




Synthesis of Dimensions, Indicators, and Components of Appropriate Educational Leadership for Blended Learning (In-Person and Virtual) in Elementary Education

Pari. Saraei¹, Sadegh. Maleki Avarsin^{2*}, Jahangir. Yari Haj Ataloo³

¹ PhD Student in educational management, Tabriz Branch, Islamic Azad University, Tabriz, Iran

² Associate Professor, Department of Educational Sciences, Tabriz Branch, Islamic Azad University, Tabriz, Iran

³ Assistant Professor, Department of Educational Sciences, Tabriz Branch, Islamic Azad University, Tabriz, Iran

* Corresponding author email address: s.maleki1@iaut.ac.ir

Editor

Aliakbar Aminbeidokhti^{id}
Educational Administration, Faculty
of Psychology and Educational
Sciences, Semnan University,
Semnan, Iran
kafashpor@um.ac.ir

Reviewers

Reviewer 1: Ali Sargolzaie^{id}
Assistant Professor, Department of Management, Zahedan Branch, Islamic Azad
University, Zahedan, Iran.
Email: a.sargolzaie@iauzah.ac.ir
Reviewer 2: Alireza Rajabipoor Meybodi^{id}
Associate Professor, Department of Business Administration, Yazd University,
Yazd, Iran
Email: Rajabipoor@yazd.ac.ir

1. Round 1

1.1. Reviewer 1

Reviewer:

The statement "Leadership is essential for all societies and organizations to achieve fundamental desirabilities" could benefit from examples or definitions of "fundamental desirabilities" to clarify the term's relevance to the educational context.

In discussing the role of virtual education in transforming leadership, consider adding a comparison between traditional and blended education to highlight the unique challenges for leaders in blended environments.

The study mentions including articles from 2013-2023, yet it could benefit from a rationale explaining why this timeframe was chosen. This would help justify the literature selection process.

Clarify the exclusion criteria in greater detail. For example, specify what constitutes "unreliable journals" or "inappropriate methodology," as these terms are somewhat subjective.

The mention of Roberts' six-step model would benefit from a brief explanation or citation of the model to help readers unfamiliar with it understand its relevance to this synthesis research.

Table 1 is detailed, but a brief explanation of how each component ties into educational leadership could enhance its interpretability. A summary paragraph below the table might be useful.

Clarify the "philosophical and epistemological system" dimension with examples of how these philosophical perspectives impact leadership practices in blended learning environments.

Authors revised the manuscript and uploaded the new document.

1.2. Reviewer 2

Reviewer:

The sentence "Today, schools...cannot reform and improve...without effective leadership" would be strengthened by citing recent examples or data on how leadership impacts school performance, particularly in educational contexts.

When you state "Educational leaders must adapt to this new normal," it may be helpful to specify the skills or competencies leaders need to navigate virtual learning environments effectively.

The reference to Cross as introducing "e-learning" lacks a citation. Adding the publication year and context would give readers more insight into the term's historical evolution.

"Despite the attention to educational leadership in the last century..." might benefit from summarizing key trends or shifts in leadership focus to provide a stronger historical context.

In describing "selective codes," such as "competent leadership," explain why these specific dimensions were selected and how they encapsulate the broader findings on blended learning leadership.

The statement "educational leaders should be motivated, have high interpersonal relationships..." could be expanded to include specific skills or examples, like effective communication and empathy, which would provide readers with concrete traits.

When discussing technological barriers, consider referencing specific studies or data that demonstrate the impact of limited infrastructure or resistance to technology on leadership efficacy.

Authors revised the manuscript and uploaded the new document.

2. Revised

Editor's decision after revisions: Accepted.

Editor in Chief's decision: Accepted.