




Comparison of the Effectiveness of Mindfulness-Based Cognitive Therapy and Behavioral Activation on Irrational Thoughts and Depression in Generalized Anxiety Disorder

Jafar. Asvadi Ghoshe Gonabadi¹, Abolfazl. Bakhshipour^{2*}, Hossein. Akbari Armaghan³


¹ PhD student, Department of Psychology, Bojnord Branch, Islamic Azad University, Bojnord, Iran

² Assistant Professor, Department of Psychology, Bojnord Branch, Islamic Azad University, Bojnord, Iran


³ Assistant Professor, Department of Counseling, Quchan Branch, Islamic Azad University, Quchan, Iran


* Corresponding author email address: ab8boj@gmail.com

Editor

Gholamreza Rajabi¹
Professor, Counseling Department,
Shahid Chamran University, Ahvaz,
Iran. rajabireza@scu.ac.ir

Reviewers

Reviewer 1: Zahra Yousefi¹
Assistant Professor, Department of Psychology, Isfahan Branch (Khorasgan), Islamic
Azad University, Isfahan, Iran. Email: Z.yousefi1393@khuisf.ac.ir

Reviewer 2: Mohsen Golparvar¹
Professor, Department of Psychology, Isfahan Branch (Khorasgan), Islamic Azad
University, Isfahan, Iran. mgolparvar@khuisf.ac.ir

1. Round 1

1.1. Reviewer 1

Reviewer:

The inclusion criteria specify age 20 to 50, but there is no justification for this age range. Please provide a rationale for why participants outside this age range were excluded from the study.

The control group is mentioned briefly, but it is not clear what, if any, activities they engaged in during the intervention period. Clarifying whether the control group had any form of placebo or alternative intervention would strengthen the comparison between groups.

While Cronbach's alpha values are reported for the various scales, it would be useful to mention if these values are specific to this study sample or if they are taken from previous literature. Reporting reliability metrics specifically calculated from the current sample would improve transparency.

The repeated measures ANOVA results are reported, but the interaction effects (Time * Group) should be further explained. Discussing the implications of these interaction effects in more detail could provide deeper insights into the study's findings.

The ANOVA results are reported with F-values and p-values, but effect sizes are mentioned without much detail. Including a discussion on the magnitude of these effect sizes and their practical significance would enhance the interpretation of the results.

Authors revised and uploaded the document.

1.2. Reviewer 2

Reviewer:

The use of convenience sampling is noted, but this method can introduce bias. It would be beneficial to discuss the potential impact of this sampling method on the study's findings and suggest ways this limitation might be addressed in future research.

The description of the MBCT and BA interventions is somewhat general. Including more detail about the specific activities and exercises in each session would enhance replicability. For example, specify what "homework" was assigned and how compliance was measured.

The Bonferroni post-hoc test results show comparisons between groups, but there is no discussion on the implications of these findings. Adding a paragraph to explain what these comparisons reveal about the effectiveness of MBCT versus BA would be helpful.

The non-significant difference in the effectiveness of MBCT and BA on irrational thoughts ($p = .144$) and depression ($p = .950$) is noted. However, the discussion lacks depth regarding the possible reasons for this outcome. Including a discussion on why these therapies might not differ in effectiveness would be beneficial.

Authors revised and uploaded the document.

2. Revised

Editor's decision after revisions: Accepted.

Editor in Chief's decision: Accepted.