

Article history: Received 19 September 2023 Accepted 25 November 2023 Published online 01 December 2023

International Journal of Innovation Management and Organizational Behavior

Open Peer-Review Report



Designing a Model of the Impact of Talent Management on Human Capital with the Mediating Role of Organizational Innovation

Farhad. Abutaleb¹, Seyyed Hamid. Sadjadi Hezaveh^{1*}, Ali. Zarei¹, Farideh. Ashraf Ganjouei¹

¹ Department of Sports Management, Central Tehran Branch, Islamic Azad University, Tehran, Iran

Editor Reviewers Sepehr Khajeh Naeini 💿 Reviewer 1: Ali Sargolzaie Department of Environmental Assistant Professor, Department of Management, Zahedan Branch, Islamic Azad Engineering, Lakehead University, University, Zahedan, Iran. Canada Reviewer 2: Marco Yamba-Yugsi skhajeh@lakeheadu.ca Unidad Académica de Posgrado, Universidad Católica de Cuenca, Azuay 010101, Ecuador Email: marco.yamba@ucacue.edu.ec

* Corresponding author email address: hamidsadjadi@gmail.com

1. Round 1

1.1. Reviewer 1

Reviewer:

In the paragraph beginning with "The impact of talent management on human capital...," the authors provide background information on the topic but fail to identify the specific research gap they aim to address. A clearer statement defining the gap in existing literature and how this study intends to fill it would enhance the introduction's value.

The sentence "the indices presented suggest that overall the proposed model is reasonably appropriate..." is too vague. Considering that the AGFI is below the threshold of 0.90, the authors should explain whether this slightly lower value impacts the overall model fit and what measures can be taken to improve it.

The discussion of mediation is insufficient. The sentence "The mediating role of organizational innovation in the relationship between talent management and human capital was not confirmed" needs further elaboration. Discuss why the mediating role was not supported and what implications this has for theory and practice.

The article concludes with general recommendations for the Tehran Municipality Sports Organization. It would be beneficial to provide more concrete and specific strategies for how talent management and innovation should be implemented. For example, what specific talent management practices could enhance human capital?

While practical implications are touched upon, there is no clear section discussing the theoretical contributions of this study to the fields of talent management, human capital, or organizational innovation. The authors should add a subsection detailing how their findings contribute to existing theories or models.

A key limitation that is not discussed in the paper is the reliance on a single organization for the case study (Tehran Municipality Sports Organization). The authors should address the potential for limited generalizability and discuss how the findings might differ in other organizations or sectors.

Authors revised the manuscripts.

1.2. Reviewer 2

Reviewer:

In the sentence "This is because human resources in this domain contribute not only to the quality of services provided...," there is a reference to Carlson et al. (2019) without further explanation of the findings or relevance. A more in-depth integration of this source into the text is recommended to show how Carlson's research supports or contrasts the current study.

The use of multiple questionnaires is briefly described, but more justification is needed. For instance, the talent management questionnaire by Phillips and Roper (2009) is used, but it would be helpful to include more information on why this particular tool was chosen over others. Are there recent validation studies for this questionnaire?

While you mention that the researcher was present to distribute the questionnaires, there is no description of how long the data collection period lasted or how data integrity was maintained. Could you provide more detail about these aspects to improve replicability?

In Table 2, the t-values for each path coefficient are provided, but there is no discussion about the strength of the relationships. Including effect sizes or Cohen's d values would provide readers with more context on the magnitude of the relationships.

The cross-sectional nature of the study (one-time data collection) is a limitation that should be acknowledged. The authors should mention that longitudinal studies are needed to observe how talent management and organizational innovation evolve over time.

The concluding paragraph states that "Human resources are considered the most valuable capital of any organization." While this is a widely accepted idea, the authors should avoid overgeneralizations and tie the conclusion more specifically to the findings of their study.

The conclusion lacks recommendations for future research. Based on the findings, the authors could suggest exploring how different types of organizations or varying talent management strategies impact human capital.

Authors revised the manuscripts.

2. Revised

Editor's decision: Accepted. Editor in Chief's decision: Accepted.

