

Article history: Received 13 February 2024 Revised 07 April 2024 Accepted 12 April 2024 Published online 01 June 2024

Journal of Assessment and Research in Applied Counseling

Open peer-review report



E-ISSN: 3041-8518

Effectiveness of Short-term Intensive Dynamic Psychotherapy on the Severity of Gastrointestinal Symptoms and Depression in Patients with the Diarrhea Subtype of Irritable Bowel Syndrome

Mohammad Reza. Hajrezaei^{1*}, Seyedeh Sanaz. Sazesh Rahbarjou², Ahmad. Shamsaldini³

M.A. of Clinical Psychology, Department of Psychology, Qom Branch, Islamic Azad University, Qom, Iran
M.A. of General Psychology, Department of Psychology, Ahrar Institute of Higher Education, Rasht, Iran
M.A. of Clinical Psychology, Department of Psychology, Ayatollah Amoli Branch, Islamic Azad University, Amol, Iran

* Corresponding author email address: Hajrezaeimohammadreza@gmail.com

Editor	Reviewers
Izet Pehlić®	Reviewer 1: Branimir Nešić
Full professor for Educational	Department of Social Sciences, Sportska Akademija Beograd, Serbia.
sciences, Islamic pedagogical	Email: bneshich@mail.ru
faculty of the University of Zenica,	Reviewer 2: Dušan Perić 👨
Bosnia and Herzegovina	Faculty of sport and tourism, Educons University, Novi Sad, Serbia.
izet.pehlic@unze.ba	Email: dusan.peric@tims.edu.rs

1. Round 1

1.1. Reviewer 1

Reviewer:

While the introduction and background provide a comprehensive overview of the relationship between IBS, depression, and the theoretical framework of dynamic psychotherapy, it would be beneficial to include a more detailed comparison with other therapeutic approaches to IBS and depression. Specifically, how does dynamic psychotherapy compare in effectiveness to cognitive-behavioral therapies and medication management? This would place your findings within a broader context of treatment options.

The methodology section is well-detailed but could benefit from further clarification on the selection criteria for the purposive sampling. Given the specificity of your sample (IBS-diarrhea subtype with concurrent depression), elaborating on the rationale for the number of sessions and the interval between follow-up assessments could provide readers with a clearer understanding of the treatment protocol's design.



You briefly address limitations such as sample size and the reliance on self-report measures. Expanding this section to discuss potential biases and how they might affect the generalizability of the results would strengthen the paper. Additionally, suggesting specific future research directions that could address these limitations would be valuable.

Ensure that all references are up to date and consider including recent studies that have been published since your literature review was conducted. This could provide a more comprehensive background and support for your study's significance.

Minor typographical and formatting errors should be corrected to enhance the manuscript's overall readability and professionalism. For instance, ensuring consistent formatting in the references section and checking for any grammatical mistakes throughout the text.

Authors revised and uploaded the document.

1.2. Reviewer 2

Reviewer:

The connection between dynamic psychotherapy, IBS, and depression is intriguing but warrants a deeper theoretical exploration. How does dynamic psychotherapy specifically address the unique psychosomatic interplay in IBS with concurrent depression? More detailed theoretical underpinning could strengthen the argument for why this therapy is particularly suited for these patients.

Your study posits dynamic psychotherapy as an effective treatment modality, yet it lacks a robust comparison with other therapeutic interventions. A more thorough analysis of how this method stands in comparison to, for instance, cognitive-behavioral therapy (CBT), medication, or other psychotherapeutic interventions in treating IBS and depression could offer valuable insights.

The choice of methodology, particularly the single-case design and the purposive sampling strategy, needs further justification. Why is this design optimal for your research questions? How do the chosen methods align with or diverge from established research protocols in psychotherapy research? Expanding on these aspects could enhance the methodological rigor of the study.

The current limitations section could be expanded to more thoroughly discuss the implications of the study's design choices, the potential for bias in self-reported measures, and the short duration of follow-up. Moreover, acknowledging the absence of a control group and exploring the potential for placebo effects would strengthen the manuscript.

Authors revised and uploaded the document.

2. Revised

Editor's decision after revisions: Accepted. Editor in Chief's decision: Accepted.

