




Determining the Effectiveness of an Educational Program Derived from a Validated Model of Academic Engagement on Academic Perfectionism among High School Students in Hamadan

Soraya. Vahid¹, Ahmad Ali. Jadidian^{2*}, Davood. Jafari³


¹ PhD Student, Department of Psychology, Sanandaj Branch, Islamic Azad University, Sanandaj, Iran

² Assistant Professor, Department of Psychology, Kangavar Branch, Islamic Azad University, Kangavar, Iran



³ Assistant Professor, Department of Psychology, Malayer Branch, Islamic Azad University, Malayer, Iran

* Corresponding author email address: ahjadidi53@gmail.com

Editor

Abolfazl Karami¹
Associate Professor, Department of
Psychology, Allameh Tabataba'i
University, Tehran, Iran
abolfazlkarami1@gmail.com

Reviewers

Reviewer 1: Faranak Saboonchi¹
Assistant Professor, Department of Psychology, Payam Noor University, Tehran,
Iran. Email: faranaksaboonchi@pnu.ac.ir
Reviewer 2: Maasuomeh Behboodi¹
Assistant Professor, Counseling Department, Roudehen Branch, Islamic Azad
University, Roudehen, Iran. Email: masomehbehbodi@riau.ac.ir

1. Round 1

1.1. Reviewer 1

Reviewer:

Comment: The introduction lacks a clear definition of "academic engagement." Including a concise definition early in the introduction would provide better context for readers unfamiliar with the term.

Quote: "Studies show that academic engagement has the direct and indirect ability to improve perfectionism..."

Comment: The study design section should elaborate on why a quasi-experimental design was chosen over other experimental designs. This would help justify the methodology.

Quote: "The present study was a quasi-experimental research with a pre-test and post-test design."

Comment: The multi-stage cluster random sampling method is briefly mentioned but not described in detail. Provide a step-by-step explanation of how this sampling method was implemented.

Quote: "...selected through multi-stage cluster random sampling..."

Comment: The reliability and validity of the Positive and Negative Perfectionism Scale should be more thoroughly discussed, including the context in which it has been previously validated.

Quote: "Perfectionism was measured using the Positive and Negative Perfectionism Scale by Short et al. (1995)."

Comment: The description of the educational program should include more specific examples of the activities or exercises used in each session.

Quote: "The design of the educational package below was based on the literature for academic engagement..."

Comment: Clarify the nature of the "placebo" intervention provided to the control group to ensure that it was an appropriate comparison.

Quote: "...and placed into two groups of 20 each for experimental and control (placebo) groups..."

Comment: Explain why Analysis of Covariance (ANCOVA) was chosen as the statistical method and how it specifically accounts for potential confounding variables.

Quote: "Data analysis was conducted using Analysis of Covariance (ANCOVA) through SPSS version 25."

Comment: The descriptive statistics table should include confidence intervals for the mean scores to provide a clearer understanding of the variability.

Quote: "Table 2 presents the descriptive statistics (mean and standard deviation)..."

Authors uploaded the revised manuscript.

1.2. Reviewer 2

Reviewer:

Comment: The literature review does not sufficiently differentiate between the constructs of positive and negative perfectionism. Consider adding more detailed explanations and examples of each.

Quote: "...perfectionistic strivings lead to the enhancement of self-esteem conscientiousness extraversion social adaptability and positive feelings in students..."

Comment: There is no discussion on how the sample size of 40 students was determined to be sufficient. Include a power analysis or justification based on previous similar studies.

Quote: "The research sample included 40 of these students selected through multi-stage cluster random sampling..."

Comment: The ANCOVA results should be accompanied by assumptions testing (e.g., homogeneity of variances) to ensure the robustness of the analysis.

Quote: "Table 3 below summarizes the ANCOVA test for the variables..."

Comment: The reported effect sizes (eta squared) should be interpreted with respect to conventional benchmarks (e.g., small, medium, large) to give readers a better understanding of their magnitude.

Quote: "the effect size or eta coefficient is 0.580 meaning that 58% of the variance..."

Authors uploaded the revised manuscript.

2. Revised

Editor's decision after revisions: Accepted.

Editor in Chief's decision: Accepted.