Meta-Analysis of the Effectiveness of Various Play Therapy Types on Behavioral Symptoms of Children with Attention Deficit/Hyperactivity Disorder

Azam. Baktashian [1], Mansure. Shahriari [2]*, Masoud. Ghasemi [2]

[1] PhD Student, Department of Psychology and Exceptional Children, Central Tehran Branch, Islamic Azad University, Tehran, Iran
[2] Assistant Professor, Department of Psychology, Central Tehran Branch, Islamic Azad University, Tehran, Iran

* Corresponding author email address: mansure_shahriari@yahoo.com

E d i t o r	R e v i e w e r s
José Aparecido Da Silva Full Professor, Department of Psychology, University of Sao Paulo, Ribeirao Preto, Sao Paulo, Brazil jadsilva@ffclrp.usp.br	**Reviewer 1:** Meysam Sadeghi Assistant Professor of Department of Cognitive Psychology, Higher Education Institute of Cognitive Sciences, Tehran, Iran. Email: m.sadeghi@icss.ac.ir **Reviewer 2:** Mohsen Golparvar Professor, Department of Psychology, Isfahan (Khorasgan) Branch, Islamic Azad University, Isfahan, Iran. mgolparvar@khuisf.ac.ir

1. Round 1

1.1. Reviewer 1

Reviewer:

The introduction mentions various treatment methods but does not sufficiently link them to the rationale for selecting play therapy. Strengthen the connection by discussing why play therapy offers unique advantages over other methods.

The explanation of "theoretical sampling" needs more detail. Elaborate on how this approach ensured the inclusion of representative studies.

The methodology for calculating Content Validity Ratio (CVR) is mentioned briefly. Add a detailed explanation of the process to enhance transparency.

The discussion mentions consistency with prior studies but lacks critical analysis. Discuss discrepancies or unique contributions of the current findings in depth.

The limitation regarding "access to specific research databases" is vague. Specify which databases were inaccessible and how this might affect the study's comprehensiveness.

Authors revised and uploaded the document.

1.2.   Reviewer 2

Reviewer:

The definition of ADHD (DSM-5-TR criteria) could benefit from a clearer focus on its relevance to behavioral symptoms targeted by play therapy. Reframe this section to align with the study's objectives.

While the inconsistencies in prior findings are noted, the research gap could be better articulated. Explain what specific aspect of play therapy's effectiveness remains unclear.

The decision to include only Persian studies could introduce cultural bias. Provide justification for excluding non-Persian research or discuss its limitations explicitly.

The reporting of p-values and t-values lacks context. Include examples of how these values support the significance of the findings for specific play therapy types.

While the categorization of effect sizes is informative, its connection to real-world application is unclear. Provide examples of how "high effect size" components could influence intervention strategies.

The practical implications of using play therapy to reduce ADHD symptoms need further elaboration. Suggest specific recommendations for therapists or policymakers.

Given the focus on Persian studies, discuss how cultural factors might influence the effectiveness of play therapy and the generalizability of the findings.

Authors revised and uploaded the document.

2.   Revised

Editor's decision after revisions: Accepted.
Editor in Chief's decision: Accepted.