

Article history: Received 25 March 2024 Revised 27 April 2024 Accepted 13 May 2024 Published online 01 July 2024

Journal of Assessment and Research in Applied Counseling

Open peer-review report



Effectiveness of Short-term Dynamic Mentalization-based Therapy on Maternal Reflective Capacity and the Mother-Child Relationship

Tanya. Darabi¹^(b), Naser. Amini^{2*}^(b), Mouloud. Keykhosrovani²^(b)

¹ PhD student, Department of Psychology, Bushehr Branch, Islamic Azad University, Bushehr, Iran ² Assistant Professor, Department of Psychology, Bushehr Branch, Islamic Azad University, Bushehr, Iran

* Corresponding author email address: amini_n2010@yahoo.com

Editor	R e v i e w e r s
Habib Hadianfard 💿	Reviewer 1: Seyed Ali Darbani
Professor, Department of	Assistant Professor, Department of Psychology and Counseling, South Tehran
Psychology, Shiraz University, Iran	Branch, Islamic Azad University, Tehran, Iran Email: Ali.darbani@iau.ac.ir
Email: hadianfd@shirazu.ac.ir	Reviewer 2: Hooman Namvar [®]
	Assisstant Professor, Department of Psychology, Saveh Branch, Islamic Azad
	University, Saveh, Iran. Email: hnamvar@iau-saveh.ac.ir

1. Round 1

1.1. Reviewer 1

Reviewer:

"The research design is described as a quasi-experimental pre-test post-test with a control group. Please clarify whether randomization was employed within the convenience sampling method to strengthen the validity of the experimental and control groups."

"The introduction of mentalizing capacity is thorough; however, it could be improved by explaining how it directly relates to the study's hypothesis about improving maternal reflective capacity and the mother-child relationship."

"The criteria for inclusion and exclusion are briefly mentioned. Expanding on how these criteria were operationalized and any screening processes used would enhance the replicability of the study."

"The validity and reliability of the measures used (e.g., Parental Reflective Functioning Questionnaire) are mentioned, but details on how these were specifically assessed within your sample would be beneficial."

"While the session contents are outlined, it would be helpful to include more detailed descriptions or examples of the activities and exercises used in each session to allow for replication of the intervention."

"The statistical methods are listed, but the assumptions for ANCOVA are only briefly mentioned. Providing a more detailed justification for the use of ANCOVA and how assumptions were tested would strengthen this section."

"The table presents means and standard deviations but lacks a clear indication of sample sizes for each group at each stage. Including this information would clarify the analysis and support the validity of the findings."

"The table reports significant findings, but including confidence intervals for the effect sizes would provide a clearer picture of the precision and reliability of the results."

"The discussion of Mauchly's test of sphericity is good, but adding a brief explanation of what this test assesses and why its non-significance is important would be beneficial for readers less familiar with this statistic."

"The discussion of results in relation to previous studies is strong, but it would be enhanced by acknowledging any limitations in previous research that your study addresses."

Authors revised and uploaded the document.

1.2. Reviewer 2

Reviewer:

"The results section states significant differences but does not provide effect sizes or p-values. Including these statistics would enhance the transparency and robustness of the reported findings."

"The introduction mentions 'psychological damages in adulthood' as a consequence of childhood experiences. Consider rephrasing this to 'psychological issues or disorders' for clarity and accuracy."

"The discussion on the importance of the mother-child relationship is well-founded, but it would benefit from additional recent references beyond 2023 to provide a more current context for the study."

"The impact of therapy on mentalization is discussed thoroughly; however, including participant feedback or qualitative data could provide a richer understanding of the therapy's impact."

"The discussion mentions the reduction in defensive mechanisms, which is critical. It would be useful to expand on how this reduction was measured or observed during the sessions."

"The suggestion to conduct similar studies in different cultural contexts is important. Consider proposing specific variables that might be influenced by cultural differences to guide future research."

"The recommendation for longitudinal studies is excellent. Including suggestions for specific follow-up periods (e.g., 6 months, 1 year) and what variables should be tracked would provide clearer guidance for future research."

Authors revised and uploaded the document.

2. Revised

Editor's decision after revisions: Accepted. Editor in Chief's decision: Accepted.

