

Article history: Received 26 March 2023 Accepted 17 June 2023 Published online 20 June 2023

Journal of Assessment and Research in Applied Counseling

Open peer-review report



Comparison of the Effectiveness of the Healthy Human Training Package and Cognitive-Behavioral Training on Interpersonal Forgiveness and Parental Relationship of Adolescents

Zahra. Arfeh¹, Asghar. Aghaei Jeshvaghani^{2*}

¹ Department of Psychology, Isfahan (Khorasgan) Branch, Islamic Azad University, Isfahan, Iran ² Professor, Department of Psychology, Isfahan (Khorasgan) Branch, Islamic Azad University Isfahan, Iran

* Corresponding author email address: aghaeipsy@gmail.com

Editor	R e v i e w e r s
Valiolah Farzad [®]	Reviewer 1: Abolghasem Khoshkonesh [®]
Department of Psychology and	Assistant Professor, Counseling Department, Shahid Beheshti University, Tehran,
Counseling, KMAN Research	Iran. Email: akhoshkonesh@sbu.ac.ir
Institute, Richmond Hill, Ontario,	Reviewer 2: Gholamreza Rajabi
Canada	Professor, Counseling Department, Shahid Chamran University, Ahvaz, Iran.
v.farzad@kmanresce.ca	rajabireza@scu.ac.ir

1. Round 1

1.1. Reviewer 1

Reviewer:

The opening sentence of the introduction, "Among various developmental stages, adolescence requires greater attention due to the significant biological and psychological transformations associated with it," could be enriched by incorporating specific data or statistics to establish the magnitude and significance of these transformations.

The description of the "Healthy Human Training Package" outlines each session comprehensively. However, please clarify whether these sessions were led by a certified professional and how fidelity to the intervention protocol was ensured.

The phrase "The control group received no intervention during the study process" would benefit from a more detailed rationale explaining why no placebo or alternative activity was offered, which might account for the observed effects.

In discussing the Heartland Forgiveness Scale and the Parental Relationship Questionnaire, you mention past reliability data. It would be helpful to specify if these measures were re-evaluated for reliability and validity within your specific sample.



For the Parental Relationship measure, detail how reverse scoring affects the interpretation of results. Explicitly state if any participants required assistance or if scoring involved multiple raters to reduce subjectivity.

In Table 1, "The results showed significant differences between the experimental groups and the control group," it would be beneficial to include effect sizes directly in the text and discuss their practical implications alongside statistical significance.

The reference to the Shapiro-Wilk and Mauchly tests in the findings is essential, but please specify the actual values and how assumptions influence the robustness of the ANOVA results.

Authors revised the manuscript and uploaded the document.

1.2. Reviewer 2

Reviewer:

In the paragraph beginning "Forgiveness plays a fundamental role in fostering affection and preventing cycles of negative interaction," the reference to Islamic teachings is appreciated. However, linking this with more recent psychological literature could strengthen the argument.

In "Forgiveness is not forgetfulness but a state of self-awareness requiring insight and personal effort," consider including a citation to support this definition, ensuring a solid connection between religious and psychological perspectives.

In the sentence "Using convenience sampling, 45 students were selected," please elaborate on why convenience sampling was chosen over other methods and discuss potential biases introduced.

The explanation for the "greater impact of the Healthy Human Training Package on interpersonal forgiveness" needs more depth. Discuss the psychological mechanisms at play, citing relevant theories that explain why this intervention might be more effective.

In your discussion of parental relationships, linking the results with attachment theory or other established frameworks could offer deeper insights into the mechanisms of change.

When discussing the similarity in effects on parental relationships, it would be insightful to compare your findings with other studies that used similar interventions to contextualize the outcomes.

Authors revised the manuscript and uploaded the document.

2. Revised

Editor's decision after revisions: Accepted. Editor in Chief's decision: Accepted.

