

Presenting a Citizenship Model for Cultural and Social Development of Virtual Space Users among Tehran Citizens

Seyed Abdol Reza. Hoseini¹, Nader. Sadeghi Lavasani^{2*}, Ruhollah. Ahmadzadeh Kermani³


¹ PhD Student, Department of Communication Sciences, Tehran Sharg branch, Islamic Azad University, Tehran, Iran

² Assistant Professor, Department of Communication, School of Human Sciences, Tehran East Branch, Islamic Azad University, Tehran, Iran



³ Assistant Professor, Department of Communication Sciences, Tehran Sharg branch, Islamic Azad University, Tehran, Iran

* Corresponding author email address: nadersadeghi1966@gmail.com

Editor

Mohammed Abdul Imran Khan
Department of Financial
Management and Economics,
Dhofar University, Oman
mimran@du.edu.om

Reviewers

Reviewer 1: **Reviewer 2:** Rezvan Hosseingholizadeh
Associate Professor, Department of Educational Management and Human Resource
Development, Ferdowsi University of Mashhad, Mashhad, Iran. Email:
rhgholizadeh@um.ac.ir
Reviewer 2: Hamid Rezaiefar
Assistant Professor, Department of Management, Birjand Branch, Islamic Azad
University, Birjand, Iran.
Email: h.rezaiefar@iaubir.ac.ir

1. Round 1

1.1. Reviewer 1

Reviewer:

The transition between urban growth and virtual space capabilities is abrupt. Consider adding a linking sentence to clarify how urban development issues lead to a focus on virtual space and citizenship education.

"The research method is quantitative in nature.": Expand on the specific nature of the field study. Clarify whether there were any ethical considerations or challenges during the data collection from social media users.

The process for validating the researcher-made questionnaire is incomplete. Specify how the experts were selected and include the total number of items in the final version of the questionnaire.

"Cronbach's alpha coefficient was used...": While reliability is mentioned, the actual Cronbach's alpha value should be reported to demonstrate the reliability of the measurement tool used in the study.

The coefficient of determination for "Effective civic engagement in citizen awareness" is 0.288, which is relatively low. It would be helpful to discuss whether this is still considered acceptable within the framework of the model.

"The results show that optimal structural behavioral and contextual conditions...": The sentence is too dense. Consider breaking it into two sentences for better readability, emphasizing the specific conditions separately for clarity.

"The model's GOF value of 0.368 indicates...": While this value is described as "good," it would be useful to include comparative examples from similar studies to provide context on the significance of this value.

The concluding statements summarize the findings but do not suggest specific policy implications or practical applications. Including suggestions for policymakers or virtual space platforms would make the conclusion more impactful.

Authors revised the manuscript.

1.2. Reviewer 2

Reviewer:

"Citizenship education is one of the important concepts...": This statement would benefit from specific references to key studies that emphasize the role of citizenship education in urban contexts, strengthening the foundation of the argument.

You mention "citizenship rights in developed countries have gone through institutionalization," but there's no reference to specific examples. Please include case studies or evidence from developed countries to support this claim.

"The study employs a structural equation modeling (SEM) approach...": Although SEM is introduced, a brief explanation of why this method is chosen and its advantages in this specific context would enhance the clarity for readers unfamiliar with SEM.

The rejection of hypotheses 5, 8, 9, and 10 should be further explored. Why might these particular hypotheses not align with the theoretical framework? Including potential reasons could strengthen the discussion.

You mention the significant moderating effect of extra-virtual space factors. This point would benefit from more elaboration, especially on which specific external factors (e.g., media influence) had the most impact and why.

"Intra-virtual space factors...": The reference to restrictive regulations and budgetary limitations lacks detailed examples. Consider providing real-world examples of these restrictions and their potential effects on civic engagement.

Authors revised the manuscript.

2. Revised

Editor's decision after revisions: Accepted.

Editor in Chief's decision: Accepted.