

# Historical Trends in Smart City Governance for the Management of Ancient Urban Centers in Iran: A Case Study of Saqqez Municipality

Lucia. Nucci<sup>1</sup>  Akbar. Heydari<sup>2\*</sup>  Najmedin. Gilani<sup>3</sup>  Saleh. Aminpoor<sup>4</sup>  Yang. Liu<sup>5</sup>  Mehdi. Gheisari<sup>5</sup> 

<sup>1</sup> Department of Architecture, Roma Tre University, Rome, Italy

<sup>2</sup> Institute of Artificial Intelligence, Shaoxing University, Shaoxing, China & Department of Geography & Urban Planning, Ferdowsi University of Mashhad, Mashhad, Iran


<sup>3</sup> Department of History, Ferdowsi University of Mashhad, Mashhad, Iran

<sup>4</sup> Department of History, Payam Noor University, Tehran, Iran

<sup>5</sup> Department of Computer Science and Technology, Harbin Institute of Technology, China

\* Corresponding author email address: Heydariakbar@gmail.com

## Editor

Arpana Rai   
Assistant Professor, Indian Institute  
of Management, Udaipur, Mumbai,  
India  
arpana.raii@iimu.ac.in

## Reviewers

**Reviewer 1:** Abbas Monavarian   
Professor, Management Department, Tehran University, Tehran, Iran.  
Email: amonavar@ut.ac.ir  
**Reviewer 2:** Marco Yamba-Yugsi   
Unidad Académica de Posgrado, Universidad Católica de Cuenca, Azuay 010101,  
Ecuador  
Email: marco.yamba@ucacue.edu.ec

## 1. Round 1

### 1.1. Reviewer 1

Reviewer:

The paper mentions, "This rapid population growth coupled with structural inequalities and disparities in the provision of municipal services is expected to lead to significant social and economic challenges." Consider providing specific examples or case studies from relevant literature that detail the social and economic challenges in other smart city initiatives to strengthen this assertion.

The exclusion of certain indicators (IoT, Blockchain, etc.) is noted without justification. Please provide a rationale for these exclusions, especially if these technologies are central to smart city concepts globally.

The sentence, "Among the participants, 23 individuals (41.8%) were classified as experts representing the highest frequency within the study sample," would benefit from a more detailed breakdown of the participants' expertise. This could include their specific roles or departments to provide a clearer picture of the sample.

The statement "Although the development of a smart city significantly enhances the quality of life and offers numerous advantages" could be made more robust by including examples or references that demonstrate these enhancements in similar municipalities.

The recommendation to "unify various risk management entities" is a strong suggestion, but it would be beneficial to provide examples of where this approach has been successful in other cities or municipalities, strengthening the recommendation.

Authors revised the manuscript.

## 1.2. Reviewer 2

Reviewer:

The phrase "A smart city often referred to as a digital or informed city" might confuse readers who are not familiar with the terminology. It would be beneficial to define these terms explicitly or provide citations that distinguish them from each other.

The statement "By 2026 smart cities are projected to contribute \$20 trillion to the global economy" lacks a citation. Please provide a credible source or study that supports this projection to enhance the credibility of the claim.

The figure caption reads, "The city of Barcelone is one of the most advanced in terms of smart city." Please correct the spelling of "Barcelone" to "Barcelona." Additionally, consider providing a brief explanation within the caption regarding what specific aspects make Barcelona advanced as a smart city.

The methodology section mentions, "Indicators were gathered from various studies in the research process." It would be beneficial to list the key studies or references from which these indicators were drawn, providing a clear foundation for the selection criteria used.

It is mentioned that "the artificial intelligence index with a factor load of 0.79 and software with a factor load of 0.768 were the highest." To enhance clarity, please explain how these factor loadings were calculated and why these particular indicators were significant.

The paper discusses the importance of "electronic transactions" and "privacy." However, it would be beneficial to elaborate on specific examples of risks related to these areas within the context of Saqqez Municipality.

The phrase "establishment of a centralized data collection system is essential for effective risk management" would benefit from further explanation. Specifically, detail the kind of data that should be collected and how it would directly contribute to risk management efforts.

The recommendation to "recruit risk management professionals" is important, but it would be useful to specify the qualifications and skills that these professionals should possess, ensuring that the recommendation is actionable.

The suggestion to "strengthen inter-agency collaboration" could be enhanced by including a framework or model of how such collaboration could be structured within the municipality, perhaps drawing on examples from existing literature.

Authors revised the manuscript.

## 2. Revised

Editor's decision after revisions: Accepted.

Editor in Chief's decision: Accepted.