


Comparing the Effectiveness of Cognitive Behavioral Play Therapy and Gestalt Play Therapy on Vandalistic Behaviors, Impulsivity, and Cognitive Flexibility in Aggressive Male Elementary Students

Sahar. Tavakoli¹, Fatemeh. Abbasi², Behnam. Heydari³, Majid. Akhondzadeh^{4*}



¹ M.A., Department of Psychology, Marvdasht Branch, Islamic Azad University, Marvdasht, Iran
² M.A. Student, Department of Psychology, Central Tehran Branch, Islamic Azad University, Tehran, Iran
³ M.A. Student, Department of Psychology, Shiraz Pardis Branch, Islamic Azad University, Shiraz, Iran
⁴ M.A., Department of Counseling, Ferdowsi University of Mashhad, Mashhad, Iran

* Corresponding author email address: M.akhondzadeh@gmail.com

Editor

Parvaneh Mohammadkhani¹
Professor, Department of Clinical Psychology, University of Rehabilitation Sciences and Social Health, Tehran, Iran. Email: Pa.mohammadkhani@uswr.ac.ir

Reviewers

Reviewer 1: RoodiHooshmandi¹
Department of Psychology and Counseling, KMAN Research Institute, Richmond Hill, Ontario, Canada. Email: Roodihooshmandi@kmanresce.ca
Reviewer 2: Seyed Ali Darbani¹
Assistant Professor, Department of Psychology and Counseling, South Tehran Branch, Islamic Azad University, Tehran, Iran
Ali.darbani@iau.ac.ir

1. Round 1

1.1. Reviewer 1

Reviewer:

The current literature review could benefit from a more integrated discussion on the mechanisms through which Cognitive Behavioral Play Therapy (CBPT) and Gestalt Play Therapy (GPT) influence cognitive flexibility, impulsivity, and vandalistic behaviors. It's advisable to also compare these mechanisms against existing models of aggressive behavior management in children, providing a clearer theoretical linkage.

The method section should clarify why the specific age range of 7 to 12 years was selected. It would be beneficial to discuss the developmental considerations influencing therapy outcomes at these ages, as it can help in understanding the generalizability of the findings.

The discussion section could be strengthened by explicitly linking the research findings to practical implications for educators, counselors, and therapists. Offering specific recommendations for implementing these therapies in school settings or clinical practice would make the findings more actionable.

Authors revised and uploaded the document.

1.2. Reviewer 2

Reviewer:

The manuscript does not specify if the control group received any form of intervention or engagement during the study period. Detailing these activities, or the lack thereof, is essential to evaluate the potential placebo effects or the impact of attention alone on the observed outcomes.

While purposive non-random sampling was used for participant selection, a justification for this choice should be provided, especially concerning how it might affect the reliability and validity of the results. Discussing the potential biases introduced by this sampling method would enhance the manuscript's rigor.

Expand the explanation of the statistical methods used, especially the choice of repeated measures ANOVA. Additionally, the assumption checks (sphericity, homogeneity of variance) should be discussed in more detail to assure the reader of the robustness of the findings.

While the paper describes the tools used for measuring impulsivity, vandalistic behaviors, and cognitive flexibility, it should also discuss the validity and reliability of these tools within the context of the current study's demographic.

The description of the CBPT and GPT sessions should include more detail on the specific activities and their intended therapeutic impacts. This would help in understanding how each session contributes to the overall therapy goals.

Expand on the ethical considerations by detailing any potential risks to the participants involved in the therapy sessions, especially given the vulnerable age group and the nature of their behavioral issues.

Authors revised and uploaded the document.

2. Revised

Editor's decision after revisions: Accepted.

Editor in Chief's decision: Accepted.