

Article history: Received 11 May 2024 Revised 14 July 2024 Accepted 27 July 2024 Published online 01 October 2024

Journal of Assessment and Research in Applied Counseling

Open peer-review report



Comparison of the Effectiveness of Acceptance and Commitment Therapy and Emotion-Focused Therapy on the Burden of Caregivers of Individuals with Dementia

Zahra. Pourmand¹^(b), Pantea. Jahangir^{2*}^(b), Simindokht. Rezakhani²^(b)

¹ Ph. D Student, Counseling Department, Roudehen Branch, Islamic Azad University, Roudehen, Iran ² Assistant Professor, Counseling Department, Roudehen Branch, Islamic Azad University, Roudehen, Iran

* Corresponding author email address: panteajahangir@gmail.com

Editor	R e v i e w e r s
Nadereh Saadati	Reviewer 1: Mehdi. Ghezelseflo
Department of Psychology and	Assistant Professor, Department of Psychology, Gonbad Kavos University, Gonbad
Counseling, KMAN Research	Kavos, Iran. Email: ghezelsefloo@gonbad.ac.ir
Institute, Richmond Hill, Ontario,	Reviewer 2: Seyed Hadi Seyed Alitabar ^D
Canada	Department of Psychology and Counseling, KMAN Research Institute, Richmond
nsaadati@kmanresce.ca	Hill, Ontario, Canada. Email: hadialitabar@kmanresce.ca

1. Round 1

1.1. Reviewer 1

Reviewer:

The sentence "Dementia syndrome refers to a collection of symptoms that affect an individual's memory thinking and social abilities leading to disruptions in daily functioning (Woods et al. 2023)" needs clarification. Please specify which aspects of daily functioning are most commonly affected by dementia.

The description of the Caregiver Burden Inventory (CBI) could be enhanced by including a brief discussion on its psychometric properties, including its reliability and validity in similar populations.

In the section "Acceptance and Commitment Therapy," it would be helpful to include more detail on the specific exercises used in each session. For example, in Session 3 (Acceptance), elaborate on the "Healing Hands" exercise.

For the "Emotion-Focused Therapy" section, consider adding a brief explanation of how the therapeutic relationship was monitored and measured throughout the intervention.

The statement "The findings suggest that ACT had a greater impact on reducing the burden of caregivers of individuals with dementia compared to EFT" could be strengthened by discussing potential reasons for this difference and how these findings align with or diverge from existing literature.

Authors revised and uploaded the document.

1.2. Reviewer 2

Reviewer:

"Other symptoms related to dementia include difficulties in thinking problem-solving and language and speech problems" - Consider providing more recent references to support these claims and potentially expanding on the cognitive domains most impacted by dementia.

The selection of participants using a convenience sampling method might limit the generalizability of the findings. Discuss the potential biases introduced by this method and how they might affect the study results.

"Primary caregivers of elderly dementia patients were requested to respond to the Caregiver Burden Inventory (CBI) while ensuring confidentiality voluntary participation absence of illness history and non-receipt of treatment (medication and psychotherapy)." - It would be beneficial to specify how these criteria were verified and any steps taken to minimize selection bias.

Clarify how the assumptions of the multivariate covariance analysis were specifically tested using SPSS, and provide the exact values for each assumption test.

The table presenting means and standard deviations for caregiver burden should include a note explaining how the data were normalized or standardized if applicable.

The phrase "The Kolmogorov-Smirnov test was used to examine the assumption of normality of score distribution" - Consider including the specific p-values and test statistics for transparency.

Authors revised and uploaded the document.

2. Revised

Editor's decision after revisions: Accepted. Editor in Chief's decision: Accepted.

