords:** *Macro Policy Framework, Employment Development, Higher Education Graduate Employment, Employment Equation.*

## 1 Introduction

Employment and the formulation of macro policies in job creation to actualize the potential of all societal members are among the most fundamental concerns of various societies. Concurrently, unemployment, as a destructive social, economic, and cultural phenomenon, represents one of the most significant concerns for policymakers and planners in different countries and is considered one of the primary indicators of development in societies (Livingstone, 2009). Societies constantly require precise policy-making at various levels, particularly at the macro and public levels, to achieve a fair and equitable distribution of job opportunities and enhance social justice. This approach can effectively contribute to the development and expansion of job opportunities, enhancement of entrepreneurial opportunities, and promotion of social justice (Faggian et al., 2017). In this regard, appropriate policies must be adopted by relevant authorities.

A policy is a decision made in response to a public issue; it is not merely about decision-making but involves a process that includes all actions from the problem's identification to the evaluation of the policy's outcomes (Martins et al., 2023). Policy-making is the process of making decisions by governments and macro-level policymakers that define an objective, specify the tools to achieve it, and illustrate the steps to attain the goals (Olawaju, 2019).

A good policy can be defined as a general plan and process through which governments transform ideas into programs and activities to achieve results and create desirable changes in the real world. In this context, it can be said that for dynamic social processes such as job creation and the development of job opportunities, the use of macro policy tools like policy development can be beneficial; the main focus of the policy is to examine society's interactions, which operate at different stages including problem recognition and understanding, design and formation, implementation, evaluation, modification, and change of the policy (Pooramini & Ebrahimpour, 2023).

Reviewing related studies on policies and public and macro policy-making of administrative and social systems in various fields, particularly in the development and expansion of job opportunities and entrepreneurship, shows that

various theories and approaches have been proposed for policy-making in this field. One of the main theories in policy-making is the institutional approach. In institutional theory, policy is seen as an institutional output. In institutionalism, governmental organizations have been the main focus of policy and policy-making studies over a long period, and generally, political activities are centered on governmental institutions such as the three branches of government, local organizations, and so on (Cardoza et al., 2016; Chukwuemeka, 2011; Crespo Cuaresma et al., 2021; Haans & van Witteloostuijn, 2018). Hence, policies are determined, executed, and enforced by these institutions.

From the institutionalist perspective, policy-making by governmental institutions has several characteristics. Firstly, governments or governance systems legitimize policies (Ojaghi et al., 2023). This capability of the government ensures the enforcement of policies and public compliance. Another characteristic is the extensive and comprehensive nature of public policies that are issued and implemented by the government across society. Institutions may be structured in a way that facilitates the implementation of one policy while creating obstacles for another (Mohammadi et al., 2024; Turner et al., 2016). The institutional structure of the government can play an active and determining role in both the establishment and execution of policies (Pooramini & Ebrahimpour, 2023; Rezaei-Zadeh et al., 2012; Sepidbar et al., 2024). The impact of institutional arrangements on public policy can be examined as an empirical issue. This theory that institutional changes lead to policy changes is not necessarily correct; thus, caution is needed in evaluating the impact of structure on policy. Likely, both structure and policy are influenced by social and economic forces.

Another institution-based approach in policy-making processes is the institutionalism models based on individuals or cohesive and organized groups in dealing with policy-making processes. These approaches, known as new institutionalism, address the limitations of individual and group-based theories and focus on political phenomena. New institutionalism, also referred to as the new organizational economy, posits that organizations exist to overcome the obstacles to information production and exchange in social organizations. In new institutionalism, two types of social organizations are effective in minimizing

transaction costs: the market and hierarchy (bureaucracy) (Sepidbar et al., 2024; Silverman, 2013).

Iran's conditions concerning social trends and decision-making in public issues have specific characteristics. In Iran, the government's presence in various aspects of society, especially in directing entrepreneurial and job creation trends, is prominent and unrivaled, with most macro-level decisions in this field being made within the government (Ojaghi et al., 2023).

It is no secret that, given the performance of different governments since the revolution, many job creation policies in Iran have not yielded satisfactory and appropriate results. It seems that policy-making in this sector in Iran is sometimes highly politicized, hasty and temporary, lacking sufficient contemplation and scientific problem identification (Shirderikvand & Gelard, 2022). Annually, there is talk of drafting policies to solve some public issues, but these issues remain unresolved. The inability to solve problems may be due to weaknesses in understanding and identifying problems or other stages of the policy-making process, but the most crucial factor is the scientific nature of the policy implementation and execution process (Das & Mahanta, 2023). Policy-making must be knowledge-based while effectively differentiating between data, information, knowledge, and wisdom, and employing appropriate analytical tools. One of these methods is institution-based policy-making. Accordingly, one of the greatest needs in macro-level policy-making in job creation in Iran is deep and scientific understanding of public issues, idea generation, identification of new issues, critical evaluation of policies, conversion of general ideas into precise and implementable policies and programs, comparative studies, explaining and interpreting policies for the media and public opinion, etc. All these tasks are among the responsibilities of policymakers in this field, which, if properly fulfilled, will have positive functions.

Given that proper direction of job creation trends leads to economic activities' prosperity, investment growth, increased public income, increased taxes for the government, and expanded public welfare, all countries strive to create a business environment for economic actors and take numerous reformative actions to achieve this (Shirkavand, 2011). Today, governments have accepted that creating and appropriately developing entrepreneurial and job creation trends for young people and job-seeking graduates is a crucial factor in economic growth, resulting in production prosperity, innovation in activities, and improved productivity and export of goods and services (Fagian et al.,

2017). While it is possible that governments in developed countries may still emphasize the role and impact of large companies in entrepreneurship and job creation, the lack of macro-level planning for sustainable job creation may not yield favorable results. In other words, entrepreneurial policy-making is a reaction to the shift from a managed economy to an entrepreneurial economy characterized by the transition from an industrial economy to a knowledge-based economy, from the manufacturing sector to the service sector, from large companies to small companies, and from small companies to new companies (Das & Mahanta, 2023). This also requires appropriate policies for employment, especially for educated and skilled individuals as the active and productive population in the major production and service sectors of society.

In recent years, alongside changes in the demographic composition of Iran, policy trends in macro-level fields, particularly in the development and expansion of job opportunities and job creation for higher education graduates, have undergone transformations. Contrary to previous trends, efforts have been made to ensure that the policy-making process to decision-making is unbiased and based on scientific and coherent methods. Considering that addressing job creation, particularly for higher education graduates, appears in almost all electoral slogans of candidates for high-level state management, especially the presidency, the issue of job creation has become a dynamic political phenomenon, and related issues hold significant importance at high levels of governance. Although, so far, no precise and comprehensive framework has been presented by planners and policymakers in this field. Considering the above-mentioned points, the present study aims to provide a macro framework for policies based on job development and expansion of job opportunities, with an emphasis on job creation for higher education graduates. Based on the above, the research question resulting from the present study can be posed as follows: What is the macro framework for policies on developing and expanding job opportunities with an emphasis on job creation for higher education graduates in Iran?

## 2 Methods and Materials

The present study is applied-developmental in terms of purpose and descriptive in terms of research nature. The strategic basis is qualitative research. The data collection tool was semi-structured interviews until theoretical saturation was achieved. The qualitative data were collected,

categorized, and analyzed using a thematic analysis approach based on the output of the interviews.

The research strategy is theorizing with a thematic content analysis approach based on creating themes, a systematic and qualitative method for theory creation that broadly explains the process, action, or interaction of a subject with a specific identity. Furthermore, the methodology relies on the views derived from the participants' expertise, culminating in a set of propositions and a testable model in the second phase of the research, making it the chosen research strategy in the qualitative phase.

In this study, the qualitative method of thematic content analysis of the interviews was used to achieve the theoretical model. Thus, interviews were initially conducted, and key points were noted. Then, the points were entered into software and underwent multiple stages of review and validity examination, categorized into three themes: comprehensive themes, organizing themes, and basic themes, according to the Attride-Stirling (2001) approach. The interpreter in this method acts as an editor who enters, adds, or deletes unnecessary phrases or words in the text's corresponding sections (Crabtree & Miller, 1992, p. 180). One of the key features of the editing technique is its vital and critical nature; the conducted interpretations are continuously compared with the main concepts of the collected data. The aim is to reach theoretical saturation, where subsequent analyses cannot extract new knowledge about a specific class or type. In reality, the interview continues until this theoretical saturation is achieved. The purpose of coding is to extract concepts from a large volume of information gathered through interviews. Strauss and Corbin (2015) argue that coding is a process where data is examined word by word, and ultimately codes are derived from words or phrases. In the present study, initial and secondary coding or concepts and categories have been utilized. These were then categorized, and the main, sub-categories, and concepts were extracted.

The statistical population for conducting interviews and forming the theoretical model included members of the focal group, purposefully selected based on scientific expertise and executive experience in job creation, and backgrounds in governmental organizations and legislative bodies, as well as higher academic education and quality of academic and research backgrounds in the related field. The focal group members held at least a Ph.D. and had over ten years of service with a research or policy design and implementation background in job creation approaches at the national level.

These governmental executives included seven individuals from the subordinate organizations of the Ministry of Cooperatives, Labor, and Social Welfare, and seven academicians, totaling 14 individuals in the main panel and 18 individuals until theoretical saturation and qualitative model validity review were achieved. (Later, during the research's complementary phases, four academic experts were added to the panel for a more detailed review and to ensure theoretical saturation).

### 3 Findings and Results

The purposive sample for the expert group interviews consisted of individuals with diverse educational backgrounds and extensive professional experience related to employment policy-making and management. The panel included senior managers from national policy-making institutions, with participants holding a Ph.D. in Sociology-Cultural Studies (25 years of experience), Ph.D. in Economics (24 years of experience), and a Master's in Management (28 years of experience). Mid-level provincial managers involved in employment policy included participants with a Ph.D. in Management (22, 23 years of experience), a Master's in Management (17 years of experience), and a Ph.D. in Agriculture/Watershed Management and Resource Efficiency (26 years of experience). The academic panel consisted of university faculty members with Ph.D. degrees in Management, Sociology, and Economics, with experience ranging from 12 to 22 years. The secondary panel for reliability and validity included university faculty members with Ph.D. degrees in Management and experience ranging from 8 to 15 years.

In the present study, all factors extracted from the studies are initially considered as codes. Then, considering the concept of each code, they are categorized into similar concepts. This is how the research concepts (themes) are formed. According to the findings, initially, a total of 884 open codes were extracted, with the codes containing macro themes being eliminated, resulting in 741 basic open codes. These open codes were then finalized into 56 basic themes. Following the Attride-Stirling (2001) approach, the network of themes was obtained based on the categorization of basic themes (codes and key points of the text), organizing themes (derived from combining or summarizing basic themes), and overarching themes (high-level themes encompassing the principles governing the entire text). Finally, the theoretical model was summarized and presented based on thematic analysis for policy-making aimed at the development of

employment and the expansion of job opportunities for higher education graduates, as shown in Table 1.

**Table 1**

*Macro Framework for Policies on Developing and Expanding Employment Opportunities for Higher Education Graduates in the Country*

Overarching Theme	Organizing Theme	Basic Theme	Frequency of Open Codes	
Policies to Strengthen the Demand Side in the Employment Equation	Empowering industries financially using existing capacities for job creation	Upgrading and indirect financial strengthening of support industries (level three)	25	
		Financial empowerment of level two industries to enhance job creation	26	
		Efficient interaction between the banking system and enterprises to enhance job creation	28	
		Reviewing bank arrears of enterprises with effective employment rates	14	
		Government facilities and investments to modernize level one traditional industries	16	
		Employer share discounts on insurance payments for hiring graduates	19	
		Periodic financial rewards and incentives for enterprises with high hiring rates	13	
		Allocation of government subsidies for rehiring unemployed specialists	15	
		Special bank facilities for enterprises with the goal of hiring and employment	10	
		Financial and tax exemptions for enterprises to attract and hire permanently	11	
	Non-financial empowerment using existing capacities for industries to create jobs	Financial benefits and incentives for enterprises in stable recruitment and employment	14	
		Improving the business environment from the perspective of political-social-judicial security to attract investment	16	
		Laws supporting the prevention of excessive imports of domestically produced goods	21	
		Regulations and requirements for the purchase of domestic goods by government institutions	30	
		Principled privatization of government business units with the aim of enhancing capacities	25	
		Targeting educational programs with the aim of strengthening the industry	18	
		Establishing systems to identify strengths and address weaknesses of enterprises	15	
		Creating sustainable employment in various industries by creating new capacities and facilities	Planning to increase the share of the knowledge-based economy in job creation	13
			Enhancing ease and openness in the process of creating new businesses	20
			Providing financial incentives for sustainable hiring and establishing new units	18
Establishing tax exemptions for creating and maintaining medium-term employment	17			
Policies to Strengthen the Supply Side in the Employment Equation	Applying policies aimed at increasing the potential job mobility of graduates	Laws facilitating job creation in level one, three, and four industries	16	
		Enhancing the attractiveness of new investments in production and job creation	18	
		Job creation by facilitating investment and establishing new industrial enterprises	12	
		Increasing job mobility of skilled labor	13	
		Increasing geographical mobility of skilled labor	11	

Dual Employment Policies (Demand and Supply Oriented)	Promoting work culture among higher education graduates	General cultural promotion to enhance the attractiveness of employment in the non-governmental sector of the economy	11
		Promoting the direct relationship between income and wealth with work and effort	12
		Promoting the culture of work and effort and the stigma of unemployment and unearned wealth	9
		Enhancing graduates' motivation to feel useful to society	11
	Facilitating voluntary exit conditions of the workforce from the employment cycle	Facilitating legal conditions for early retirement of disabled workers	9
		Facilitating retirement or buyout conditions for unmotivated employees	16
	Effective responsibility of academic environments in graduate employment	Strengthening effective connections between industry and universities in hiring graduates	11
		Developing empowerment processes for graduates towards sustainable employment	12
		University roles in their social responsibility to systematically reduce unemployment	10
		Defining social responsibility in ensuring the employment of university graduates	12
Moving towards making educational content more practical from the labor market perspective	Continuously monitoring the employment status of university graduates	10	
	Purposeful internship programs to meet labor market needs	11	
	Enhancing the efficiency of the higher education system based on employment needs	7	
	Training unemployed motivated graduates and enhancing their skills	9	
Incentive policies to enhance the entrepreneurship rate among graduates	Removing obstacles to the commercialization of intellectual properties and precise enforcement of related legal regulations	11	
	Providing supportive-incentive packages for entrepreneurs in the field of emerging industries	11	
General cultural promotion towards the use of domestic production and services	Steering public culture towards supporting the purchase and consumption of domestic goods	8	
	Promoting the culture of avoiding the purchase of foreign goods with domestic equivalents	9	
Creating and expanding a comprehensive information system from both sides of the labor market	Expanding a cohesive system for marketing expertise and announcing skills	9	
	Setting up a professional database for jobs and the unemployed to enhance job opportunities	5	
	Collecting and refining information on jobs and the unemployed	5	
Supporting investment funds in innovative, small, and start-up companies	Supporting start-ups with limited but high-yield technological investments	10	
	Supporting the establishment and operation of cooperatives in various fields	9	
Avoiding passive policies and pursuing active policies related to the labor market	Continuous scientific engagement with industry and society in entrepreneurship	11	
	Moving towards transforming universities into entrepreneurial universities	5	
	Dual labor laws to encourage and guarantee employer privileges	12	
	Supporting the establishment and operation of cooperatives in various fields	9	
	Combating the smuggling of goods harmful to domestic employment	10	
	Making employment attractive in rural areas for university graduates	5	
	Stopping the payment of subsidies and allowances to permanently unemployed individuals	8	

Next, the theoretical explanation of the macro model formed in this research for policy-making in job creation from the perspective of its important dimensions and components is provided. The theoretical model is formulated into three main overarching themes: "Policies to Strengthen the Demand Side in the Employment Equation," "Policies to Strengthen the Supply Side in the Employment Equation," and "Dual Employment Policies (Demand and Supply Oriented)," which are further explained with reference to various sections of the interviews conducted in this research. Notably, markers for tracing interviews and interviewees are also provided in the selected texts column, for example, (E07, Pos. 45) means that the seventh interviewee explained the relevant sentences in open code number 47.

By "Policies to Strengthen the Demand Side in the Employment Equation" or demand-oriented employment policies, we mean those policies primarily aimed at increasing demand for hiring and employing skilled labor. Adopting demand-oriented labor market policies can help improve employment levels in the labor market for university graduates (E13, Pos. 19). Such policies can be read as employment policies emphasizing demand factors (industry-enterprise) or policies that strengthen supply factors of job opportunities. Thus, demand-oriented labor market policies and the equitable distribution of job opportunities for higher education graduate candidates aim to strengthen the industry-labor market in attracting educated individuals. In this context, objectives such as empowering industries to create and maintain sustainable employment and providing structured and organized government support to competitive goods producers in exchange for stable employment and the hiring of local and domestic graduates can be highlighted.

Policies to Strengthen the Supply Side in the Employment Equation, or supply-oriented employment policies, refer to policies aimed at enhancing and empowering job-seeking graduates suggested by experts. These policies are implemented and executed to reduce or eliminate structural unemployment and focus mainly on the microeconomic aspects of the labor market. The aforementioned policies pursue the process of job creation by strengthening the supply side in the employment equation. In fact, supply-oriented policies are government strategies that focus on increasing the economy's ability to produce goods and services. These policies aim to improve the supply of goods and services through stimulating investment, innovation, and efficiency in industries, and promoting healthy competition. Essentially, they focus on making jobs easier

and more attractive for production, innovation, and growth. An example of a supply-side policy in the employment equation is increasing budget programs aimed at improving human capital for unemployed individuals. These policies aim to improve the labor force based on the needs of various industries in the economic environment (E07, Pos. 34). Policies to strengthen and empower job-seeking graduates are another example of approaches to strengthen the supply side in the employment equation. Supply-side policies are government strategies that focus on increasing the economy's ability to produce goods and services. These policies aim to improve the supply of goods and services through stimulating investment, innovation, and efficiency in industries, and promoting healthy competition. Essentially, they focus on making jobs easier and more attractive for production, innovation, and growth (E06, Pos. 30). In this regard, the simplest policy may be the direct and indirect subsidy provision to unemployed graduates seeking jobs (E03, Pos. 34-39).

Dual Employment Policies (Demand and Supply Oriented) include policies that cannot be independently or separately categorized within the framework of supply or demand-side strengthening policies. The viewpoint and approach of dual employment policy-making (both supply and demand-oriented) for developing and expanding job opportunities are very crucial; the demand-oriented (enterprise-job seeker) and candidate-attracting oriented are both demand-oriented, and some policies include strengthening both angles. For instance, incentive policies to enhance the entrepreneurship rate among graduates or incentive policies to enhance the entrepreneurship rate among university graduates (E08, Pos. 41) fall into this category. Also, the creation of a comprehensive labor market information system (gathering and refining information on jobs and the unemployed) since it benefits both supply and demand sides in the employment equation, belongs to this category.

#### 4 Discussion and Conclusion

The present study was conducted within the data collection and analysis timeframe from March 2022 to February 2024. Considering that the issue of employment and the creation and development of job opportunities for higher education graduates in Iran has become a multifaceted problem, examining, diagnosing, and solving the problem of graduate unemployment requires a comprehensive and strategic view around it. This

dissertation considers the issue from a macro-level policy-making perspective and aims to guide strategies towards improving the employment rate through providing various strategies within a policy-making model. To achieve a suitable response to the research question, the researcher must thoroughly understand the situation and conditions of the studied community and collect data through credible sources and scientific approaches. For this purpose, a qualitative approach based on thematic analysis and interviews with experts and knowledgeable individuals in this field has been adopted. In this regard, the qualitative analysis approach of the collected interviews concerning designing and formulating a policy-making model based on developing and expanding job opportunities with an emphasis on job creation for higher education graduates, the overarching, organizing, and basic themes were identified, and the conceptual model of the research was formulated and presented. Given that the qualitative thematic analysis approach is not a linear process and merely moves from one stage to the next, the collected data from the interviews were analyzed and dissected multiple times, and a multi-faceted and iterative process was applied to the initially formed model. After several revisions and reviews and qualitative validation of the model, a final model for policy-making based on job development and expanding employment opportunities for higher education graduates was extracted as follows:

Findings in the form of open codes extracted from 18 interview files showed that the first 13 interviews had the most coding coverage, and in interviews 17 and 18, no new codes were obtained, and all codes were repetitive, thus reaching theoretical saturation. According to the findings, initially, a total of 884 open codes were extracted, with macro and repetitive themes (word by word) being eliminated, resulting in 741 basic open codes. These open codes were then finalized into 56 basic themes. These themes were reviewed in five stages, and the final model, as the theoretical model for policy-making based on job development and expanding employment opportunities for higher education graduates in Iran, was presented. This model includes three overarching themes, 13 organizing themes, and 56 basic themes.

Policies to Strengthen the Demand Side in the Employment Equation is one of the overarching themes in the job creation model that refers to actions related to strengthening industry and the market to attract graduates. This matter has been examined in previous studies (Chukwemeka, 2011; Crespo Cuaresma et al., 2021) and

has been confirmed as effective employment policies in reducing unemployment rates. Therefore, this matter can be considered as consistent results and discussions regarding the comparison of the present study's findings with previous research.

Neck et al. (2021) in examining demand-side stabilization policies have emphasized the necessity of providing employment incentives to enterprises with stable employment rates and providing special bank facilities to them, which aligns with the present study's findings (Neck et al., 2021).

Policies to Strengthen the Supply Side in the Employment Equation refer to policies aimed at the supply side or job-seeking graduates and their empowerment. In comparison and discussion, it can be said that findings related to this policy align with research findings (Cairó & Cajner, 2018; Capsada-Munsech, 2020; Choi et al., 2023; Crespo Cuaresma et al., 2021; Olarewaju, 2019).

Dual Employment Policies (Demand and Supply Oriented) is another main theme where newly published research has mostly highlighted these types of policies for improving employment rates. In discussion and comparison, it can be said that emphasizing the expansion of a cohesive marketing system for expertise and skill announcement, providing supportive-incentive packages for entrepreneurs in the field of emerging industries, supporting the establishment and operation of cooperatives in various fields, and moving towards transforming traditional universities into entrepreneurial universities have also been mentioned in previous studies (Cairó & Cajner, 2018; Capsada-Munsech, 2020). Thus, in this respect, the present study's findings are aligned with the mentioned studies.

Finally, based on the research findings, the following suggestions can be provided separately for the main components of job development and expanding employment opportunities for higher education graduates:

In implementing and executing Policies to Strengthen the Demand Side in the Employment Equation with the aim of developing employment and expanding job opportunities for higher education graduates, the following suggestions are proposed:

- Approving targeted laws and regulations (with the aim of enhancing sustainable employment) to empower industries financially using existing capacities with the goal of private sector industries at level two;
- Enhancing the efficiency of interactions between the banking system and private sector industrial



enterprises with the aim of improving employment through clarifying the process of receiving and repaying bank facilities considering employment conditions for enterprises and providing special bank facilities to enterprises with the goal of hiring and employment;

- Facilitating the review process of bank arrears of enterprises with effective employment rates;
- Setting up regulations and implementing them to ensure discounts on employer shares of insurance payments for hiring graduates;
- Setting up regulations and implementing them to ensure financial and tax exemptions for enterprises to attract and hire permanently;
- For financially strengthening industrial enterprises, regulations and requirements for the purchase of domestically produced goods by enterprises with high stable employment rates should be approved by government institutions;
- For achieving sustainable employment, care should be taken in privatization processes so that privatization of government business units is done on a principled basis and with the aim of enhancing employment capacities. For this purpose, the policy of transferring state-owned industrial enterprises should be based on sustainable employment objectives;
- Targeting educational programs with the aim of strengthening the industry through reorganizing educational, research, and academic systems;
- Establishing systems to identify strengths and address weaknesses of enterprises in order to regulate sustainable employment for higher education graduates.

In implementing and executing Policies to Strengthen the Supply Side in the Employment Equation with the aim of developing employment and expanding job opportunities for higher education graduates, the following suggestions are proposed:

- Purposeful educational empowerment of graduates with the aim of increasing job mobility and training specialized labor needed by the labor market;
- Approving laws and structuring the process of targeted housing allocation with the aim of increasing geographical mobility of skilled labor for the employment of individuals outside the geographical residence of graduates;

- General cultural promotion to enhance the attractiveness of employment in the non-governmental sector of the economy through public awareness using mass media (radio, television, etc.) and public familiarization with the benefits of employment in the private sector and entrepreneurship at various levels, as well as promoting the direct relationship between income and wealth with work and effort;
- Approving and implementing laws and regulations aimed at facilitating legal conditions for early retirement of disabled workers;
- Approving and implementing laws and regulations aimed at facilitating retirement or buyout conditions for unmotivated employees;
- Approving and implementing laws and regulations aimed at strengthening effective connections between industry and universities in hiring graduates;
- Approving and implementing laws and regulations aimed at developing empowerment processes for graduates towards sustainable employment.

In implementing and executing Dual Employment Policies (Demand and Supply Oriented) with the aim of developing employment and expanding job opportunities for higher education graduates, the following suggestions are proposed:

- Creating and expanding infrastructure and coordination at the ministry levels with the aim of developing a cohesive system for marketing expertise and announcing skills, and setting up a professional database for jobs and the unemployed to enhance job opportunities;
- Approving and implementing laws and regulations aimed at removing obstacles to the commercialization of intellectual properties and precise enforcement of related legal regulations;
- Approving and implementing laws and regulations aimed at providing supportive-incentive packages for entrepreneurs in the field of emerging industries;
- Approving and implementing laws and regulations aimed at steering public culture towards supporting the purchase and consumption of domestic goods and avoiding the purchase of foreign goods with domestic equivalents;

- Approving and implementing laws and regulations aimed at supporting start-ups with limited but high-yield technological investments;
- Approving and implementing laws and regulations aimed at supporting the establishment and operation of cooperatives in various fields;
- Approving and implementing laws and regulations aimed at continuous scientific engagement with industry and society in entrepreneurship;
- Approving and implementing laws and regulations aimed at moving towards transforming universities into entrepreneurial universities;
- Reviewing, revising, and refining dual laws related to labor law with the aim of encouraging and guaranteeing employer privileges along with ensuring stable employment for higher education graduates;
- Approving and implementing laws and regulations aimed at supporting the establishment and operation of cooperatives in various fields;
- Approving and implementing laws and regulations aimed at combating the smuggling of goods harmful to domestic employment;
- Approving and implementing laws and regulations aimed at making employment attractive in rural areas for university graduates;
- Approving and implementing laws and regulations aimed at stopping the payment of subsidies and allowances to permanently unemployed individuals.

### Authors' Contributions

All authors have contributed significantly to the research process and the development of the manuscript.

### Declaration

In order to correct and improve the academic writing of our paper, we have used the language model ChatGPT.

### Transparency Statement

Data are available for research purposes upon reasonable request to the corresponding author.

### Acknowledgments

We would like to express our gratitude to all individuals helped us to do the project.

### Declaration of Interest

The authors report no conflict of interest.

### Funding

According to the authors, this article has no financial support.

### Ethical Considerations

In this research, ethical standards including obtaining informed consent, ensuring privacy and confidentiality were observed.

### References

- Cairó, I., & Cajner, T. (2018). Human Capital and Unemployment Dynamics: Why More Educated Workers Enjoy Greater Employment Stability. *The Economic Journal*, 128(609), 652-682. <https://doi.org/10.1111/ecoj.12441>
- Capsada-Munsech, Q. (2020). Overeducation, skills and social background: the influence of parental education on overeducation in Spain. *Compare: A Journal of Comparative and International Education*, 50(2), 216-236. <https://doi.org/10.1080/03057925.2019.1579085>
- Cardoza, G., Fornes, G., Farber, V., Gonzalez Duarte, R., & Ruiz Gutierrez, J. (2016). Barriers and public policies affecting the international expansion of Latin American SMEs: Evidence from Brazil, Colombia, and Peru. *Journal of Business Research*, 69(6), 2030-2039. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jbusres.2015.10.148>
- Choi, S., Li, H., & Ogawa, K. (2023). Upper secondary vocational education and decent work in Indonesia: A gender comparison. *International Journal of Educational Development*, 101, 102833. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijedudev.2023.102833>
- Chukwuemeka, E. (2011). The challenges of government policy on entrepreneurship in Nigeria. *The Journal of Commerce*, 3(2), 11. <https://search.proquest.com/openview/ab7594c094b8f3f38b7434fdc5544ad4/1?pq-origsite=gscholar&cbl=676305>
- Crespo Cuaresma, J., Oberhofer, H., & Sausgruber, R. (2021). Special issue: Evidence based policy making—selected papers of the 2020 Annual Meeting of the Austrian Economic Association. *Empirica*, 48(3), 589-591. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10663-021-09514-9>
- Das, K., & Mahanta, A. (2023). Rural non-farm employment diversification in India: the role of gender, education, caste and land ownership. *International Journal of Social Economics*, 50(6), 741-765. <https://doi.org/10.1108/IJSE-06-2022-0429>
- Faggian, A., Partridge, M., & Malecki, E. J. (2017). Creating an Environment for Economic Growth: Creativity, Entrepreneurship or Human Capital? *International Journal of Urban and Regional Research*, 41(6), 997-1009. <https://doi.org/10.1111/1468-2427.12555>
- Haans, R. F. J., & van Witteloostuijn, A. (2018). Expected job creation across the cultural industries: a sectoral division and its implications for cultural policy. *International Journal of Cultural Policy*, 24(1), 45-67. <https://doi.org/10.1080/10286632.2015.1128420>

- Livingstone, D. W. (2009). *Education & jobs: Exploring the gaps*. University of Toronto Press. [https://books.google.com/books?hl=en&lr=lang\\_en&id=P5DNvSL2PwAC&oi=fnd&pg=PR9&dq=The+Education-Jobs+Gap&ots=sQkOp8DAg6&sig=vBByd3Cv9paGxEEZ28EdTzyfKCs](https://books.google.com/books?hl=en&lr=lang_en&id=P5DNvSL2PwAC&oi=fnd&pg=PR9&dq=The+Education-Jobs+Gap&ots=sQkOp8DAg6&sig=vBByd3Cv9paGxEEZ28EdTzyfKCs)
- Martins, J. M., Shahzad, M. F., & Xu, S. (2023). Factors influencing entrepreneurial intention to initiate new ventures: evidence from university students. *Journal of Innovation and Entrepreneurship*, 12(1), 63. <https://doi.org/10.1186/s13731-023-00333-9>
- Mohammadi, S., Hosseininia, G. H., & Dastani Mobarakeh, M. (2024). An Examination of the Mediating Role of Individual Entrepreneurial Orientation on the Relation Between Entrepreneurship Education and Entrepreneurial Intention. *Journal of Entrepreneurship Development*, 16(Issue 5 (Special Issue)), 231-251. <https://doi.org/10.22059/jed.2023.355074.654141>
- Neck, R., Weyerstrass, K., Blueschke, D., & Verbič, M. (2021). Demand-side or supply-side stabilisation policies in a small euro area economy: a case study for Slovenia. *Empirica*, 48(3), 593-610. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10663-021-09503-y>
- Ojaghi, S., Bayat, R., Fazli, S., Keshavarz Tork, E., & Fath Taheri, A. (2023). Prioritization the Factors Affecting the future of Employment and Social Welfare in Iran [method]. *Social Welfare*, 22(87), 221-251. <https://doi.org/10.32598/refahj.22.87.4133.1>
- Olarewaju, T. I. A. (2019). Can Equalizing Educational Endowments Between Men and Women Create More Female Self-employed Value in Nigeria? *Journal of Creating Value*, 5(1), 68-83. <https://doi.org/10.1177/2394964318815313>
- Pooramini, Z., & Ebrahimpour, H. (2023). A Conceptual Model of Employability Skill for Technology and Knowledge-Based Enterprise. *Journal of Entrepreneurship Development*, 16(3), 47-65. <https://www.magiran.com/paper/2660548>
- Rezaei-Zadeh, M., Ansari, M., Arefi, M., & Murphy, E. M. (2012). The scope and sequence of curriculum to promote students, entrepreneurial capabilities using interpretive structural modelling (ISM). *Journal of Entrepreneurship Development*, 5(1), 165-184. [https://jed.ut.ac.ir/article\\_24660\\_en.html](https://jed.ut.ac.ir/article_24660_en.html)
- Sepidbar, Z., Mohammadzadeh, Y., & Nikpey Pesyan, V. (2024). Analysis of the effect of entrepreneurship index on employment in Iranian provinces: Spatial econometric approach. *The Economic Research (Sustainable Growth and Development)*, 24(1), 285-311. <https://doi.org/10.22034/24.1.285>
- Shirderikvand, A., & Gelard, P. (2022). Designing a corporate social entrepreneurship model: Qualitative research based on Grounded theory. *Journal of Entrepreneurship Development*, 14(4), 619-638. <https://doi.org/10.22059/jed.2021.321950.653642>
- Silverman, J. (2013). *Crime, policy and the media: the shaping of criminal justice, 1989-2010*. Routledge. <https://www.taylorfrancis.com/books/mono/10.4324/9780203156933/crime-policy-media-jon-silverman>
- Turner, M., Sermcheep, S., Anantasirijkiat, S., & Srisangnam, P. (2016). Small and medium-sized enterprises in Thailand: government policy and economic development. *Asia Pacific Journal of Public Administration*, 38(4), 251-269. <https://doi.org/10.1080/23276665.2016.1256545>