

Identification and Evaluation of Agile Criteria in the Iranian Telecom Industry Based on Digital Transformation Trends

Hamid. Ghanbarian Alavijeh¹, Gholam Reza. Hashemzadeh^{2*}, Ghanbar. Abbaspour Esfeden³

¹ Information Technology Management, South Tehran Branch, Islamic Azad University, Tehran, Iran

² Industrial Management, South Tehran Branch, Islamic Azad University, Tehran, Iran



³ Industrial Management, Science and Research Branch, Islamic Azad University, Tehran, Iran

* Corresponding author email address: gh_hashemzadeh@azad.ac.ir

Editor

Azar Kafashpor
Professor, Department of
Educational Management and
Human Resource Development,
Ferdowsi University of Mashhad,
Mashhad, Iran
kafashpor@um.ac.ir

Reviewers

Reviewer 1: Lourdes Atiaja Atiaja
Universidad de las Fuerzas Armadas ESPE, Ecuador.
Email: natiaja@espe.edu.ec
Reviewer 2: Marco Yamba-Yugsi
Unidad Académica de Posgrado, Universidad Católica de Cuenca, Azuay 010101,
Ecuador
Email: marco.yamba@ucacue.edu.ec

1. Round 1

1.1. Reviewer 1

Reviewer:

In the paragraph discussing Jeff Bezos and Amazon, you might consider referencing specific examples or data to show how agility specifically benefited Amazon's strategic decisions, thus strengthening the link between agility and competitive advantage.

The quote from McKinsey mentions agility as "speed and stability." It would be helpful to clarify how these elements are uniquely impactful in the telecom industry to contextualize this definition better.

In the "Methods and Materials" section, where the Fuzzy Delphi Method is described, it may be beneficial to provide more detail on how the expert sample was chosen. This would aid in understanding the reliability and validity of the sample group.

The choice of a five-level fuzzy scale could be elaborated. For instance, why were these specific levels chosen, and how do they compare to other possible scales?

In Table 2, the threshold value for screening criteria is given as 0.7. Please clarify the rationale for this threshold choice and its implications on the study's findings.

Consider clarifying why this specific method was chosen over other causal analysis methods, such as Structural Equation Modeling (SEM), to enhance methodological rigor.

In the Conclusion, when discussing the study's implications for digital transformation, it might be helpful to address specific technologies, like cloud infrastructures or AI, that telecoms could prioritize based on your findings.

The manuscript briefly mentions the study's contributions. It would be beneficial to elaborate further on the theoretical, methodological, and practical contributions to emphasize the study's significance.

Authors revised the manuscript and uploaded the new document.

1.2. Reviewer 2

Reviewer:

The statement, "agility can be considered one of the most critical characteristics of a digital organization", would be enhanced by referencing additional literature or studies that reinforce this statement to deepen the theoretical framework.

The last paragraph of the Introduction lacks a clear problem statement. Consider framing a concise question or statement highlighting the specific research gap the study addresses.

Table 4 and subsequent explanation of causal relationships could benefit from additional clarification on how each value represents causation direction and intensity. This could help the reader understand the relational dynamics between the criteria more intuitively.

Figure 1 shows "Significant Relationships Among Agility Criteria." Adding a sentence or two interpreting the positioning of key criteria within the diagram would make it more accessible to readers unfamiliar with DEMATEL outputs.

The Discussion section states that agility criteria "help organizations swiftly react to changes." Strengthening this statement with more specific actions or examples relevant to the telecom industry would make it more actionable for industry practitioners.

There is little comparison between the identified criteria and those of other agile transformation models in similar industries. Consider adding a comparative analysis to highlight how the Iranian telecom industry aligns or diverges from global trends.

Some citations, like the Deloitte report, lack complete publication details. Ensure all references include full bibliographic information to maintain academic rigor.

Authors revised the manuscript and uploaded the new document.

2. Revised

Editor's decision after revisions: Accepted.

Editor in Chief's decision: Accepted.