





Design and Validation of an Innovative University Model in Iraq Universities

AYAD RAZZAQ KADHIM ALAFARI¹, Maryam. Taghvaei Yazdi^{2*}, MUNA MOHAMMED ABBAS AL-KHATEEB³,
Kobra Emami Rizi⁴

¹ PhD Student, Department of Educational Management, Isfahan (Khorasgan) Branch, Islamic Azad University, Isfahan, Iran

² Associate Professor, Department of Educational Management, Sari Branch, Islamic Azad University, Sari, Iran

³ Assistant Professor, Department of Educational Sciences, College of Education, University of Babylon, Iraq

⁴ Assistant Professor, Department of Educational Sciences, Isfahan (Khorasgan) Branch, Islamic Azad University, Isfahan, Iran

* Corresponding author email address: m_taghvaeeyazdi@yahoo.com

Editor

Rezvan Hosseingholizadeh^{id}
Associate Professor, Department of
Educational Management and
Human Resource Development,
Ferdowsi University of Mashhad,
Mashhad, Iran
rhgholizadeh@um.ac.ir

Reviewers

Reviewer 1: Manijeh Haghhighinasab^{id}
Assistant Professor, Department of Management, Alzahra University, Tehran, Iran
Email: haghhighinasab@srbiau.ac.ir
Reviewer 2: Mehrdad Bayat^{id}
Assistant Professor, Department of Management, Payam Noor University, Tehran,
Iran.
Email: bayatmehrdad60@pnu.ac.ir

1. Round 1

1.1. Reviewer 1

Reviewer:

The phrase "universities play a vital role in advancing innovation and creating added value in society" requires a citation to support this claim.

The statement "validity was determined using CVR and CVI" requires a description of the thresholds used for these indices and how they align with established standards.

The process of categorizing 743 initial concepts into 79 final concepts needs clarification. Explain the criteria used for merging or removing concepts.

In Table 2, factor loadings for some items (e.g., "existence of intellectual property laws") are notably lower. Discuss the implications of these lower values on the overall dimension's reliability.

The GOF index is mentioned as exceeding 0.36. Since this is a critical indicator of model fit, include a comparison with benchmarks to contextualize this result.

The study compares its findings with Ghadimi et al. (2018) and Javanmardi et al. (2017). Include a critical evaluation of whether this study's findings contribute any novel theoretical advancements.

The recommendation for policymakers to use this model needs specific actionable steps or guidelines, such as strategies for improving "interaction and communication" dimensions.

Authors revised the manuscript and uploaded the new document.

1.2. Reviewer 2

Reviewer:

While discussing the theoretical framework, the study states, "innovation involves the organization's ability to generalize, abstract, and implement creative ideas." Provide specific examples of how this definition aligns with higher education practices in the context of Iraq.

The comparison to the "global innovation system" could benefit from a more detailed elaboration on how Iraqi universities differ or align with this system, supported by data or references.

The criteria for including experts in the qualitative phase is limited to "knowledge production within the past three years." Justify why this time frame was chosen and its relevance to the study.

The claim that "alignment with global models" is achieved should be substantiated with specific elements of these models (e.g., Triple Helix) that are reflected in the findings.

The challenges listed for Iraqi universities (e.g., "lack of essential infrastructure") are significant but lack depth. Provide data or examples to illustrate these challenges.

Authors revised the manuscript and uploaded the new document.

2. Revised

Editor's decision after revisions: Accepted.

Editor in Chief's decision: Accepted.