

Article history: Received 25 May 2024 Revised 07 August 2024 Accepted 17 August 2024 Published online 01 October 2024

Journal of Assessment and Research in Applied Counseling

Open peer-review report



E-ISSN: 3041-8518

Identifying the Sociological Dimensions of Emotional Divorce and Typology of its Types in Tehran

Hamzeh. Salemi¹, Sahla. Kazemipour Sabet^{2*}, Parvin. Savadian³

* Corresponding author email address: skazemipour@gmail.com

Editor	Reviewers
Ali Zadeh Mohamadi	Reviewer 1: Mohammad Hassan Ghanifar ©
Associate Professor, Department of	Assistant Professor, Department of Psychology, Birjand Branch, Islamic Azad
Family Psychology, Family	University, Birjand, Iran. Email: ghanifar@iaubir.ac.ir
Research Institute, Shahid Beheshti	Reviewer 2: Abotaleb Saadati shamir
University, Tehran, Iran	Assistant Professor, Department of Educational Sciences, University of Science and
dr_zadeh@sbu.ac.ir	Research, Tehran, Iran. Email: psychology@iau.ac.ir

1. Round 1

1.1. Reviewer 1

Reviewer:

The statement "the family is recognized as the primary institution of education" lacks citation. Please provide a reference to support this claim, as it is a critical foundational argument in your paper.

The phrase "the sample size was determined by theoretical saturation" is crucial, but the process of achieving saturation is not detailed. Please expand on how saturation was assessed and at what point in the study it was determined.

The statement "data collection was conducted through semi-structured interviews" should be clarified. It would be helpful to mention the average duration of these interviews and the specific themes explored during them.

The axial coding results presented in Table 1 are informative but could benefit from a visual model to illustrate the relationships between the identified categories and codes. Consider adding a conceptual framework or diagram.

The comparison with Golmohammadi and Alimardani's research is insightful but lacks depth. Please provide more detail on how the findings of both studies align or diverge, particularly regarding the sociological implications of emotional divorce.

¹ Sociology PhD Student Studying Iran's Social Issues, Department of Sociology, Science and Research Branch, Islamic Azad University, Tehran, Iran

² Associate Professor, Department of Sociology, Faculty of Social Sciences, University of Tehran, Iran

³ Assistant Professor, Department of Social Sciences, Faculty of Literature, Humanities and Social Sciences, Science and Research Branch, Islamic Azad University, Tehran, Iran



You mentioned that the study is limited to Tehran. To strengthen the discussion, it would be beneficial to hypothesize how cultural and social differences might affect the generalizability of your findings to other regions in Iran or other countries.

The process of "selective coding" is mentioned but not elaborated upon. Please provide more details on how the selective coding was conducted and how it contributed to the final themes.

The conclusion that "appropriate training in communication and emotional management skills can significantly reduce the likelihood of emotional divorce" is strong but speculative. Please provide references or evidence from other studies to support this claim.

The discussion would benefit from a more critical analysis of how your findings compare with those of other key studies on emotional divorce, especially any that contradict or challenge your findings.

Authors revised and uploaded the document.

1.2. Reviewer 2

Reviewer:

The sentence "interaction is a necessary condition for the existence of groups especially family groups which have strong connections and emotional elements" is a broad statement. Consider narrowing it down or supporting it with specific sociological theories or studies.

While the table is clear, it would be useful to explain how the initial codes were derived from the data, particularly the rationale behind categorizing them under specific axial codes.

The rationale for using semi-structured interviews is provided, but the choice of specific interview questions is not. Please discuss how these questions were developed and their relevance to the study's aims.

The identification of 55 semantic codes is a significant finding. However, consider discussing the most recurrent or dominant codes in the main text to give the reader a sense of the most critical aspects of emotional divorce.

The paper suggests practical implications for family counselors and policymakers. However, the specific strategies or interventions derived from the study's findings are not detailed. It would be beneficial to provide concrete examples.

The method of ensuring the reliability of coding by re-coding interviews after a 15-day interval is mentioned, but the outcome of this reliability check is not provided. Consider including inter-rater reliability statistics or a discussion of the consistency observed.

The statement "emotional divorce is a complex and multifaceted phenomenon" is central to the paper's argument. Consider revisiting the discussion to ensure that all identified dimensions and types of emotional divorce are adequately explored and contextualized.

Authors revised and uploaded the document.

2. Revised

Editor's decision after revisions: Accepted. Editor in Chief's decision: Accepted.

