Comparison of the Effectiveness of Imago Therapy for Emotional Breakup with Cognitive-Behavioral Therapy Focused on Trauma on Affective Capital and Depression in Adolescent Girls

Mehri. Fatehi[1] , Mohsen. Golparvar[2*] , Ali. Mahdad[3]

[1] PhD Student in Psychology, Department of Psychology, Isfahan (Khorasgan) Branch, Islamic Azad University, Isfahan, Iran
[2] Professor, Department of Psychology, Faculty of Psychology and Educational Sciences, Isfahan (Khorasgan) Branch, Islamic Azad University, Isfahan, Iran
[3] Associate Professor, Department of Psychology, Isfahan (Khorasgan) Branch, Islamic Azad University, Isfahan, Iran

* Corresponding author email address: drmgolparvar@gmail.com

E d i t o r	R e v i e w e r s
Sefa Bulut	**Reviewer 1:** Mustafa Subasi
Department of Counseling Psychology & Head of the Counseling Center, Ibn Haldun University, Istanbul, Turkey sefa.bulut@ihu.edu.tr	PhD Student at National Research University Higher School of Economics, Russia. Email: msubasi@hse.ru
	Reviewer 2: Hakan Karaman
	Department of Counseling Psychology & Head of the Counseling Center, Ibn Haldun University, Istanbul, Turkey. hakan.karaman@iuc.edu.tr

1. Round 1

1.1. Reviewer 1

Reviewer:

"Emotional breakup by its nature involves various negative emotional experiences such as loss of self-esteem, feelings of worthlessness, anger, regret, and sometimes guilt and shame." Include citations to support this statement, providing evidence from existing literature on the emotional impact of breakups.

"According to studies, a significant proportion of adolescents and young adults experience at least one romantic attachment during their adolescence and more than half of them experience emotional breakups." Provide specific studies or statistical data to substantiate this claim.

"Affective Capital refers to a state of vitality, energy, and experiencing joy and positive emotions such as a sense of competence and satisfaction consisting of three dimensions: feeling energetic, positive emotion, and happiness." This definition would benefit from a reference to the original source of the concept of Affective Capital.

"Forty-eight adolescent girls, 16 in each group, were purposefully selected based on inclusion criteria and then randomly assigned to three groups by simple random sampling (lottery)." It would be helpful to describe the inclusion and exclusion criteria in more detail.

"Its construct validity was confirmed through exploratory factor analysis with varimax rotation, divergent validity through negative correlations with stress and burnout, and convergent validity through positive correlations with vitality and health resilience." Include the specific statistical values or results from these validation processes to provide more detailed evidence of the measure's validity.

"For example, Beck et al. reported a test-retest reliability of .93 over one week (Beck et al. 1996)." It would be beneficial to include additional reliability and validity data from more recent studies or meta-analyses to reinforce the robustness of the measure.

"This therapy is designed to help individuals understand and transform their inner conflicts, improve emotional resilience, and foster healthier relational dynamics." Provide specific details about the techniques used in Imago therapy sessions to give readers a clearer understanding of the intervention.

"This intervention helps individuals reframe negative thoughts, manage emotions, and develop coping strategies." Include examples of specific cognitive-behavioral techniques used in the therapy to illustrate how the intervention is applied.

"Means and standard deviations were calculated, followed by covariance analysis and Bonferroni post-hoc test." Explain why these specific statistical methods were chosen and how they are appropriate for analyzing the data.

"Before performing the covariance analysis, the results of the Shapiro-Wilk test for affective capital and depression indicated that the distribution of these two variables was normal ($p \leq .05$)." Include the specific p-values obtained from the Shapiro-Wilk test to support this statement.

Authors revised and uploaded the document.

1.2. Reviewer 2

Reviewer:

The statistical population consisted of adolescent girls who experienced emotional breakups in Isfahan in the winter of 2022..." It would be beneficial to specify the age range of the participants to provide more context on the sample demographics.

"Adolescence is a period filled with both positive and negative ups and downs." This sentence is vague. Consider specifying some of the key positive and negative aspects of adolescence to provide a clearer picture.

"The results showed that both interventions were effective in enhancing affective capital and reducing depression in adolescent girls." Provide a more detailed discussion of the effect sizes observed for each intervention to give readers a sense of the practical significance of the findings.

"The effectiveness of Imago therapy for emotional breakup in enhancing affective capital and reducing depression in this study aligns with the findings of Nasershariati (2022)..." Briefly summarize the key findings of Nasershariati (2022) and other cited studies to provide context for how the current study's results align with existing literature.

"The cycle of negative cognitive and behavioral events following an emotional breakup, coupled with memories of the failed relationship, leaves little room for positive emotions and vitality, thus reducing affective capital and increasing depression." Include citations to support this explanation of the cognitive-behavioral model of depression following emotional breakups.

Authors revised and uploaded the document.

2.   Revised

Editor's decision after revisions: Accepted.
Editor in Chief's decision: Accepted.