



Designing a Leadership Capabilities Model for Organizational Service Productivity (Case Study: The Public Banking Sector in Iraq)

Qasim Muhammad Abdul. Ali Al-Karaawi¹, Saeid. Aghasi^{2*}, Ahmed Abdullah Amanah Salem. Al Shamri³, Sayyed Mohammad Reza. Davoodi⁴

¹ PhD student, Department of Public Administration-Human Resources, Isfahan (Khorasgan) Branch, Islamic Azad University, Isfahan, Iran

² Assistant Professor, Social and Cultural Researches Center, Islamic Azad University, Dehaghan Branch, Dehaghan, Iran

³ Assistant Professor, Department of Business Administration, Faculty of Management and Economics, University of Karbala, Karbala, Iraq

⁴ Associate Professor, Department of Management, Dehaqan Branch, Islamic Azad University, Dehaqan, Iran

* Corresponding author email address: Sae_aghasi@yahoo.com

E d i t o r	R e v i e w e r s
Rey Segundo Guerrero-Proenza  Departamento de Inteligencia Computacional, Facultad 4, Universidad de las Ciencias Informáticas, La Habana, Cuba reysgp@uci.cu	Reviewer 1: Abbas Monavarian  Professor, Management Department, Tehran University, Tehran, Iran. Email: amonavar@ut.ac.ir Reviewer 2: Rezvan Hosseingholizadeh  Associate Professor, Department of Educational Management and Human Resource Development, Ferdowsi University of Mashhad, Mashhad, Iran. Email: rhgholizadeh@um.ac.ir

1. Round 1

1.1. Reviewer 1

Reviewer:

The abstract states that "leadership skills, particularly human skills and strategic management, significantly influence organizational outcomes such as citizenship behavior, decision-making, and performance." However, this assertion needs to be supported with specific results from the study. Consider adding a quantitative or qualitative summary of the findings.

The discussion introduces theoretical models from various sources, such as leadership styles in nursing and entrepreneurship in education. However, there is no clear connection between these models and the proposed leadership capability model in banking. Consider explicitly linking these concepts.

The model presents seven leadership capability dimensions, including "having strategic perspectives" and "possessing decision-making power." These categories are broad and overlap with general leadership theories. Consider refining or breaking down these dimensions using established leadership taxonomies.

One of the leadership dimensions identified is "Focusing on Customer Needs," which includes "setting customer-oriented goals." However, leadership capabilities are typically internally focused. Consider elaborating on why customer-centricity is categorized as a leadership capability.

Authors revised the manuscript and uploaded the new document.

1.2. Reviewer 2

Reviewer:

The methodology section states, "the research is applied in nature and uses a survey method. It is a qualitative study." However, there is an inconsistency between calling it a "survey method" and a "qualitative study." Since surveys are typically quantitative, consider rephrasing or clarifying how the survey data was qualitatively analyzed.

The findings mention "out of 60 categories, seven dimensions were extracted." However, there is no indication of how these categories were identified or any inter-coder reliability measure to verify the thematic analysis. Consider including a Cohen's Kappa coefficient or another measure of coding agreement.

The findings state, "academic professors and experts have the highest average age of 45.20 years, while the combined academic-executive experts in the banking sector have the lowest average age of 43.19 years." However, in the next sentence, it is mentioned that "executive experts in the banking sector have the highest level of experience, with an average of 45.20 years." This creates confusion—please clarify if the number for age is mistakenly reported.

While references to prior studies are included, the study does not explicitly compare the leadership capabilities identified in Iraq's banking sector with those in other countries or sectors. A comparative analysis would enhance the originality of the work.

The study states that "the final step involved defining and naming the themes," but it does not describe how thematic saturation was determined. Clarifying when saturation was reached and how themes were refined would strengthen methodological rigor.

The study refers to "transformational leadership" under "Ability to Facilitate Changes" and "Servant Leadership" under "Possessing Suitable Personal Characteristics." However, transformational and servant leadership are distinct leadership theories. Clarify how these were integrated into a single model.

Authors revised the manuscript and uploaded the new document.

2. Revised

Editor's decision after revisions: Accepted.

Editor in Chief's decision: Accepted.