




Solutions and Obstacles to Civic Education in a Smart City

Zahra. Gholami¹, Hamideh Reshadatjoo^{2*}, Afsaneh. Zamani Moghadam³


¹ PhD student in educational management, Department of Educational Management, Faculty of Management and Economics, Science and Research Branch, Islamic Azad University, Tehran, Iran

² Associate Professor, Department of Crisis Management and Urban Management, Faculty of Management and Economics, Science and Research Branch, Islamic Azad University, Tehran, Iran


³ Associate Professor, Department of Educational Management, Faculty of Management and Economics, Science and Research Branch, Islamic Azad University, Tehran, Iran

* Corresponding author email address: reshadatjoo@srbiau.ac.ir

Editor

Mohammed Abdul Imran Khan
Department of Financial
Management and Economics,
Dhofar University, Oman
mimran@du.edu.om

Reviewers

Reviewer 1: Masoud Hoseinchari
Associate Professor, Department of Educational Sciences, Shiraz University, Shiraz,
Iran. Email: hchhari@shirazu.ac.ir
Reviewer 2: Alinaghi Amiri
Professor, Management Department, Tehran University, Tehran, Iran.
Email: anamiri@ut.ac.ir

1. Round 1

1.1. Reviewer 1

Reviewer:

The sentence "Civic education is one of the essential pillars of social life in the present era and in industrial societies" should be supported with more contemporary references and data to reinforce its significance in both developing and developed nations.

The term "smart city" is introduced, but a clearer definition is needed. Please define "smart city" explicitly at the beginning of the paragraph and reference key literature that delineates its components.

The discussion on civic education's role in political stability and participation is well-articulated but could benefit from a comparative analysis. Incorporate studies or data from various countries to highlight different approaches and outcomes.

The validity and reliability measures are commendable but require more specifics. Detail the steps taken for ensuring transcription reliability and intra-subject agreement percentages, and explain how these measures contributed to the robustness of the findings.

The description of the theoretical coding process should include a brief explanation of how open, axial, and selective coding was conducted. Provide examples from the data to illustrate each type of coding.

The statement "technology does not automatically result in smartness" is crucial but needs more exploration. Discuss potential pitfalls or challenges cities face when integrating technology without adequate civic education.

The assertion that "civic education refers to those educational activities that prepare and socialize individuals" could be reinforced by linking it to specific outcomes, such as improved political engagement or social cohesion, backed by empirical data.

Reflect on the limitations of the study more comprehensively. Discuss potential biases, the limited geographic scope, and other factors that might influence the generalizability of the findings.

Authors revised the manuscript.

1.2. Reviewer 2

Reviewer:

The definition of civic education cited from Torney-Purta could benefit from further elaboration to enhance clarity. Consider including specific examples of how knowledge, values, and attitudes are transmitted in different contexts.

The claim that "civic education should aim at citizen initiatives and self-actualization" needs further justification. Provide empirical evidence or case studies demonstrating successful outcomes from such educational approaches.

The linkage between smart cities and civic education is critical yet appears generalized. It would be beneficial to specify how different elements of smart city infrastructure (e.g., ICT, urban mobility) directly enhance civic education outcomes.

Clarify the sampling method used for selecting the 20 individuals. Explain how the principle of saturation was applied and provide more details about the participants' demographics to understand the study's context better.

Table 1: The table listing concepts extracted from interviews needs clearer categorization. Consider grouping related concepts under broader themes to enhance readability and coherence.

The findings mention managerial, organizational, individual, and educational strategies but lack depth. Expand on each category with specific strategies, illustrating with direct quotes from the interviews where possible.

When discussing obstacles, specify the context or instances where these obstacles were observed. Providing examples or direct quotes from participants can substantiate these points and provide a richer analysis.

The discussion on the multifaceted nature of smart cities should be expanded. Compare different cities' approaches to smart city development and how these impact civic education, using specific examples or case studies.

Summarize key findings succinctly, emphasizing the importance of civic education in smart cities. Highlight the main strategies and obstacles identified and their implications for policymakers and educators.

The recommendations provided are practical but could be more detailed. Suggest specific actions or initiatives that municipalities can undertake to enhance civic education, drawing from successful case studies or best practices.

Authors revised the manuscript.

2. Revised

Editor's decision: Accepted.

Editor in Chief's decision: Accepted.