




Evaluation of Students' Counseling Needs: A Quantitative Analysis




Fatemeh. Ahmadi Dehrashid¹, Jamal. Salimi^{2*}, Omid. Isanejad³

¹ Ph.D student Higher Education Development Planning, Department of Educational Sciences, Faculty of Humanities and Social Sciences, University of Kurdistan, Kurdistan, Iran

² Associate Professor, Department of Educational Sciences, Faculty of Humanities and Social Sciences, University of Kurdistan, Kurdistan, Iran

³ Associate Professor, Department of Counseling, Faculty of Humanities and Social Sciences, University of Kurdistan, Kurdistan, Iran

* Corresponding author email address: J.Salimi@uok.ac.ir

Editor	Reviewers
Sadegh Yoosefee ¹  Associate Professor of Neuroscience Department of Neurology, School of Medicine Neuroscience Research Center Qom University of Medical Sciences, Qom, Iran syoosefee@muq.ac.ir	Reviewer 1: Faranak Najjari ¹  Department of Psychology, Saveh Branch, Islamic Azad University, Saveh, Iran. Email: fnajjari@iau-saveh.ac.ir Reviewer 2: Hooman Namvar ¹  Assistant Professor, Department of Psychology, Saveh Branch, Islamic Azad University, Saveh, Iran. Email: hnamvar@iau-saveh.ac.ir

1. Round 1

1.1. Reviewer 1

Reviewer:

The statement "Addressing these problems is crucial for students and failing to control them leads to a decline in academic performance and educational achievement" is well-founded but could benefit from a specific reference or data that supports the claim regarding the impact of unresolved problems on academic performance. Including such evidence will strengthen the argument.

The choice of databases (Google Scholar, Jihad Daneshgahi website, etc.) is appropriate, but it would be beneficial to mention if any language or publication year restrictions were applied during the search process. Additionally, consider explaining why these specific databases were chosen.

The table categorizes counseling needs domains but does not provide sufficient context on how these domains were defined or why these particular categories were chosen. Including a brief justification for the selection of these domains would enhance the reader's understanding.

While effect sizes are provided, the interpretation of these effect sizes is somewhat lacking. For instance, the discussion could be enriched by comparing the effect sizes to those found in other studies or explaining what these effect sizes imply about the significance of the counseling needs in a practical context.

The authors successfully test multiple hypotheses but could improve the clarity of their findings by explicitly stating whether each hypothesis was supported or rejected in the text rather than only implying this through the reported effect sizes.

Authors revised and uploaded the document.

1.2. Reviewer 2

Reviewer:

The sentence "Students face many academic, developmental, behavioral, emotional, familial, social, and occupational problems after entering university and during their studies" is comprehensive but somewhat redundant. Consider merging this with the previous paragraph or streamlining it to avoid repetition.

The authors mention using "meta-analysis with an exploratory process" but do not clarify how the exploratory process was implemented. It would be beneficial to provide more detail on what this process entailed, including any specific criteria or approaches used during the exploratory phase.

The article states that "The systematic review method has been used" but lacks a clear explanation of how studies were selected beyond the mention of thematic relevance. Please clarify the inclusion and exclusion criteria, such as study design, population, or statistical methods, to allow for better reproducibility.

The sentence "These findings are consistent with studies such as Cohen et al. (2022), Setyawati et al. (2022), Shabani et al. (2022), and Moshtaghi and Kazemian Moghadam (2018)" is useful, but it would be more informative to include a brief summary of how these studies' findings align with or differ from the current study's results.

The authors discuss the importance of occupational needs but could enhance this section by providing more specific examples or case studies that illustrate how addressing these needs impacts students' career outcomes or satisfaction.

The paragraph on emotional and psychological needs would benefit from a more in-depth exploration of how these needs vary between different student demographics, such as by gender, socioeconomic status, or field of study, which would add nuance to the analysis.

Authors revised and uploaded the document.

2. Revised

Editor's decision after revisions: Accepted.

Editor in Chief's decision: Accepted.