

Article history: Received 22 January 2024 Revised 20 February 2024 Accepted 25 February 2024 Published online 01 March 2024

Journal of Assessment and Research in Applied Counseling

Open peer-review report



E-ISSN: 3041-8518

Effectiveness of Cognitive-Based Mindfulness on Self-Compassion and Integrative Self-Knowledge in Individuals with Borderline Personality Disorder

Somayeh. Sadeghian Lemraski 10, Hamzeh. Akbari 20, Arastoo. Mirani 30

¹ PhD Student, Department of Psychology, Gorgan Branch, Islamic Azad University, Gorgan, Iran
² Assistant Professor, Department of Psychology, Azadshahr Branch, Islamic Azad University, Azadshahr, Iran
³ Assistant Professor, Department of Psychology, Gorgan Branch, Islamic Azad University, Gorgan, Iran

* Corresponding author email address: akbarihamze@yahoo.com

| Editor | Reviewers |
|------------------------------------|---|
| Valiolah Farzad® | Reviewer 1: Fatemeh Mohammadi shirmahaleh® |
| Department of Psychology and | Assistant Professor, Department of Psychology, Karaj Branch, Islamic Azad |
| Counseling, KMAN Research | University, Karaj, Iran. Email: fatemeh.mohammadi@kiau.ac.ir |
| Institute, Richmond Hill, Ontario, | Reviewer 2: Bita Nasrollahi |
| Canada | Assistant Professor, Department of General Psychology, Science and Research |
| v.farzad@kmanresce.ca | Branch, Islamic Azad University, Tehran, Iran. nasrolahi@srbiau.ac.ir |

1. Round 1

1.1. Reviewer 1

Reviewer:

The overview of borderline personality disorder and its comparison with other personality disorders lacks citations from recent meta-analyses or systematic reviews that could strengthen the claims. Consider incorporating up-to-date literature to substantiate the epidemiological data and symptomatology discussed.

The selection criteria and process appear somewhat vague. It is recommended to provide more detailed information on how the diagnosis was confirmed beyond just the interview, perhaps including secondary evaluations or the involvement of multiple clinicians to ensure diagnostic accuracy.

The description of the intervention lacks specific details about the mindfulness techniques and cognitive strategies employed. Include a more detailed account of the intervention protocols used, possibly appending a session-by-session breakdown to enhance replicability.



The statistical analysis mentions the use of repeated measures ANOVA but does not discuss the handling of potential covariates such as age and gender, which could impact the outcomes. Consider including a multivariate approach to account for these variables.

There is a causal tone when discussing the effects of the intervention on the outcomes, which is not supported by the quasi-experimental design of the study. It is advisable to rephrase these interpretations to reflect the correlational nature of the findings or to discuss the limitations more robustly related to causality.

Authors revised the manuscript and uploaded the document.

1.2. Reviewer 2

Reviewer:

Refine the abstract to include specific data points from the results, such as effect sizes or confidence intervals, to provide a clearer snapshot of the study's outcomes at first glance.

The flow from discussing general aspects of borderline personality disorder to specific therapeutic interventions is abrupt. Add a transitional sentence to better connect these sections.

The description of the SCID-II could be enhanced by adding a sentence about its specific relevance and efficacy in diagnosing borderline personality disorder, perhaps citing validation studies.

Ensure that all tables are clearly titled and described within the text. There is a lack of integration between the textual data presentation and the tables. Adding brief descriptions of each table in the text could improve readability and understanding.

The link between the theoretical framework of mindfulness and the observed outcomes is underexplored. A deeper discussion of how specific aspects of mindfulness could impact self-compassion and self-knowledge in BPD patients would enrich the narrative.

This section could be expanded to specify the contributions of each collaborator, particularly in terms of how they supported the research process, to enhance transparency.

Some references are outdated, and recent literature that discusses the advancements in cognitive-based mindfulness therapies for borderline personality disorder should be added to reflect the current state of research.

Authors revised the manuscript and uploaded the document.

2. Revised

Editor's decision: Accepted.

Editor in Chief's decision: Accepted.