

Determining the Effectiveness of Zen Technique on Psychological Well-being and Pain in Elderly Residents of Kahrizak Nursing Home




Seyedeh Robabeh. Riazi¹, Fatemeh. Golshani^{2*}, Anita. Baghdasarians³, Marjan. Jafari Roshan²

¹ PhD Student, Department of Psychology, Central Tehran Branch, Islamic Azad University, Tehran, Iran

² Assistant Professor, Department of Psychology, Central Tehran Branch, Islamic Azad University, Tehran, Iran

³ Associate Professor, Department of Psychology, Central Tehran Branch, Islamic Azad University, Tehran, Iran

* Corresponding author email address: fa_golshan@yahoo.com

E d i t o r	R e v i e w e r s
Chara A Demetriou  Department of Psychology, University of Nicosia, Nicosia, Cyprus demetriou.cha@unic.ac.cy	Reviewer 1: Ali Akbar Soleymanian  Associate Professor of Counseling Department, Bojnord University, Iran. Email: Soleymanian@ub.ac.ir Reviewer 2: Mohammad Masoud Dayarian  Assistant Professor, Department of Counseling, Khomeinishahr Branch, Islamic Azad University.Komeinishar/Isfahan,Iran. dayariyan@iaukhsh.ac.ir

1. Round 1

1.1. Reviewer 1

Reviewer:

The sentence "Elderly individuals who maintain physical and mental activity can not only preserve their abilities but even improve their skills..." lacks references. Including specific studies or data supporting this claim would strengthen the argument.

Include details on why the McGill Pain Questionnaire was chosen over other pain scales, considering the elderly population's unique needs.

The data for the control group show an unexpected increase in psychological well-being scores during follow-up. Discuss potential explanations for this anomaly.

While ANOVA results are summarized well, the explanation of eta-squared values (e.g., 28%) could benefit from an interpretation of its practical significance.

In Table 4, explain why the psychological well-being difference (15 points) between groups is statistically significant but not clinically significant.

Authors revised and uploaded the document.

1.2. Reviewer 2

Reviewer:

The section on meditation's benefits is too general. Specific evidence, such as effect sizes or population details from previous studies, would add depth.

The description of the sampling process is vague. Clarify whether stratified random sampling was employed to balance gender and age distribution in experimental and control groups.

The intervention protocol is detailed but lacks justification for the session duration (100 minutes). Adding references or rationale for choosing this duration would enhance credibility.

For the Ryff questionnaire, the text states reliability coefficients but does not discuss cultural adaptations or validation for Iranian elderly. Clarify if and how the tool was culturally adapted.

The sentence "Meditation's effects are frequently reported enthusiastically by the media..." introduces bias concerns. Clarify whether this refers to the study or the broader field.

The lack of significant effects on pain is not well-addressed. Provide hypotheses or mechanisms to explain why Zen meditation was ineffective for pain management.

The claim that meditation helps with "executive functions" is not supported by this study. Avoid overgeneralizing findings unless supported by data.

Authors revised and uploaded the document.

2. Revised

Editor's decision after revisions: Accepted.

Editor in Chief's decision: Accepted.