




Comparison of the Effectiveness of Cognitive Moral Education and Moral Action Education on the Academic Identity of Female Students with a Positive Attitude Toward Academic Cheating




Maryam. Fallahpour¹, Ramezan. Hassanzadeh^{2*}, Seyedeh Olia. Emadian³

¹ Ph.D. student, Department of Psychology, Sari Branch, Islamic Azad University, Sari, Iran

² Professor, Department of Psychology, Sari Branch, Islamic Azad University, Sari, Iran

³ Assistant Professor, Department of Psychology, Sari Branch, Islamic Azad University, Sari, Iran

* Corresponding author email address: rhassanzadehd@yahoo.com

Editor	Reviewers
Mehdi Rostami  Department of Psychology and Counseling, KMAN Research Institute, Richmond Hill, Ontario, Canada. mehdirostami@kmanresce.ca	Reviewer 1: Emad Yousefi  Assistant Professor, Department of Psychology, Qeshm Branch, Islamic Azad University, Qeshm, Iran. Email: emadyousefi@iua.ac.ir Reviewer 2: Farzaneh Mardani  Department of Psychology and Counseling, KMAN Research Institute, Richmond Hill, Ontario, Canada. Email: Farzanehmardani@kmanresce.ca

1. Round 1

1.1. Reviewer 1

Reviewer:

The sentence "Cheating is recognized as an unethical activity in the academic environment..." could benefit from a citation. It would strengthen the argument by providing a source for this widely accepted notion.

The inclusion and exclusion criteria are detailed, but the rationale for selecting second-year high school students specifically is not provided. Please clarify why this particular group was chosen for the study.

The description of the Academic Identity Questionnaire lacks details on how the questionnaire was validated in the Iranian context. Including information on the validation process and any cultural adaptations made would strengthen the methodological rigor.

The session descriptions are informative, but there is no mention of how participant engagement was monitored or encouraged throughout the program. Consider including details on strategies used to maintain engagement during the sessions.

The educational content of the moral action program is described, but the theoretical basis for including specific content (e.g., self-awareness, emotional intelligence) is not clearly explained. Adding a brief rationale for each component would improve the theoretical grounding.

The table provides a clear overview of academic identity across the groups, but it is not immediately clear whether the differences observed are statistically significant. Consider adding a column or notation to indicate significance levels.

The sentence "There were no significant differences between the three groups in a one-way ANOVA analysis ($P = 0.758$)" is unclear in its relevance. It would be helpful to explain what this result implies for the overall study.

Authors revised and uploaded the document.

1.2. Reviewer 2

Reviewer:

The statement "Academic identity reflects various types of competence autonomy purposefulness..." could be expanded to include a brief explanation or examples of how these factors manifest in an academic setting to clarify their relevance to academic identity.

The mention of the "four statuses of academic identity" by Vaz and Isaacson (2008) is crucial, but the description provided is somewhat dense. Consider breaking this explanation into separate sentences or bullet points for each identity status to improve readability.

The sample size calculation mentions the use of G*Power software, but it does not provide details on the effect size, power, or alpha level used in the calculation. Including these parameters would enhance the transparency of the study design.

The discussion states that "cognitive moral education had an impact on the academic identity..." but does not explain how this finding compares to previous research. Please consider providing a comparison with past studies to contextualize your results.

The statement "Cognitive moral mechanisms separate individuals' internal standards from their behavior making them effective" is conceptually dense. Clarifying this statement or providing an example would help the reader understand the mechanism being described.

The discussion of moral action education's impact on academic identity is insightful but could be strengthened by discussing potential limitations or challenges in applying this education in different cultural contexts.

The conclusion effectively summarizes the findings, but it lacks a discussion of the broader implications of the study. Consider elaborating on how these results might influence educational practices or policies.

Authors revised and uploaded the document.

2. Revised

Editor's decision after revisions: Accepted.

Editor in Chief's decision: Accepted.