

Article history: Received 16 August 2024 Revised 02 November 2024 Accepted 08 November 2024 Published online 14 November 2024

Journal of Assessment and Research in Applied Counseling

Open peer-review report



E-ISSN: 3041-8518

Comparison of the Effectiveness of Mentalization-Based Therapy and Unified Transdiagnostic Treatment on the Sexual Schemas of Religiously Committed Women Who Have Experienced Infidelity

Afsaneh. Bengari 10, Emad. Yousefi2*0, Leila. Khajehpour 30

Department of Counseling, Qeshm Branch, Islamic Azad University, Qeshm, Iran
 Assistant Professor, Department of Psychology, Qeshm Branch, Islamic Azad University, Qeshm, Iran
 Assistant Professor, Department of Educational Science and Psychology, Qeshm Branch, Islamic Azad University, Qeshm, Iran

* Corresponding author email address: emad.yousefi30@gmail.com

Editor	Reviewers
José Aparecido Da Silva Full Professor, Department of Psychology, University of Sao Paulo, Ribeirao Preto, Sao Paulo, Brazil jadsilva@ffclrp.usp.br	Reviewer 1: Taher Tizdast Assistant Professor, Department of Psychology, Tonekabon Branch, Islamic Azad University, Tonekabon, Iran. Email: taher.tizdast@toniau.ac.ir Reviewer 2: Meysam Sadeghi Assistant Professor of Department of Cognitive Psychology, Higher Education Institute of Cognitive Sciences, Tehran, Iran. Email: m.sadeghi@icss.ac.ir

1. Round 1

1.1. Reviewer 1

Reviewer:

The opening sentence, "The family is one of the most important social and collective structures..." lacks specificity. Consider adding recent statistical data or evidence from literature to substantiate the claim about the importance of family stability.

The explanation of "sexual schemas" can be further clarified. Consider breaking down complex terms for readability and linking them explicitly to the context of the study.

In the description of "positive and negative dimensions of sexual schemas," the term "shy-cautious schemas" could be elaborated with examples or psychological interpretations to make the impact clearer.

The sessions for Mentalization-Based Therapy and Unified Transdiagnostic Treatment are well-detailed, but it would be beneficial to clarify how therapists ensured consistency and controlled external variables during these interventions.

The results table would be clearer if the pre-test and post-test means were followed by a brief explanation of trends observed before moving on to the statistical analysis.

The argument about the necessity of schema-focused therapies is compelling. Consider adding a specific recommendation of which schema-focused approaches might be suitable alternatives.

Authors revised and uploaded the document.

1.2. Reviewer 2

Reviewer:

The sentence, "Women are the main pillar of the family in society, and their physical and mental health..." could benefit from a reference to empirical research to strengthen the assertion about women's role in family health.

The statement, "The World Health Organization (WHO) has identified women's health as an indicator of a country's development" needs a direct citation from WHO to improve credibility and avoid any risk of misrepresentation.

The phrase, "Infidelity can cause severe emotional trauma for spouses" should be expanded by specifying the scope or intensity of trauma using clinical evidence or case study references.

The research gap and objectives are not clearly highlighted. The sentence, "Various treatments and interventions have been used to improve the marital life of individuals..." should be followed by a clear articulation of the novelty and contribution of the current research.

The method section states, "Participants were selected through convenience sampling..." This choice needs justification. Explain why this sampling method was appropriate for the study and discuss any potential biases it introduces.

Provide more demographic details about the sample population. For instance, specifying the participants' age range or socio-economic background would add context and relevance.

Results - Statistical Significance: The phrase, "The F value for all three schemas is greater than 0.05 (p > .05)" should be supplemented with a discussion of why these results may have lacked significance and the implications for future research.

The discussion mentions, "neither therapeutic approach had a significant impact..." Elaborate on why these approaches may have failed, possibly by integrating more recent critiques or limitations of MBT and UTT in this context.

Authors revised and uploaded the document.

2. Revised

Editor's decision after revisions: Accepted. Editor in Chief's decision: Accepted.

