Comparison of the Effectiveness of Transactional Analysis Therapy and Narrative Therapy on Fear of Intimacy in Women Affected by Marital Infidelity

Naghmeh. Fazel Hamedan[1] , Mohammad. Oraki[2*] , Mehran. Azadi[3]

[1] Ph.D. Student in Counseling, Department of Psychology and Counseling, North Tehran Branch, Islamic Azad University, Tehran, Iran
[2] Professor, Department of Psychology, Payame Noor University, Tehran, Iran
[3] Assistant Professor, Department of Psychology, South Tehran Branch, Islamic Azad University, Tehran, Iran

* Corresponding author email address: M.oraki@pnu.ac.ir

1. Round 1

1.1. Reviewer 1

Reviewer:

The sentence "Marital infidelity is a distressing issue for spouses and families and is a common phenomenon for marriage and family therapists" could benefit from specific statistical data or references to studies that quantify the prevalence and impact of marital infidelity globally or within specific regions.

It is mentioned that the "original form consists of 40 statements," but only 20 items related to forgiveness were used. Clarify why the other 20 items were excluded and how this impacts the overall validity and reliability of the scale used in this study.

The session on "Identifying Cognitive Distortions" should provide examples of the specific distortions discussed and the methods used to address them. This detail would help in understanding the depth and focus of the intervention.

When discussing "Identifying Dysfunctional Patterns," it would be helpful to explain the specific tools or methods used to help participants recognize these patterns. Providing this detail would enhance the reproducibility of the study.

The mean and standard deviation values indicate a significant change in fear of intimacy scores; however, consider adding a brief interpretation of these values within the table caption to guide the reader in understanding the practical significance of these changes.

The use of mixed ANOVA is appropriate, but the section would benefit from a more detailed explanation of the statistical assumptions tested (normality, sphericity) and how violations were addressed (e.g., using Greenhouse-Geisser correction).

The explanation of how transactional analysis therapy reduces fear of intimacy would be strengthened by providing specific examples or case studies from the intervention sessions that illustrate the process described.

Authors revised and uploaded the document.

1.2. Reviewer 2

Reviewer:

In the sentence "Marital infidelity is one of the primary reasons couples seek divorce and attend family counseling clinics," consider providing specific statistics or referencing studies that highlight the percentage of divorces or counseling sessions attributed to infidelity.

The phrase "unfortunately there are no precise statistics in Iran" would benefit from a discussion on why this is the case. Are there cultural, legal, or methodological reasons for the lack of data? Adding this context would strengthen the argument.

When discussing the effectiveness of different therapeutic approaches, it would be beneficial to include more recent references or studies beyond 2020 to ensure that the information is current and reflects the latest research trends.

The inclusion and exclusion criteria are comprehensive; however, including the rationale for each criterion would provide a clearer understanding of why these specific criteria were chosen and how they ensure the reliability and validity of the study.

The sentence "Participants completed the research questionnaire as a pre-test before the intervention" should specify what other baseline measures (if any) were taken to control for external variables that might influence the outcomes.

The discussion on narrative therapy would benefit from including a more detailed analysis of how changes in narrative or storytelling can lead to reduced fear of intimacy. Providing direct quotes or excerpts from participant narratives could enhance this section.

The statement "Transactional analysis therapy has a greater effect on reducing fear of intimacy compared to narrative therapy" should be supported by a more in-depth comparison of the effect sizes and statistical significance values to justify this conclusion.

When summarizing the effectiveness of the interventions, it would be helpful to include a discussion on the practical applications of these findings for clinicians and how they can be integrated into existing therapeutic practices.

Authors revised and uploaded the document.

2. Revised

Editor's decision after revisions: Accepted.
Editor in Chief's decision: Accepted.