

Article history: Received 01 November 2023 Accepted 17 December 2023 Published online 20 December 2023

# Journal of Assessment and Research in Applied Counseling

Open peer-review report



# Comparison of Mental Hardiness Between Athletes in Individual and Team Sports of the CISM of the I.R.I.

Amir. Abasgholipour<sup>1\*</sup>

<sup>1</sup> Assistant Professor, Department of Behavioral and Cognitive Sciences, Faculty of Sports Sciences, University of Tehran, Tehran, Iran

### \* Corresponding author email address: a.abasqolipour@ut.ac.ir

Editor	R e v i e w e r s
Mansoor Soudani	Reviewer 1: Fatemeh Behjati Ardakani
Professor, Department of	Assistant Professor of Department of Counseling, Faculty of Humanities & amp;
counseling, Shahid Chamran	Social Sciences, Ardakan University, Ardakan, Iran. behjati@ardakan.ac.ir
University of Ahvaz, Ahvaz, Iran.	Reviewer 2: Zahra Yousefi
sodani_m@scu.ac.ir	Assistant Professor, Department of Psychology, Isfahan Branch (Khorasgan), Islamic
	Azad University, Isfahan, Iran. Email: Z.yousefi1393@khuisf.ac.ir

## 1. Round 1

#### 1.1. Reviewer 1

#### Reviewer:

The sentence "Team sport athletes scored significantly higher in levels of mental skills" is vague. Please clarify what specific mental skills were measured and whether these findings were from the current study or cited literature.

The validation of the SMHQ is mentioned with respect to previous studies. However, the context of its validation in the Iranian population is not fully elaborated. Please provide more details on how the tool was adapted and validated for this specific population.

The table presents standard deviations but does not provide confidence intervals for the mean values. Including confidence intervals would help in understanding the precision of the estimates.

While the ANOVA results are reported with F-values and p-values, the effect sizes (e.g., eta-squared) are not provided. Including effect sizes would give a clearer picture of the magnitude of differences observed.

The sentence "Taekwondo and volleyball athletes exhibited higher mental hardiness" should explore possible reasons beyond the combative nature of taekwondo. Consider discussing other factors like team dynamics or training intensity.

The conclusion mentions that "mental hardiness is largely developable and growable." Please provide evidence or references that support this assertion, especially within the context of sports psychology.



Authors revised the manuscript and uploaded the document.

1.2. Reviewer 2

Reviewer:

The statement "Burnout and stress can result from overtraining, low self-esteem, and a lack of mental hardiness" needs supporting references. Additionally, more explanation is required on how these factors specifically impact mental hardiness.

The sample size of 40 participants is relatively small for generalizability. Please discuss the potential limitations this poses on the study's findings and consider providing justification or statistical power analysis.

It is mentioned that "the SMHQ is the only specific tool for measuring mental hardiness in sports." This statement could be misleading. Consider revising this to "one of the specific tools" unless you can provide evidence supporting the exclusivity claim.

The reference to "different questionnaires used" is made when comparing study results. It would be beneficial to provide a brief comparison of the key differences between the 48-item MHQ48 and the 14-item SMHQ to substantiate this claim.

The application of the personal construct theory is interesting but lacks depth. Please elaborate on how this theory specifically applies to the different mental hardiness levels found across sports types in this study.

The post-hoc comparisons identified significant differences among sports, but there is no discussion on the practical significance of these findings. Consider including a discussion on the practical implications of these statistical differences.

Authors revised the manuscript and uploaded the document.

#### 2. Revised

Editor's decision after revisions: Accepted. Editor in Chief's decision: Accepted.

